



Education Policy Unit; Wozani Block; WM11; School of Education; 27 St. Andrews Road, Parktown 2193 [or](#)

Private Bag 3 Wits 2050. Johannesburg, South Africa

Tel: +27 11 717 3706; Fax: +27 11 717 3029

A Review of the Gauteng Master Skills Plan

**Undertaken by the Education Policy Unit of the University of Witwatersrand
for the Gauteng Provincial Government Office of the Premier**

Compiled by: P. Lolwana; G.Rossiter & V. Dieltiens

June 2012

Table of Contents

1	Executive Summary.....	4
2	Introduction	6
3	Background to the Gauteng Master Skills Plan.....	8
4	Statement of the Problem and Terms of Reference.....	11
4.1	Methodology.....	11
4.2	Significance of the study	12
4.3	Limitations.....	13
5	Findings	14
5.1	Analysis of the GMSP document.....	14
5.2	The GMSP implementation.....	15
5.2.1	The Role of GCRA	15
5.2.2	Career Education and Guidance	16
5.2.3	Driving a City Region Skills Plan with Multiple Agencies accounting to different tiers of government.....	16
5.3	Literature review.....	17
6	Legislative Framework and Institutional arrangements	21
6.1.	Policy Choices we have made	21
7	The Ithutlere Tiro case study	25
7.1	A narrative.....	25
7.2	Learning Lessons	26
7.3	Ithutlere Tiro programme in the context of GMSP.....	28
8	Discussion and recommendations	32
8.1	The absence of a storyline in the Gauteng Master Skills Plan	32
8.2	Constant planning and coordination by government.....	33
8.3	Government must leverage its power	33
8.4	Exploit linkages across policy fields and legislative frameworks	34

8.5	Strengthen institutions of learning	35
8.6	The skills development and deployment for the unemployed youth	37
8.7	Basic Education and Skills development	39
9	Conclusion.....	40
10	References	42
11	ANNEXURES.....	44
11.1	Annexure 1.....	44
11.2	Annexure 2:.....	66
11.3	Annexure 3: Key Informant Interviews	70

Acronyms

AIDC	Automotive Industry Development Corporation
CHET	Centre for Higher Education Transformation
DED	Department of Economic Development
DHET	Department of Higher Education and Training
DID	Department of Infrastructure Development
DIT	Department of Trade and Industry
DOL	Department of Labour
ESDA	Employment and Skills Development Agency
ETQAs	Education and Training Authorities
FETs	Further Education and Training
GCRA	Gauteng City of Education
GDE	Gauteng Department of Education
GDLG&H	Gauteng Department of Local Government and Housing
GHRDS	Gauteng Human Resources Development Strategy
GMSP	Gauteng Master Skills Plan
GPG	Gauteng Provincial Government
HRD	Human Resources Development
ICT	Information and Communication Technology
IDC	Industrial Development Corporation
IPAP	Industrial Policy Action Plan
LEED	Local Economics and Employment Development
MAIN	Mackay Area Industry Network
MBCI	Mississippi Band of Choctaw Indians
MICT	Media Information Communication Seta
NCV	National Certificate Vocational
NEET	Not in Employment, in Education and Training
NPG	New Growth Path
NQF	National Qualifications Framework
NRF	National Research Foundation
NSDA	National Skills Development Strategy
NYDA	National Youth Development Agency
OECD	Organisation for Economic Co-Operation
SAQA	South African Qualifications Authorities
SETAs	Sector Education and Training
USD	United State Dollar

1 Executive Summary

This project was commissioned by the Gauteng Provincial Government to the Education Policy Unit of the Witwatersrand to evaluate its Gauteng Master Skills Plan (GMSP). . The Master Skills plan is one of the key programmes selected by government to review to mark the midpoint of the current government's term of office. The review is intended to contribute to improving the implementation of government's programme to the end of the current term of office in 2014, and provide the basis for public communication of government's achievements in implementing its mandate.

In undertaking this evaluation, the researchers from the Education Policy Unit, reviewed the Gauteng Master Skills Plan; scanned the literature on skills development; reviewed the legislative framework on skills development; interviewed key individuals in the management of the GMSP; reviewed the Ithutlere Tiro project as the flagship and anchor programme for the GMSP.

The review of the GMSP comes at a time when issues about unemployment, poverty, economic development and national cohesion have captured the minds of the nation. Skills development is therefore central to all of these debates and this review will help the province to position itself...

The researchers wish to bring to the attention of the GPG the following findings:

- The GMSP needs to be revised. It is not focused, does not prioritise what needs to be done. It is a very ambitious plan that tends to veer towards information about the province as well as forecasting. It is actually not a plan, nor does it provide a vision for the province;
- The implementation of the GMSP has been severely hampered by its unwieldiness; the actual role, capacity and expertise of its main implementing agency, GCRA; and the difficulties of driving a skills plan through multiple agencies and a myriad of legislative frameworks.
- The Ithutlere Tiro project has been too disconnected from the GMSP to regard it as a case study of the GMSP. With regards to the four pillars of the GMSP, it was found that the Ithutlere Tiro project did not speak to any of these pillars but was a standalone project.

We therefore recommend the following with regards to the GMSP:

- That it must be revised in order to provide a vision and a storyline that should inspire all those who will be working with it in the future. Some guidance is given in the report on how this could be done;
- That a plan should not be seen as a destination but a start of a journey. There is constant planning and coordination that is intimated in the process of building a skills development function as this function does not get developed by just having a plan but built over time.
- Noting the difficulty that GPG experienced in tagging their skills development plans on major projects in the province, like the Gautrain, we recommend that GPG must start leveraging its power and make demands on training in contracts it issues out;

- We further suggest that GPG must exploit linkages across fields and legislative frameworks. However, this requires sophistication on the part of implementers as the complexity of the policies and legislative frameworks that prevail can overwhelm;
- In the report, we single out the importance of institutions for learning or training, including workplace learning. Strengthening these institutions should be given special attention as this is a very important building block for any skills plan, without which there is no plan.
- Lastly we bring to the attention of GPG the plight of young people and the challenges they face in the development and deployment of skills. Without dictating to the province, we suggest that this issue be considered as one of the priorities when a skills plan is revised and prioritised.

In conclusion, we argue that an effective skills plan will require extensive human and financial resources. There is a lot of expertise needed to make a skills plan a reality as well as substantive funding. We suggest that if GCRA is going to be the agency that carries the mandate of a skills plan forward, first there must be a separation of the provision of education in general from the skills development function. Secondly, the implementing agency must see itself as the repository of all the information related to this function, which should be reviewed and analysed frequently for lessons to be learned and building the GPG's skills plan. Thirdly, GCRA must be resourced accordingly with funds and expertise. Lastly, we thank the province for having given us the opportunity to do this work and thus give us a peek into the hard and complex work the province in which we live is grappling with. We come out with a better appreciation of the difficulties faced by government in the province.

2 Introduction

According to the OECD report (2012), skills have become the global currency of the 21st century. Without proper investment in skills, people languish on the margins of society, technological progress does not translate into economic growth, and countries cannot compete in an increasingly knowledge-based global society. Thus it has become important that governments at all levels take seriously the function of skills planning and investments. Investing in the right skills requires a strategic approach - which is easier said than done.

Towards the end of 2011, the Gauteng Provincial Government (GPG) requested the Education Policy Unit (EPU) of the University of Witwatersrand to review its Gauteng Master Skills Plan (GMSP).

The GMSP was commissioned for development in 2009 by the Provincial Government. The goals of this plan were to:

- Provide an overview of the skills gap in Gauteng;
- Give a clear socio-economic picture of the skills landscape in Gauteng;
- Forecast the required skills for employment creation and economic growth in the period up to 2015;
- Respond to the skills needs as outlined by various policies and initiatives in the province through a Master Skills Plan for the province; and unify and coordinate various initiatives for education and skills development through the Gauteng Master Skills Plan (Gauteng Department of Education, 2009).

2012 marks the mid-point for the GMSP in operation and it is therefore appropriate to review how it is working before it can be taken forward for the remaining period (2012-2015).

The Minister of Performance Monitoring, Evaluation and Administration, Collins Chabane comments on the importance of reviewing the work of government:

If we are to improve performance we have to reflect on what we are doing, what we are achieving against what we set out to achieve, and why deviations are occurring, or unexpected results occurring. We cannot advance without making mistakes on the way, but we must evaluate and learn from our successes and our mistakes. Without this we cannot improve (The Presidency, 2011, p.ii).

In addition, the significance of evaluating the GMSP can never be underestimated as this comes in the midst of many initiatives in the Human Resource Development arena in the country. For example, there is the Human Resource Development Council that sits in the Deputy President's office; the National Skills Development III; the Green Paper on Post-School Education; the President's Infrastructure Development Project as well as other job-creation initiatives; the Youth Subsidy proposal and many other initiatives and contestations. It will be important for the Gauteng Province to understand the implications of its own plans in the midst of all the above mentioned activities.

The presentation of this report starts with a brief background on the GMSP, which is entirely analysed from the documents presented to us by the GPG. This will be followed by the problem statement, which is largely an explanation of what we were tasked to do in this review as set out in the Terms of Reference. The methodology we used to conduct this review will then be tabled. After this, the significance of this study will be expounded on to ensure that the reader understands why the GMSP is an important document for the Gauteng government. Then the limitations of what could be studied in this review will be outlined.

Findings of our review will be presented under various sections. First there will be a presentation of the analysis of the GMSP. This will be followed by a scant review of literature on how other places carry out and manage the function of skills planning and the results of this comparative analysis will be presented here. The following section will comprise of legislative framework and institutional arrangements, in which a plan like GMSP operates. Then a case study of a project we were specifically asked to look into, will be discussed. Before we conclude, we discuss and present some recommendations about how to take the GMSP forward.

3 Background to the Gauteng Master Skills Plan

The Gauteng Provincial Government (GPG), through the Gauteng City Region Academy (GCRA) commissioned a research study to identify scarce and critical skills in the Gauteng province and to develop a Gauteng Master Skills Plan for the period 2010 to 2015 and beyond.

The Master Skills Plan was to be based on the following four strategic pillars:

The Gauteng Master Skills Plan - Strategic Pillars

Strategic Pillar 1:
Strengthen the Capacity of the Education System in Gauteng

- Enable the links between the sectors in the Skills Value Chain
- Strengthen the capabilities of the GDE to drive the Gauteng Master Skills Plan

Strategic Pillar 2:
Develop targeted interventions for responding to the skills needs of Government in Gauteng

- Develop targeted programmes to respond to government support needs
- Develop key management competencies, knowledge and skills in targeted government departments
- Provide targeted support to local government

Strategic Pillar 3:
Enable the Economic Growth of the Province through education, training and skills development

- Support the Gauteng Economic Growth And Development Strategy Pillars
- Develop strategies to absorb trained people
- Develop skills to enable and support the growth of emerging and priority growth sectors

Strategic Pillar 4:
Partner with sector organisations to respond to the skills needs and provide access to work experience

- Develop a coordinated response with SETAs to the skills needs of Gauteng
- Work closely with FETs and HEIs to address the scarce and critical skills gap
- Partner with the private sector and non-governmental organisations in addressing scarce and critical skills gaps
- Partner with Trade and Professional Bodies

The researchers reviewed key statistics from Stats SA, SETAs, Departments and consulted with stakeholders. A forecast model was developed in line with international best practice. According to the researchers, this model works with key factors in terms of growth, mortality, replacement, migration, emigration, sectoral migration, vertical mobility, labour absorption and retirement. This created a view of the current state and the future state of the province. The core findings mapped the gap between the two and projects specific numbers of people that needed to be trained by occupation, education level and in critical skills areas.

The researchers extensively attended to the impact of various factors on the demand side, such as:

- The context of growth in Gauteng
- A global skills shortage
- Education and Skills as a strategic driver in the province
- The existing skills gap -2010
- Labour supply trends
- Exit levels from the education system
- Responding to the global economy
- Employment multipliers and the risk of jobless growth
- Employment shifts by educational level

On the supply side of skills, the researchers looked into the logical educational interventions that would enhance employability in the province. To this end therefore the researchers interrogated the following information and data sets:

- The institutional environment of education in Gauteng
- Discouraged work seekers
- Unemployment
- Graduate employment
- Migration and migratory patterns
- Education attrition
- Secondary education (Grade 10 and 11) dropouts rates
- Efficiency in matching supply and demand

The picture that emerged after analysing the supply and demand factors provided the researchers with a micro view of the labour market profile; the capacity of the system – now and in the future as well as the quantitative skills gap.

Forty-two (42) “implementation” thrusts that addressed the above focus were then identified, largely under Strategic Pillars 3 and 4 and recommended for implementation by the Gauteng provincial government. A table of the forty two implementation thrusts is presented as **Annexure 1** of the report. The implementing agencies for these forty two thrusts were also as many, ranging from the Gauteng Department of Education (GDE), Gauteng City Region Academy (GCRA); Sector Education and Training Authorities (SETAs)s; Education and Training Authorities (ETQAs); Department of Economic Development; Private Sector; Department of Higher Education and Training (DHET); National Research Foundation (NRF); Department of Public Works; Gauteng Enterprise propeller; Gauteng Economic Development; National Youth Development Agency (NYDA);Gauteng Department of Local Government and Housing

(GDLG&H); Planning Commission; all departments; FET Colleges; Higher Education Institutions; Communications Department; Department of Labour (DOL); Gauteng Secondary Schools; Department of Trade and Industry (DTI); and the Industrial Development Corporation (IDC).

One of the main objectives of this exercise was to give impetus to the government's strategy of providing the province with a sustainable pool of economically relevant skills so as to contribute towards the eradication of poverty and unemployment. The GMSP is a cross cutting driver of the Gauteng Employment, Growth and Development Strategy and aims to address the mismatch between skills demand and supply within Gauteng, thus ensuring that a truly inclusive and globally competitive city region is realised.

4 Statement of the Problem and Terms of Reference

As part of the Mid-term review process, the Gauteng province wished to conduct independent reviews and evaluations of some of its key programmes, and the GMSP being one of them. The call for a review was aimed at providing an overview and assessment of the implementation of the Master Skills Plan and related projects and programmes within the province as it relates to the skills needs and the province's economy. The study would explore how this contributes to addressing the skills shortage and mismatch in Gauteng and the extent to which skills development initiatives contribute to improving beneficiaries' access to employment and other opportunities that generate income on a sustainable basis, especially among young people from disadvantaged communities.

To this end, the following specific elements were the focus of this review:

- Assessing documentation related to the Gauteng Master Skills Plan and the Gauteng Employment, Growth and Development Strategy
- Conducting a literature review of similar projects conducted elsewhere and of any related studies conducted on the Master Skills Plan and Gauteng Provincial Government skills projects.
- Review the legislative and institutional arrangements related to skills development, with a particular focus on intergovernmental roles and responsibilities, and its impact on the GMSP.
- Reviewing performance against key indicators and targets as set out in the strategy Implementation Plan Identifying additional relevant key indicators that will be used to assess the success of the Master Skills Plan, and accessing and analysing data to measure performance against these indicators where possible
- Conducting interviews with key relevant stakeholders including SETAs, FETs, Higher Education Institutions, non-governmental organisations, the private sector namely industry and professional bodies, provincial officials, educators and participants to develop an understanding of the process of receiving training to access into the labour market from the strategic planning phase to implementation, outlining the successes and challenges experienced.
- Identifying challenges that inhibit the proper implementation of the Master Skills Plan and developing proposals for corrective action.
- Developing recommendations on an approach to improving the Master Skills Plan in addressing the skills shortage in the province for the future and improving employment levels, especially among youth, based on the above assessment.
- A review of the Ithutlele Tiro programme as a case in point.
- Writing a report presenting this information (approximately 30 pages) and developing a presentation.

The full description of these Terms of Reference appears as **Annexure 2**.

4.1 Methodology

We carried out a number of activities in conducting this review, outlined below:

- a. Analysis of the Gauteng Master Skills document as an anchor document for this study in order to establish performance indicators as well as targets of the GMSP.
- b. Scanning of the literature on skills development in order to understand which comparative studies we would select for this review.
- c. Review of the legislative and institutional arrangements for the skills development in the country.
- d. Review of the Ithutlre Tiro programme
- e. Interview with key stakeholders (**Annexure 3** Is the Invite list for interviews)
- f. Writing of the report

We were also urged to consult the draft National Evaluation Policy framework (<http://www.info.gov.za/view/DownloadFileAction?id=150348>) in order to structure our work, and this we did. Lastly, we engaged with the various current debates and writings on the topic of skills development and unemployment issues in order to enrich our understanding of the pertinent issues.

The information and insights used to develop this review have been gleaned through intensive key informant interviews (12) conducted over three weeks (**Annexure 4**). Those interviewed included a sample of officials from GCRA, SETAs, ESDAs and training providers.

Documents and reports have been used to supplement information given in interviews.

The approach has enabled the research team to glean insights from practitioners and reflect on these in this report. The transcripts of interviews were analysed. Themes and issues are highlighted to illustrate a variety of points or to highlight recurring themes arising from the interviews.

It has not been possible in this review to measure performance against targets for the Gauteng Master Skills Plan. The base document describes general quantitative indicators (e.g. numbers of learners) without any specified targets.

Forty-two outcomes of the Gauteng Master Skills Plan that are relevant to the terms of reference were extracted. Because the indicators for these outcomes were not expressed as targets we are only able to indicate progress against outcomes where there was evidence. We were unable to ascertain progress and measure performance in many of the outcomes. In the words of a key informant, they remain the “wish list” part of the plan.

4.2 Significance of the study

This study signifies a very important mark in the term of the current administration – a Mid-Term. Government considers this an important milestone that is worth reviewing and as the Presidency (2011) notes; this review is about measuring relevance and efficiency. According to the National Evaluation Framework document of the Presidency, the GMSP would be considered an **innovative** programme, from which learnings are needed.

In addition, skills development has become topical in the country. This debate happens at a time when the country is also conscious of the rising income inequalities amongst the population groups, driven by inequality in wages between high and low-skilled workers. Any government that wishes to address the income schism must pay attention to the development of skills in the whole population. Having a plan on how to do so is therefore an important first step in addressing the issue of bridging this divide.

A focus on skills development is also important in growing the economy cake so that it can be possible to absorb an increasing number of the unemployed. The issue of the Not in Employment, in Education and Training (NEET) population has been lamented on in various studies (Cloete, 2009; Altman, 2008; DHET, 2012), and government is aware of how big this problem is getting to be in South Africa. Part of the solution has to be an investment in the development of skills for this population. The GMSP should be helpful in this instance.

Lastly these days, countries are described in terms of their high, medium and low income earning capacity. The income earning capacity depends on many things but the development and deployment of skills seem to be important levers for wealth creation in the high income countries. Low income countries appear to be inevitably dependant on earning their income from primary resources without the ability to add much value to these commodities. A skills development plan should get a country, a province or city going in improving its economy.

4.3 Limitations

This study was commissioned toward the end of December 2011 and the researchers planned to start undertaking the research right from the beginning of the year. The time allocated to this research was very short (2 months) and the days allocated were inadequate (32 days). It was difficult to get hold of government officials who were key in accessing the required information as many came back from holidays much later in the month and appointments were difficult to set within the time constraints. We had to change our work plan many times in the process. When we were able to meet with the officials, it was clear that some were either new in their jobs or have limited or no knowledge of the GMSP.

Apart from the GMSP document and the Ithutlere Tiro case study, we have not been able to lay hands on any other critical documents and information. We could not get guidance or information on key stakeholders who were pertinent to the case study we were supposed to study. The last request to analyse the outcomes of the GMSP against the reports of the province, could not be met because the province could not provide us with the information to analyse. Overall, the collection of data and information was extremely compromised in this study.

5 Findings

In this section we will present the findings under the following topics:

- Analysis of the GMSP document
- The GMSP implementation
- Review of literature
- Legislative Framework and Institutional arrangements for the GMSP
- The Ithutlere Tiro case study

5.1 Analysis of the GMSP document

Our first take of the document was that it was indeed a complicated document. The consultants for this document had taken into consideration all the important elements of a skills plan from both the supply and demand side. They had analysed a complex set of data in order to come out with different scenarios premised on possible growth rates in the province's economy. But this was just that – scenario planning and could never be a basis for planning skills development.

The second part of the document presented a comprehensive list of all outcomes and role players who would have to come on board to realise the GMSP. In our analysis of this document, we came out with forty-two outcomes and a very long list of key role players for the implementation of the GMSP (**see Annexure 1**). This by any standards would have been a very complex undertaking as the authority over many of the stakeholders listed in the GMSP falls outside the jurisdiction of the province.

The GMSP was commissioned in 2009 and completed by the service provider in March 2010. In January 2010 the project was handed over to the research and development directorate of GCRA. According to GCRA, the final product had a number of short-comings in terms of structure and content – which were raised with but not corrected by the service provider. The end product failed to provide any evidence for labour market supply and demand projections that are used.

The flaws in the plan from GCRA perspective are:

- a. The format prescribed by DHET for skills plans was not followed.
- b. The document is not written within the revised policy frameworks of HRD SA II and NSDS III because it preceded these. (Rather it followed the change logic of the GEGDS and its four strategic pillars)
- c. There is a DHET requirement that these plans be reviewed on an annual basis especially the section on scarce skills. This has not been done.

“The Master Skills Plan was the result of many meetings by many small groups of people (from 2008) that was then consolidated into that document. One of the reasons it looks like it does is because (it represents) the semi-consolidated thinking – of a whole bunch of people in different sectors. The GDE was part of that.... What the MSP is saying – when you boil it down – is correct. There's nothing wrong with the message – it's probably just the way it's said that's slightly dysfunctional.”

The seeds of the GMSP lay in the Gauteng Human Resources Development Strategy (GHRDS) which sought to develop human capital in the province to take advantage of the competitive advantage of Gauteng as a province. The GCRA was set up to service this plan. For some time the GMSP was positioned in the Premiers Office, but later shifted to GDE. In 2007/8 resources were made available to promote public awareness and awareness in the schools. This took the form of exhibitions and events at FET colleges, universities and shopping centres.

There has been a “heavy focus” in the GDE since 2008/9 on getting schooling right. However post-school education and preparing school-leavers for the world of work is one of the four priorities (2009) of the current MEC.

“Giving substance to this has been difficult.”

For the first time at the end of 2011, directorates were requested to review macro-plans and operational plans to ensure they fall in line with the GMSP and the four strategic pillars.

“The GMSP came as a package with due dates. These were unrealistic. If you look at (a sector like) the “green economy” – because we are dealing with young people – this is something we have to do. Career education was not part of our mandate, but we have accepted that (it is part of our work). We have SMME development – that must also be done by GCRA. If we had enough human resource capacity, maybe we might have done some of these things, but unfortunately we don’t.”

In 2011 a revised GMSP was commissioned. Its draft was submitted in December 2011. This new draft is not referred to in the terms for this review. The revised plan is reported to be based on the change logic of the 8 Strategic Goals of NSDS III and the 8 Commitments of the HRD SA Strategy.

It is not clear whether a revised plan in a new form will provide answers to the intractable problem of developing such plans without good information and data on supply and demand.

“The SETA is doing a 1000 and we’re doing a 1000. And who said 2000 new entrants are needed in the economy?”

5.2 The GMSP implementation

The implementation of the Master Skills Plan is the responsibility of GCRA. Yet because of the structure of the plan and the legislative framework and institutional arrangements between national and provincial government, between departments within provincial government and between government and the private sector, it is not a simple operation. Implementation of the GMSP had to take into consideration such factors as the role of the implementing agency like the GCRA – elements that were later included in the implementation like Career Guidance and other agencies.

5.2.1 The Role of GCRA

“GCRA has had a tortured development and the people who have to make it happen have found it very difficult. They’re not at the level where they can influence decisions – but they had to carry the burden.”

The plan now is to set up interdepartmental task teams around each strategic pillar (8) to ensure provincial government understanding and commitment to the plan. Currently there is no co-ordination of data although there are plans in the pipeline to correct this. So there is no single picture for the province on progress.

"If you asked me today how many learners in Gauteng have done ICT, I would not be able to tell you – I can only give you my number and MICT (Media, Information and Communication) Seta would give you another number." This challenge has been overcome in at least one province. The first phase was thrown at us... a learning experience. Now in the second phase we have a grip on it. But there are political and professional challenges. The political challenges: "We must have it by tomorrow" (There is political pressure to deliver on this key issue of unemployment). The professional challenge: "We must co-ordinate and facilitate – not delegate"

"GCRA was set up – and now everything is centralised."

A view from another perspective is that the GCRA sees its mandate as being:

"to intensify and modernise TVET in the province, to support human resource development in the province, to channel youth with the aptitude into areas of TVET and to act as a social protection mechanism."

The GCRA sees its role as *"delivery of TVET"* by ensuring workplaces for NCV and N4 learners so that they can complete trade tests or professional certification. It sees the need to advocate and promote TVET and envisages providing institutional support to FET colleges in the form of research capacity and curriculum and programme development.

5.2.2 Career Education and Guidance

Critical to the GMSP is a school-leaving population who have some awareness of the kind of work options that are available, an awareness of the kinds of areas where they have aptitude and interest and knowledge and resources to access learning, skills development and work opportunities.

The BHP Billington Career Centre at Sci-Bono has partnered with GCRA to provide a range of career services in schools. GCRA have trained a range of retired teachers, young graduates and others to work in the schools. These have been trained through PACE, an SMME accredited by ETDP SETA to do career guidance training. 500 career advisors were trained. (The target was 600). GCRA manages this and reports on numbers of learners counselled, provided with career guidance. The programme supports Grade 12 learners in applying for tertiary education.

"The career education component has been able to grow. It has been given support, space and skills to do a really good job within all the constraints."

5.2.3 Driving a City Region Skills Plan with Multiple Agencies accounting to different tiers of government.

Whilst the responsibility for the major implementing agency lies with the Department of Education, other provincial departments are also intimated. For example the Department of

Economic Development (DED) is responsible for the skills training for industry. The Department of Infrastructure Development are responsible for artisan training.

“These departments look at the MSP and they argue that their skills are not covered (and so are not particularly committed to the plan). We still do a piece here and they do a piece there and national does another piece there – which is a little bit of a problem.

Approval has been granted (December 2011) to set up an inter-SETA forum which GCRA will chair to bring all the programmes together. And plans are afoot to consolidate information and statistics.

5.3 Literature review

A literature review of the OECD study on the development of skills in a context of City Regions was undertaken for this study (Froy, et. al. 2009), 2009). City Regions were considered to be the most appropriate context to which comparisons can be made with the Gauteng province. Literature on skills plans tends to deal with either national or sectoral plans. The OECD study on City Regions identified cities of varying sizes but the large ones with population that exceeds that of Gauteng; countries with federal and centralised governance but all characterised by advanced and dynamic economies. Included in this study were cities like Shanghai, Michigan, Mississippi; Mackay region (Australia); Malmö (Sweden). Therefore, this study was chosen as the most appropriate resource for the task at hand of reviewing the Gauteng Master Skills Plan.

The following is an extraction of case studies about the skills plans of cities studied.

OECD report: some case studies:

Shanghai Highland of Talent Initiative: Developing an integrated approach to workforce development

Shanghai Highland of Talent Initiative is a good example of a city-wide skills strategy to help adapt a local labour force to a restructuring 21st century economy.

The municipal government launched its first skills development initiative in 1995 to develop Shanghai as a “highland of talent” in mainland China. However, effective efforts to implement a concerted strategy did not occur until the municipality launched a detailed “action framework” in 2004. Actions include the attraction of returnee high-skilled Chinese émigrés; specialised training programmes to train high-skilled scientists, managers, engineers, politicians and public servants; and wider programmes to reform the vocational training system and upskill Shanghai’s labour force. Many different agencies and institutions are involved in delivering the strategy, which has a clear set of targets, and has led to the development of 49 new pieces of city level legislation.

Different localities have different skills issues, and in some states and regions, bottom-up partnership approaches are being encouraged which involve a broad range of different private and public sector agencies, and focus on particular employment sectors. In 2004, the Governor of Michigan embarked on a state-wide project to improve the efficiency of local workforce development and educational systems in meeting businesses needs. Recognising that local labour markets have their own specific needs and that local entities best understand them, the state turned to local stakeholders to form partnerships to identify skills needs, develop the strategies to address the needs, and carry out proposed activities. With the financial assistance of a charitable foundation, the state offered one-year start-up grants totalling over USD 1 million

for the initial development of 13 “regional skills alliances” across the state. All the skills alliances have involved a business-led approach, with strategic aims and objective being developed locally in consultation with local employers.

Mackay in Australia: Upgrading the skills of local workers

While attracting new talent can help to address current and future skills shortages, concerted strategies to upgrade the skills of those already present within a region are particularly important, particularly those that address the low-skilled. The region of Mackay in Australia recognised that some local people were having a problem holding down apprenticeships, and that this was leading to skills shortages that were holding back growth in key manufacturing sectors of the economy. In response, manufacturing companies in Mackay formed an industry cluster named “Mackay Area Industry Network” (MAIN) with the purpose of both helping local people and addressing skills shortages quickly and effectively. The result was the MAIN CARE programme – a programme designed to recruit, select and manage apprentices in the workplace, which has had some success in improving retention rates within local apprenticeship programmes.

Mississippi Band of Choctaw Indians (MBCI)

Sometimes a community-based approach is necessary to improve skills levels, particularly in areas where both the supply and demand for skills has fallen to a very low level. The Mississippi Band of Choctaw Indians (MBCI) provides a case study of a successful community-based strategy which has addressed not only high rates of unemployment and poverty, but also a lack of employment opportunities in an indigenous tribal community. The Choctaw’s have approached skill-development through a method of self-reliance and self-determination as well as collaborative partnerships with government agencies. The focus for workforce development has been on the hospitality industry, as well as technology intensive manufacturing. The results have been remarkable, with poverty and unemployment rates dropping significantly since the early 1970’s from highs of 80% to a recent full employment status at 2% in 2007.

Malmö: Better managing migration

People are increasingly mobile and that migration will play an increasing role in local skills strategies.

In the mid-1990s the city of Malmö experienced both economic structural change and significant levels of immigration, to a large extent of refugees. During the second half of the 1990s a new vision was developed for the city, to transform it into a centre for service, trade and finance related industries. Improving the skills levels of the local population and attracting new talent have been central pillars of the new strategy. In particular, a number of initiatives have been developed to capitalise on the skills brought by new immigrants. These include new university courses to help highly-skilled immigrants adapt to the Malmö labour market, and a “portfolio-approach” to help make the competences brought by immigrants more visible.

South East Lincolnshire: Retention of talent

In a time of rising mobility, it is not just important to attract talent from elsewhere but also to retain skilled people that are already present in a region. Many localities, particularly rural ones, have put in place mechanisms to improve the attractiveness of local jobs to local people. Attempts to retain young people in South East Lincolnshire in the United Kingdom, for example, have focused on improving the image of traditional industries – notably horticulture and associated food industries. Initiatives here include building business-education links between major employers, colleges and schools and showcasing the need for scientific and technical skills within the industry.

The salient 5 points are summarised and explained below.

The case studies presented above suggest that successful local level skills plans have the following features:

They prioritise both in terms of the skills required and of the target population (whether to focus on attracting outside talent; upskilling current labour force or looking to future generations of young people). As the OECD report makes clear: “With limited resources, local policy makers need to establish priorities to ensure that concerted local action can have a real impact on the labour market” (p.15). This requires some foresight of current and future skills demand, information which is admittedly difficult to collect and forecast. “Local actors need to understand and correctly define the local ‘skills ecology’ to develop the appropriate tools required for evidence-based skills strategies.”

Successful local level skills planning **are integrated** to cut across education and training, employment, economic development, social development and entrepreneurship (OECD, p.16). Local agencies need to be able to influence education and training policy (which is often managed nationally) and develop partnerships with employers.

Increasingly, strategies centre on three particular themes: attracting and retaining talent, integrating disadvantaged groups into the workforce development system and upgrading the skills of the low-qualified. While many new initiatives are being experimented with in each of these three areas, it is important that different interventions are brought together in a balanced overall strategy, which maximises synergies and ensures that no member of the local population is left behind (Froy, et. al., p16).

Skills strategies are **long-term**. As the OECD report notes: “modern production techniques are characterised by rapid skills obsolescence” (p.15). As a result, attention also needs to be paid to building strong generic skills – the ability to analyse, communicate, innovate, problem-solve, and take risks where needed. Only providing people with specialised technical skills for one industry may be a risky action, for example, if that particular industry does not survive in the longer term. Local skills strategies may work best therefore through:

Promoting flexible specialisation – concentrating on certain sectors, but ensuring that the labour force has a broad range of skills which can be adapted as industries evolve (p.47)

Skills plans **are flexible** and able to adapt quickly to changing economic circumstances. The OECD report points out:

As business needs evolve, demands are placed on local vocational education and training systems to adapt, which can be difficult when their management is centralized (p.15).

In order to work effectively in partnership, local actors need to have sufficient authority within their own policy sector to actively influence the delivery of services. Skills strategies need to be regularly reviewed (while the development of generic skills will also be key to equipping the labour force with the ability to absorb unpredictable local shocks.)

Skills plans **join-up disparate education and training opportunities**, helping to make connections between courses and showing the route between basic skills training to higher-level training. In other words, skills plans should map out ‘career ladders’.

Skills plans **build strong relationships with employers**. According to the OECD report: While the private sector can be an invaluable partner in highlighting more *immediate* skills demands, governmental actors can play a crucial role in encouraging employers' to think about longer-term skills needs, and improve the way that they utilise skills in the workplace. This will be crucial to improving the quality of employment locally and avoiding problems of low-skill equilibrium.

Strategies **are concrete** with a clear allocation of tasks and responsibilities between partners. Targets should be set and certain elements of the strategy made enforceable by law.

6 Legislative Framework and Institutional arrangements

While examining the legislative framework and the institutional arrangements that underpin the implementation of the Master Skills Plan the following set of questions were considered:

- (a) Whether or not the Master Skills Plan is the appropriate tool for dealing with the issue of integrating young people and disadvantaged people into the labour force of the province,
- (b) Does the province have the appropriate institutions to make this possible, and
- (c) Does the province have the legal and policy authority to enforce this imperative.

The problem of unemployment lies in three spheres: Education, the economy and the labour market. What is not disputable is the importance of education in providing the necessary skills for the labour market. Also not disputable is that a highly skilled labour force plays a major role in growing the economy. But the nature of this relationship between these three spheres is not clear, nor the role of each in contributing towards employment.

Where does the problem that connects education and the economy lie? Is it poor education that produces poor skills? Are our education and training institutions producing the wrong kind of skills for the economy we have? Do our labour market policies make employers reluctant to take on new entrants and rather invest more in capitalising their industries, enterprises and companies?

South Africa is a country that is not short of policies that are aimed at addressing the identified ills in this society, and the area of economic development is no exception. Yet unemployment still grows unabated.

6.1. Policy Choices we have made

Since the advent of the new democracy, South Africa has developed an array of impressive policies. Some suggest that the failure of the system is the result of the disjuncture between policy development and implementation (MacGrath, 2004). This could be true, but have the policies the country has chosen always been correct?

Key policies that were chosen and are directly related to the question of improving education, employment and the economy are put under the spotlight to explore this question. These policies are greatly intimated in the GMSP document and are often taken as a given as the right policies within which to operate a skills plan.

The National Qualifications Framework

The National Qualifications Framework (NQF) was the first Act to be introduced by the Department of Education in 1995 (SAQA, 1995). Although South Africa can be regarded as one of the early introducers of the NQF, many countries have since followed and many more are interested in introducing the NQFs in their countries. What makes this policy to be spectacularly popular? Are there positive results to show the usefulness of this policy in making the education system better? Drawing from Allais's (2010) research done in 16 countries, there is plenty of evidence that shows that South Africa is not in a unique situation in the inability of this policy to

meet the intended outcomes. None of the goals of the NQF have been achieved through the NQF as a chosen policy.

Very few of the thousands of qualifications and unit standards in the South African Qualifications Authority (SAQA) base have actually been taken up by learners. Fewer are finding currency in other learning institutions and industry, and generally there is no visible and positive impact of such an expensive policy. The accreditation process demanded by the NQF policy is cumbersome and does not result to increased improvements in quality either. The failures are not just about lack of proper implementation of the NQF. Even if the formal education system had capitulated and joined the NQF bandwagon, the negative results would still stand. It was a wrong policy choice because it is not likely to help the country to address the issue of education provision as well as the creation of jobs for employment.

The policy has failed because of its optimism in using weak and marginal institutions to transform education and society. The policy is also based on wrong assumptions of its power to influence job creation and a just and cohesive society. The NQF has not been a useful policy in the development of skills.

From apprenticeships to learnerships

The second wave of transforming the vocational education system came via the Skills Development Act (Department of Labour, 1998) in the form of learnerships. The learnerships that were established sought to replace the apprenticeship system and their appeal was in the unit-standards based qualifications, which are purported to be more flexible than whole qualifications. The traditional technical courses in colleges were widely discredited in education circles, and especially those who work in 'the world of work'. The colleges were caught in a real bind for a while when the learnerships appeared.

The learnerships are largely problematic. On one hand, some of them occur in areas where there was no tradition of an apprenticeship system and the ordering of curriculum has just been terrible. The second contributor to the state of affairs about their learnerships is the unit standards based curriculum. This form of curriculum tends to trivialise knowledge in the learning process and thus disadvantage the participants as they are obviously short-changed in this educational process and their intellectual development undermined (Young, 2010). The type of knowledge acquired in these training programmes can be described as functional in nature or occupational, as opposed to the general academic nature of a school curriculum (Gamble, 2003; Young, 2006). The institutional base of learnerships tends to be in the private domain and providers in this market are a mixed bag. Many are transient and often in the game as a business with little capacity for adding meaningful value to the learning process¹. It is difficult to equate the different kinds of knowledge. Learnerships now attract people who have already tried the general education route and many have passed; they take learnerships as a 'post-secondary education' qualification to improve their chances of getting employment. Most learners either use learnerships as a way to while away the time whilst looking for something better or as a source of employment hence taking sequential and different learnerships (Lolwana, 2010).

¹ This is based on anecdotal conversations held with individuals working in this area.

The National Skills Development Strategy

The National Skills Development Strategy (NSDS) has seen two revisions since the original policy in 2001. The original policy was intended to guide the working of the Department of Labour's skills development vision as articulated in the 1998 Act (Department of Labour, 1998). The 3rd version, namely the NSDS III was launched at the beginning of 2011

The NSDS III comes after the integration of higher education, further education and the skills development into a single department. The institutional mechanism to drive all the laudable objectives of the NSDS III is seen to be the Sector Education and Training Authorities (SETAs). However, the SETAs continue to be on average weak and fragmented institutions. Revising this landscape has not strengthened these institutions by any means.

SETAs serve as labour market intermediaries. But their role seems to be extended beyond the competencies they have not been able to develop in more than a decade of their existence. Archer (2001) for example points out to this impossible task of expecting SETAs to carry out such a broad set of tasks when they are obviously handicapped by their own lack of competencies as well as operating in an environment that does not have complete information on the things they are supposed to produce.

For example, one of the major roles that the SETAs have always carried out is that of skills planning. This has been an area of greatest weakness. The country desperately needs some indicators that would serve as a guide on the direction of growth and occupational demand, and the SETAs are not able to provide this. Skills supplying institutions are often foraging in the dark on the programmes they need to invest in and the quantity of graduates they need to produce, at any given time. The SETAs will need assistance to carry out their new mandate as articulated in the goals given to them.

One of the key responsibilities of the SETAs is to oversee the learnership system. This is another area that has turned out to be problematic in the development of skills in South Africa. The fact that learnership qualifications do not have any institutional base has become extraordinarily problematic. Providers in this market are a mixed bag.

The economic policy drivers

There are two main economic policy drivers in the country, namely the Industrial Policy Plan (IPAP) of the Department of Trade and industry and the New Growth Path (NGP) framework of the Department of Economic Development.

The IPAP is the government's broad approach to industrialisation. The objectives of this policy are to facilitate a process of diversifying the economy beyond the traditional reliance on commodities in order to compete in the tradable export and import markets; to move the economy towards a knowledge economy; to promote labour-absorbing industrialisation processes; and increased participation of the historically marginalised people in the economy (Department of Trade and Industry, 2010). The IPAP is strongly geared toward macro-economic policies and the secondary sectors of the South African economy, and in particular manufacturing or what it calls the productive economy, and the, agro-processing and green economies. It intends to link the macro to the micro-economic policies.

What is really amazing in the context of such a detailed plan of developing the industrial economy of the country, the policy does not explain the role that should be played by the education institutions in the first place. In the second place, the skills trajectory of this policy seems to be firmly grounded in the high end instead of middle to lower end, where most of the new labour entrants would be found.

The Department of Economic Development, which sponsors the New Growth Path (NGP) framework, is a relatively new government division. The NGP sets itself as an employment creation policy primarily and emphasises supply-side needs, whilst also acknowledging the need to improve demand. It acknowledges the narrowness of the domestic market due to the relatively small population, low employment levels and deep inequalities (Department of Economic Development, 2010). As opposed to the IPAP that focuses on the private sector economy, the NGP puts a lot of emphasis on the public economy, especially in labour absorbing activities such as the infrastructure development, green economies, the social economy and public services. The NGP is one policy that pointedly mentions the improvement of the whole education system in order to produce the skills required for economic growth. The apprenticeship system as well as the Further Education and Training Colleges are seen as being central in the development of intermediate skills. However, it is not clear in this framework how the problems that led to the decline of the apprenticeship in the country are to be ameliorated nor is it clear in reading this policy that trying to create a 60s education is an answer, as Wolf points out (Wolf, 2011).

Like the IPAP, the NGP aims to change a consumption-led growth to be underpinned by a strong production base in the first place. It seeks to establish job drivers in public investments in the infrastructure of the country; target more labour-saving activities in agriculture and mining value chain and manufacturing services; take advantage of the green economy; leverage social capital in the social economy and public services; foster rural development and regional integration and target tourism and certain high level services (Department of Economic Development, 2010). All of these drivers are valid for the integration of the previously disadvantaged communities as well as expanding the economy in order that new jobs should be created. Also, the envisioned economy is the one that requires a sufficiently educated population, where enough planning has taken place in order to feed the pipeline from education institutions to the labour market.

In concluding this section, we wanted to interrogate the sensibility of the legislative and policy framework in which a function of skills development is located. We want to suggest that this function has been subjected to the most robust education and training policy development context in this new democracy on one hand. Yet, the education and training sectors that continue to flourish, namely school education and university education, are the sectors that have been least touched by this hectic reconstruction of the system. We have to ask ourselves as a country if these innovations in the education and training system have really added any value or have been a source of hindrance in the skills development function. On the other hand, the skills demand side continues to be characterised by a lack of clarity to give real signals to the supply side. These are the truths that have to be scrutinised in our policy and legislative environment and we need not take them for granted as tools that enhance the function of skills development.

7 The Ithutlere Tiro case study

The Ithutlere Tiro Programme has been integral to the work of the GCRA directorate responsible for post-school learning. It represents part of the work of the Master Skills Plan. It is described here as a case. There have been important lessons that are instructive for this review. The programme is initially described in a narrative. A series of questions were developed based on the original proposal. The technical details of the programme are described in answer to these questions.

7.1 A narrative

The Ithutlere Tiro Programme proposal from the Gauteng Province was designed in 2007 in response to a provincial allocation of R100 million by the National Skills Fund.

The proposal outlines an ambitious approach to provide skills development to unemployed youth in sectors where growth and development were anticipated and where opportunities were possible for new employment. (Artisan training in construction and motor mechanics, call centre operator training and training in ICT were the sectors specified.)

It appears that in its design and implementation the programme has faced serious challenges. But after initial problems ranging from poor performing partners, to payment problems from the Department of Labour to regulatory challenges in meeting the requirements of SETAs, to levels of skills of learners, the programme appears to have progressed and performed better over the latter period. (A final closure report has been drafted. Many learners are reported to have benefited from the programme over the period (9 902).

Despite some costly challenges the programme faced initially, it has provided some skills and access to the labour market. There are graduates from its programmes who are now in employment. The programme has provided success stories and important lessons and experience that have been reported in several interviews and are evidenced in improvements in management and practice.

The Ithutlere Tiro Programme has posed serious challenges to those who have been responsible for its implementation. It has operated in a restrictive regulatory environment and with weak institutional partners. It has dealt with youth who mostly have not begun their learning programmes with the strong general education required. And it has been implemented in a difficult economic climate.

The “front-line” activity of moving young people post school through skills development into employment is difficult. It is, however, an imperative and requires urgent attention by government, the private sector and civil society.

Getting Going....

As the GCRA did not exist in 2007 at the start of the implementation of Ithutlere Tiro, the programme had four implementing entities:

- a. The Gautrain was meant to do artisan programmes
- b. The City of Johannesburg was going to be responsible for Business Process Outsourcing,

- call centre training
- c. The Automotive Industry Development Corporation was to be responsible for artisan training in the car manufacturing industry and
- d. Information Computers and Technology (ICT) was the responsibility of the Gauteng Department of Education.

The R100 million allocated was given for three years. The province could not use this allocation in the prescribed time. There were challenges, largely financial, resulting from the national Department of Labour who were responsible for the resources at that time.

Getting Going Again...

As a result of the delays, the programme was granted an extension. An Employment Skills Development Agency (ESDA) was appointed. The chosen provider was Goba and Associates in Randburg. The ESDA was to project manage and ensure the extension of the project was better implemented than had been in the initial phase.

For the extension there were three implementing entities

- a. Gauteng Department of Education (GDE);
- b. The Department of Infrastructure Development (DID) and
- c. The Automotive Industry Development Corporation (AIDC).

The two entities that did not continue were Gautrain and City of Johannesburg.

7.2 Learning Lessons

a) Accrediting Workplaces for Artisans

From the mouths of the GCRA informants, we glean the difficulties that arose from workplace training:

We had a big problem with the DID (Department of Infrastructure Development.) They did not realize that to give workplace training, they needed to be accredited by MERSETA. When learners were to be trained, MERSETA said DID was not approved. We did not remove them formally – but decided that if they are not the workplace – we would have to go out there and look for workplaces for these young people.

The accreditation of the trades was a challenge. We had to go through the industry and through our ESDA to find suitable workplaces in industry. Each workplace had to be accredited with MERSETA. If they didn't have accreditation for the trade, we couldn't place a learner there.

So we had to get all those different workplaces accredited with MERSETA for each and every trade that took place on the factory floor!

b) Getting to an Appropriate Level in ICT

GDE (Gauteng-Online) was implementing the ICT programme. There had been teething problems in the beginning, but with the extension and intervention of the GCRA in the process, it started going well.

In the original 2007 plan the learners were supposed to be systems developers, but when implementation came it happened on a different level altogether. Instead of these learners doing “systems development”, they did “end-user computing”. The challenge was that the DoE could not have trained these learners except on “end-user” or “technical support” (NQF Level 4).

The original plan was ambitious. The school labs are not designed for systems developing. The project wanted these young people to assist principals and learners and provide IT and minor technical support.

c) Finding Creative Solutions

The GRA team and their colleagues were not complacent. They tried to find solutions to the challenges encountered.

In our revised proposal we committed to some “technical support” learnerships and some “systems development”. We took some to private companies and others we actually created a workplace from scratch – we created live projects for them to do for industry – developing websites, systems for companies. That became part of their actual work – to get them the full spectrum of what a systems developers would do in the workplace.

The majority (who comprise the “first group”) qualified with NQF Level 3 “End-User Computing.” The second group were part of an extension and comprised 452 learners. They either did NQF Level 4 “Technical Support.” or “Systems Support” 120 did “Systems Support” at Level 5. The first phase up to NQF Level 3 was implemented by GDE and the second was implemented from GCRA.

And the failures

Losing a big infrastructure development programme in the skills plan was a major drawback.

“The Gautrain project did not give us the results – for us it was one of the most challenging projects in implementing Ithutlele Tiro Project. The City of Johannesburg presented someone new at each meeting and its BPO project also failed.”

But even within the projects that continued, there were many things that went wrong:

- a) Tracking:** It appears that the original proposal was not followed to the letter. The proposal was based on some critical assumptions. Social Surveys² conducted a useful tracking survey of ICT learners from graduation into employment. They used data sets made available by GCRA and were able undertake follow phone calls to the majority of respondents based on core information provided.
- b) Community Recruitment Hubs:** The notion of “community recruitment hubs” as laid out in the original proposal is a valuable concept. However they do not exist. They are, in the words of one respondent “wishful thinking”.

² Social Survey Africa, 2011. Learner Tracer Study Of the ICT Learner Cohort of the Ithutlele Tiro Learnership Project.

- c) **Selection Process:** It does not appear that very clear policies and procedures were followed around selection generally. Learners submit personal information and a CV and request to be placed on a data base.

Some key informants specifically raised the introduction of an induction programme to provide general skills “for work” while assessing the aptitude and attitude of candidates. There were some informative cases.

One of the successes of the ICT project was that we got the selection right (for our purposes). (We even achieved our targets on people with disability.) We structured the learnership so it started as a pilot and ran for 3 – 5 years. We went to the school and asked the school for candidates who studied there in the last year. We asked for moderate candidates (not looking for A's and B's) who were interested in IT. We recruited in the local area .Schools were doing the pre-selection. We didn't have to worry about criminal records or get the youth security vetted. And we did not have to cover areas like dress code, discipline and time-keeping in general... There were some mistakes, but generally it fitted into place.

- d) **ICT Advanced Networking Skills:** The story of the ICT is an interesting case.

From a programme planning perspective it posed many problems. These have been described in Getting to an Appropriate Level in ICT in the previous section. These challenges in meeting regulatory requirements and reaching an appropriate exit level for employment were their issues.

However from another perspective, there were some positive and interesting spin offs that came out of the programme. When work place could not be secured, the interns made the schools laboratories for work place learning. The GCRA teams supported them by providing work place skills training and provided log books to monitor their progress. The GCRA team also found them mentors from the 85 IT technicians who worked in schools in the province. As the learners were placed in schools which had high enrolments (± 1000), they learned a lot by themselves and undertook tasks that they would never have been able to do were they in a proper workplace situation. The success of this venture went beyond anybody’s imagination as students from disadvantaged background were able to get real jobs in places like toll gates, casinos, etc. The success of the programme is attributed to a range of technical skills as well as general work skills in the programme. According to the interviewed informants, those with an entrepreneurial flair would easily start viable business out of the skills they got from this programme.

7.3 Ithutlere Tiro programme in the context of GMSP

The Ithutlere-Tiro programme was meant to address the strategic pillars of the GMSP:

Strategic Pillar 1: Strengthen the Capacity of the Education System in Gauteng

- Enable the links between the sectors in the Skills value Chain
- Strengthen the capabilities of the GDE to drive the Gauteng Master Skills Plan

The programme preceded GCRA and was coordinated from different places of Gauteng Province. This must have contributed immensely to the poor take off. The interviewed

informants were of the opinion that it was the other agencies that made it hard for the project to take off, but the government's lack of focus also must be questioned here. There were some successes later on, but they remained project successes, not linked to the GMSP. It does not look like those who were involved made a conscious decision to link the Ithutlere programme to the GMSP. In spite of some successes in this project, these cannot be linked to the strengthening of the educational system as it was envisaged in the GMSP plan.

Strategic Pillar 2: Develop targeted interventions for responding to the skills needs of Government in Gauteng

- Develop targeted programmes to respond to government support needs
- Develop key management competencies, knowledge and skills in targeted government departments
- Provide targeted support to local government

One of the problems about the GMSP is that it is targeting the internal clients (government employees) as well as external clients, the unemployed and unemployed. It is not prioritising in terms of both the skills required and the target population. On the other hand, the Ithutlere Tiro programme targets the development of skills for the unemployed youth. However, this targeting was accidental than purposeful on the side of GDE. The programme depended largely on where projects could be found and not where skills were needed. The GMSP also did not provide enough guidance for the programme about the skills needed. Ithutlere Tiro was by nature a hit and miss project and had no way of serving as a stimulant for skills development inside government or support local government. In fact the individuals interviewed who were central in the programme, do not seem to be senior enough to carry the authority for making this link – they are doers not planners and policy makers.

Strategic Pillar 3: Enable the Economic Growth of the Province through education, training and skills development

- Support the Gauteng Economic Growth and Development Strategy Pillars
- Develop strategies to absorb trained people
- Develop skills to enable and support the growth of emerging and priority growth sectors

The programme was designed to provide opportunities for training and then employment for the unemployed youth. Specific growth sectors of the economy were selected because these were sectors where there was a demand for labour and would enhance the chances for employment after training. Those sectors were advanced networking skills in ICT, the MICE tourism segment, Business Processing Outsourcing, specific areas of manufacturing in the auto sector, construction of transport and other infrastructure.

Of the 9902 learners who have participated, 69.3% graduated from learning programmes. The “skills gaps” were not quantified in the original plan. The output of graduates is not consolidated in the province and so there is no evidence that these “skills gaps” have been narrowed. But the throughput rate at 69.3% is indeed high and needs to be commended.

In terms of providing skills sets that are needed in employment, it seems from the interviews the implementers and ESDAs tried very hard to provide the learners with a range of skills that went beyond technical skills and included such 'soft skills' as workplace etiquette, emotional intelligence, HIV/Aids, and behavioural skills. Repeatedly, it was stressed during the interviews that the learners who enrolled in these programmes severely lacking in the above mentioned skills, and in spite of technical skills, would have found it hard to adjust in the world of work.

In terms of programme graduates being absorbed in employment, it seems as though the plan was that the learners would be placed in government departments. But the numbers were far bigger than those available to mentor them in government. This would have caused extreme chaos. The alternative would have been to train mentors, which was proposed. However, the project hit one snag when the Department of Transport wasn't approved by MERSETA. In addition all the mentors have to be certified by ETDP SETA. This points to the unwieldy nature of our education and training system and the regulatory environment we have created.

The GMSP and Ithutlere Tiro project remained separate in the minds of implementers, but connected to policy makers. This was a problem as there were no plans to take this forward from both ends when the DoL funding came to an end. But Gauteng also could not make use of the opportunities provided by such big projects as the Gautrain to engender a skills development and employment agenda.

Strategic Pillar 4: Partner with sector organisations to respond to the skills needs and provide access to work experience

- Develop a coordinated response with SETAs to the skills needs of Gauteng
- Work closely with FETs and HEIs to address the scarce and critical skills gap
- Partner with the private sector and non-governmental organisations in addressing scarce and critical skills gaps
- Partner with Trade and Professional Bodies

Successful skills plans are integrated (Froy, et.al, 2009). The GMSP pointed to this aspect in the plan, but fell short of making suggestions of how this should be done. Ithutlere Tiro seems to have found it extremely hard to make this happen as the implementers seem to have been 'flying by the seats of their pants' all the time. The nature of running this project meant that there was no space for planning, focus and coordination in the project. There is no doubt that the individuals involved at GDE were amongst the most committed individuals and really wanted to make a difference. But perhaps they were tasked with a function that was beyond their capabilities with respect to planning and making the links back to the GMSP.

The institutions and regulatory mechanisms on the ground are pretty much disparate entities that are not used to working together. For example, the private providers tend to be more responsive to the skills development regime than the public institutions. As indicated before, private providers come as a mixed bag of goodies. Also, the learnership system is highly questionable. All of these issues need to have someone at the head of implementation with sophisticated judgment, something that the implemented seemed

not to be fully equipped with. It is possible that it was the lack of authority from them that was a great contributing factor.

In **summary**, we can say that the GMSP and Ithutlere Tiro programme seemed to have been disconnected programmes. The former was a macro plan sitting somewhere in offices of high importance in the Gauteng Province Government (GPG). Some of the implementers of Ithutlere Tiro do not seem to have made a connection between the project and the plan. Whether this was by design or the pressures of making a R100 million project work were too much and it was better to forget about the plan, is something we will never know. But the moot point is that in operation these did not connect. In the next section we will come back to this point to see how best to connect a project to a plan.

The GMSP is directing GPG to a variety of target population and skills, without giving any specific indication on what to prioritise on. Ithutlere Tiro on the other end seemed to have just taken those who knocked at the door of the GPG asking for help. Is this the failure of the plan or of the project?

Skills development seems to be driven from the GDE in Gauteng. Theoretically this makes sense. But basic schools education occupies such a big space to give the function of skills development and deployment enough space, resources and decision making. The GCRA does not seem to have built this capacity to carry this function effectively yet.

The disparate nature of institutions and organisations on the ground that deal with skills development militates against a coordinated system and this is not the fault of the plan or the project. But there must be a way of building capacity in the implementing agency so that this hindrance can be overcome.

8 Discussion and recommendations

We were extremely impressed with the level of effort that different sections and individuals of the Gauteng Provincial Government have put into the implementation of the skills development in the province. The constraints and conditions all are working under are fully appreciated. The following discussion and recommendations are not meant to criticise, but are presented in the spirit of encouragement and further improvements where possible.

8.1 The absence of a storyline in the Gauteng Master Skills Plan

A lot of work was put into the development of the GMSP. It is a comprehensively researched document that presents a range of data sets about the province as well as considered forecasting scenarios about the nature and quantity of jobs that would be created in specific economic growths contexts. It is an informative document about the quantity of the elements of the supply and demand sides. It is also a speculative document about the economy, the labour market and its supply side. It is not a **plan**. A good plan has the features of a good storyline.

A plan has a storyline. According to Birks et.al. al. (2009) a storyline is a “descriptive narrative about a central phenomenon”. In the first place, a storyline is not a presentation of data but a compilation of data to germinate a story line. It is also not about hypothesis in abstract, as the storyline should never be constructed in isolation of the data. A storyline should emerge from the collected data, not to be imposed on the analysis. The concepts, categories, and relationships in the data, along with the process from which these were derived, are often implicit in the storyline. In the instance of the GMSP, the storyline should have been a presentation of a theory of how the province should approach the task of skills development.

In the first place it is highly unlikely that the different role players in the GPG share a similar view about a skills plan for the province. This government is made up of different individuals, different budget holders; different functionaries, different authorities, and so on. The starting place for a Master Skills Plan probably could have been with the various individuals and divisions who matter to secure the different views on the topic of skills development and in comparison to what literature says on this topic. Literature provides a global platform to stimulate a vision, whilst stakeholders can only act on their local knowledge. These two dimensions provide anticipation and foresight as well as a realistic view of what can actually be done. It is this pull between the broad and narrow that makes plans to be workable and also to eventually become a storyline.

If we go back to the **Shanghai Highlands Talent Initiative** case study presented in this report earlier on, we see that the storyline of this project did not emerge right from the beginning, it took some detailed ‘action frameworks’ to realise the plan. There were changes along the lines but the broad plan of developing Shanghai as a ‘highland’ talent in mainland China was kept through the changes and shifts. Considering that we are talking about a city whose population is more than half the size of South Africa (26 million), this is no small feat. It was not only the broad vision that made the plan, but the detailed actions as different activities that were being implemented started to shape the plan.

The moral of this story is that:

- A workable Skills Plan should be made up of a broad vision, not minute details of information.
- The principles that should inform a Skills Plan are: *integration, flexibility; long-term; coordination; relationship building*
- A Skills Plan gets built up by carefully selected action projects on the ground, which get evaluated and posted on the Skills Plan map
- A Skills plan must have targeted interventions – by sectors and by population and is continuously reviewed
- A Skills Plan storyline gets developed through a combination of a broad vision and on the ground projects.

8.2 Constant planning and coordination by government

Above, we have indicated that a Skills Plan is not a document that gets planned and then sits on the shelf to be taken down for implementation. A skills Plan should start small with broad intentions. It probably starts small, with a broad vision and principles. It is easier to have a buy in from the functionaries when the plan is smaller and is easily understandable. The vision and principles in turn must be informed by a background that is comprehensively researched. The research itself does not form a plan. What starts small as a broad strokes canvas should be followed by thoroughly detailed actions and projects to fill in the empty spots of the canvas.

Ithutlere Tiro should have been one of those case study projects. But it was disconnected from the Master Skills Plan. Even after it ended, there was no immediate action taken to review what has taken place in that project so as to inform the further development of the GMSP. An effective skills plan needs constant planning, reviewing and coordination to grow it. Therefore there must be human and financial resources attached to this process as it does not happen on its own.

8.3 Government must leverage its power

We have observed that the plans of Ithutlere Tiro were scuppered when major infrastructure projects could not buy into the GMSP. Whilst there must have been a number of reasons why this resulted in such a sad outcome and Gauteng lost such a big opportunity, the contention we want to table here is that this was not necessary. Government at all levels fork out big sums of money to private companies who must carry out public service projects. Often these private companies will prefer to bring their own human resources for areas of work that need skilled workers as they see the development of such skills costly in terms of time and resources. There is no reason why this must be accepted and taken as a given. The proposal that is being made here is that training and development of skills must be a condition that is tabled upfront with the companies that are tendering for the job, just as race, gender and disability are. This has become a common practice internationally. For example the following appears in a Queensland government building contract:

The Queensland Government Building and Construction Contracts Structured Training Policy (the 10 per cent Training Policy) requires that a minimum of 10 per cent of the total labour hours on any Queensland Government building or civil construction project (over \$250,000 for building or \$500,000 for Civil Construction) be undertaken by apprentices, trainees, cadets or indigenous workers and through the up-skilling of existing workers to a maximum of 25 per cent of the deemed hours. Existing workers must be engaged in **training that is delivered by registered training organisations and universities** which lead to nationally recognised building and construction qualifications. Contractors will be required to provide evidence of compliance with the policy and this information will ultimately be considered in any review of their eligibility to tender for future Government work (Skills Queensland: <http://www.qgm.qld.gov.au>: accessed 23/05/2012).

8.4 Exploit linkages across policy fields and legislative frameworks

According to the OECD (2012), a skills strategy or a plan supports governments in creating linkages between relevant policy areas, including education, science and technology, family, employment, industrial and economic development, migration and integration, social welfare, and public finance. It helps to identify policy trade-offs and synergies, while ensuring efficiencies and avoiding duplication efforts. However, in the case of South Africa, the myriad of these departments and regulation can be seen as a hindrance in the hands of novices.

On the other hand, we have also developed a culture of reciting our many acronyms that have come with the new pieces of legislations and frameworks, and not question their usefulness in what we are doing. The area in which the Master Skills Plans is trying to act in is governed by an array of legislation and statutory bodies. On one hand there is the National Qualification Framework and its Quality Councils, whose regulatory roles are not supportive to building a culture of training outside the education institutions. The new qualifications that sit outside the traditional education institutions have not had much currency to date and instead sit as a parallel structure outside the formal education and training system. The levy-granting institutions have not been very helpful in supporting a vibrant education and training system in the country, but instead have modelled their responsibilities in education and training after the NQF prescripts of quality control in the system. This complex situation has put a real stranglehold on new attempts in developing skills for the new entrants to the labour market. There is also the National Development Plan which has come out with a brilliant diagnostic tool of the problems that beset South Africa, but has fallen spectacularly short of giving an antidote to these ills. To add to this bewilderment, there are bodies like the Council for Human Resources Development (HRD) of SA, who set out plans and targets for human resources development. Are these targets meant for the Council, or the country? Should any organisation working in this area now take these plans and targets as a template for the country? Where is the evidence that these plans have worked anywhere since the HRD council came into being?

The legislative framework that governs the skills development is outside the authority of a province and negotiating or mediating this can be awfully daunting as it has been evidenced in the findings of this report. One can spend an awfully long time in trying to get a handle on the requirements of these institutions and after all those efforts still come out with training with very little currency if any at all. What we recommend is not necessarily out of expediency, but is backed by research in other systems like the UK:

- There is no evidence that shows that the new qualifications, like learnerships, unit standards and level benched have better currency, as compared to the traditional qualifications, like diplomas, certificates and degrees. We must therefore ask ourselves of the benefits of stretching ourselves in this murky new environment.
- It is important that a government department should not be left behind and must be seen to be supporting the new government initiatives, but implementing these is a whole different story, because we must always be aware that we are playing with lives of real people.
- Today's labour market conditions bear very hard on young people. Underlying structural trends have been made worse by recession. We need to make sure that learners have every opportunity to gain the most important and generalisable skills, including those gained in employment. This means making certain that the programmes focus on learners' demands and needs, not those of government agencies we have created.
- Any programme that spends half the time unravelling and fighting this legislative nightmare, must understand that very little energies will go into implementing anything vaguely useful to the end users, namely learners.
- It is still very important to find linkages between a skills development function and other government policies that advantage the recipients.

8.5 Strengthen institutions of learning

Part of a good skills plan has to do with the development of skills. A Skills Plan does not develop skills but it is in institutions that these are honed in. The Green paper on post school education has recently highlighted the problems that are particularly prevailing in relation to non-university provision. School education has its problems, but mostly the troubled spots can be isolated and treated. In general, our non-university institutions can be described as being small and weak and probably this is the single biggest problem currently facing the skills development area. Inadequate quality, quantity, and diversity of provision characterize the post-school education sector as a whole. There are very few opportunities for further education, whether general, vocational, or occupational, for adults and young people who have left school without a National Senior Certificate, or who have obtained a National Senior Certificate or National Certificate (Vocational) but do not meet admission and selection criteria for higher education. There is little accessible provision to assist people to catch up on the learning they have missed out on. The ratio of first year entrants to universities and colleges is approximately

3 to 1. This 'inverted pyramid' is a major problem for our system—we do not have too many people in higher education, but we do have far too few in further and vocational education.

The bulk of training is offered by private institutions as they are preferred by SETAs. These levy-grant institutions have spent most of their resources on short courses and on learnerships – many of which are located in areas where there are no related occupations. This has meant that much of this training has not contributed to improving the skills of the workforce. Workplace-based training is diverse. While there is some excellent training taking place, in general few employers have been prepared to take on apprentices and give students opportunities for work experience. A wide array of providers are often based in or contracted by workplaces, offer a range of programmes aimed at professional and community development. Some offer dynamic and responsive programmes, while others are unscrupulous providers who take advantage of peoples' thirst for education

This results in a workforce with serious shortages of artisan and other mid-level skills, and places additional pressure on higher education institutions to diversify and expand, as well as very few opportunities for most young people with a matric. It also provides no incentive for school learners who are not on a university track to work hard at school. Further, young people do not have the information, resources or networks to even navigate those institutions and programmes that do exist.

- Policies and strategies do not produce skills. It is the hard and long work of training by providers over a long period that will produce the desired skills. We have developed a myriad of policies over the years on skills development, but have little to show off regarding skills. We must build and support our institutions. We must improve the relationship and work place. A government with a Skills Plan must be prepared to invest in its institutions to get these skills developed.
- Even though Post-school education responsibilities have just been elevated to the National Departments, they still remain in the geographical bounds of a province. Provinces have not done exceptionally well in building both the further education and training colleges and adult education centres in the past, and yet these are institutions that will make or break any skills development plans in the province. There has to be a way to work with National with more vigour and creativity.
- There are geographical areas where provision is still scant, even in Gauteng and a plan to establish provision that is equitable and matched with learner demand must be developed
- One major weakness of the skills development programme is a lack of progression and this seems to be the characteristic of the non-university post-school education. In particular, these institutions are not linked to work place learning as well as higher education institutions. This is what a skills plan should be focusing on if it is to be effective and sustainable. In other words, building a system that links colleges to workplaces as well

as to universities.

- And critically the province through its provincial institutions such as GCRA and others must ensure that there are skills to undertake the work to lead, provide co-ordination services, and ensure the procurement of a variety of services needed for the healthy development of the providers for the development of skills.

8.6 The skills development and deployment for the unemployed youth

Young people live in a world of high unemployment nowadays. This phenomenon is not unique to South Africa, but is a general trend even in developed countries. The reason for this is partly due to the changing nature of the economy that has become capital intensive and therefore structurally requires less labour for employment. The computerisation of labour has had a direct effect to the shape of the labour market that is now looking like an hour glass with great shrinkage in the middle, growth at the top for the highly educated and some relative growth at the bottom for the unskilled but mature workers. This leaves out young people with some education and yet still immature to do the work that requires less “brawn than brains”. The nature of mid-level jobs has changed also requiring a change in the kind of education that young people need.

The youth of today also lives in a world where employers value skills learned in employment or work place as well as those acquired in classrooms. Many of the young people today do not want to remain in academic programmes but want to be in work, treated and earn like adults. Some of the young people are struggling to cope with academic work and even training of any kind. Yet, both the education and training system must still prepare all these young people for both eventualities of job feasts and job famine, irrespective of their circumstances.

The implosion of the labour market in South Africa and elsewhere has given rise to a growing interest in vocational education by young people. There seems to be an increasing number of vocational programmes that are on offer that do not lead young people anywhere. These are in the form of learnerships, skills programmes as well as all the thousands of qualifications registered on the South African qualifications database. Meanwhile, programmes like the apprenticeships, which are important in the youth labour market, seem to be going to older people.

Whilst both education and work experience pays in the labour market, there seems to be high returns for having stayed longer in education. In other words, the more education one acquires, the more qualifications one obtains and the higher the earnings are. It is therefore important to start thinking about the education of young people as a whole, not just schools, or colleges or universities. Young people are likely to lose interest in academic programmes at some point, but this must not be seen as the end of the road for them. Policy makers must ensure that young people can access coherent education programmes with great progression possibilities as they churn in and out of the education system.

The collapse of the youth labour market in the country (and in the world), happens at the same time that aspirations to higher education by young people and their parents are growing. Young

people and their parents value higher education. They see that higher education pays as there are fewer of those with higher education who are without jobs, than those who have not completed their secondary education. However, it is also still not easy for many young people to access the coveted routes to higher education and eventually higher education.

- Good education with quality English and Mathematics passes are very important ingredients for a vocational qualification as they provide the breadth and the skills for learning the other subjects. Therefore building on a foundation of quality basic education is very important for all young people, especially those who are disadvantaged.
- The conventional wisdom that the economy is developing towards 'knowledge workers' or high end of the skills spectrum is not supported by any hard evidence in the labour market, but a self-reinforcing dynamic may be at work which results in an over-educated workforce for the jobs they occupy. These issues are important to take note of when considering a skills plan of a region.
- Modern labour markets are the place where education and qualifications 'pay'. The more education one acquires, and the more qualifications one obtains, the higher one's earnings are likely to be and the lower the chances of unemployment. Young people must be encouraged and supported first in their attempts to get good education before embarking on training.
- Whilst the South African labour market offers high returns to degrees, in absolute and relative terms, it also offers very lower returns indeed to low-level vocational qualifications gained in educational institutions or training schemes, such as learnerships.
- Employers are not always looking for skills which are aligning in a one- to - one way with a particular qualification. Much of the time they use qualifications as a proxy for general rather than highly specific skills. They also necessarily rely on those that they are familiar with, which they can interpret, either in terms of the content, or as someone's likely relative ability. In South Africa, degrees are valued, so is the matric certificate and National Diplomas are also valuable in the Labour Market. N- Courses used to be valuable for apprenticeships. The NCV still has to prove itself and most learner ships have a lower currency in the labour market.
- Most employers value work- experience and the best way to obtain a job is to have one or have had one recently. Workplace teaches both general and specific work- skills more effectively than any education- based simulation can. This makes **apprenticeships** highly valuable for young people to gain the work experience, even if they later move on to different occupations later on.
- The existence of rapid economic and occupational change is a truism. Unfortunately, the nature of that change is often ill- observed and misunderstood. Many skilled manual jobs have declined in numbers, and many mid- level white collar clerical jobs have been squeezed out by new technologies. However, the decline is not uniform - construction (a major user of craft skills) grows substantially during periods of infrastructure investments. There is evidence that the largest occupations are in sales assistants, care assistants, general office assistants, and cleaners. Growth figures can be deceptive as rapid growth in glamorous high- tech industries does not translate into large numbers of jobs in absolute terms. Demand for personal and households' services seem to stimulate a lot of job growth in many countries. In the South African context, Social Services and Health Care as well as services provided by Municipalities to households, such as electricity, water, sewage and refuse clearing should be leading in employment creation, looking at the demand for these services. A Skills development plan targeting young people in order to help them access the labour market must be conscious of the prevailing labour market shifts.

8.7 Basic Education and Skills development

South Africa presents us with a complex range of contradictory scenarios in relation to its school education system. To start with, the country has a very ugly history of extreme inequality and all efforts have been geared towards erasing this history. In the last eighteen years, the school education sector has taken major strides in making school education more available to and attainable by all children. The country has not only expanded education provision but has also been able to obtain what Holsinger and Cowell (2002) consider to be a precursor of successful massification of schooling, namely a widespread adoption of cultural commitment to education. Further evidence of a “massified” school system are the enrolment and retention numbers that have been increasing steadily according to the latest survival and drop-out rate study carried out in the country concerning the twelve-grade school system (Ministerial Committee Report, 2008). Trend studies of the Senior Certificate examinations also provide proof of increased school participation and improved secondary schooling outcomes. Enrolment figures for this examination have been increasing steadily and the pass rates have climbed from 47% in 1997 to 70.2% in 2011. Gauteng in particular came second at 81% pass rate.

What seems to be still extremely difficult for young people is to have a successful transition from the schooling system to either work or some form of skills development. Transitions between education, training and work are unclear for most young people and their parents. The unclear and seemingly disconnected routes to training for the multitudes of young people who are not going to higher education institutions need special focus in any skills development plan. Altman (2008) strongly advocates that it is the responsibility of governments to identify young people who do not have access to networks and to assist them in entering their ‘first jobs’.

- A separation of a skills development function from the general education provision function is needed in order to ensure that young people are assisted in making the transitions from schooling to training and employment effectively.
- General education should be considered a necessary foundation for the launching of a successful skills plan, not a skills development activity by itself.

8.8. Reporting

Reporting seems to have been very weak in the attempts to implement the GMSP. In the first place, Ithutlere Tiro project revealed to us the weak nature of the information gathering system that was in place regarding this project in the Gauteng Province Government. We were unable to get hold of any written documents beyond the initial project document. Providers had unfolded after the funds had run dry. Anecdotal information was sometimes conflicting as informants recounted events from memory. We encountered the same problem when we were asked to analyse information from the reports that government regularly produces. This information was not forthcoming. Reporting is a very important element of making a skills plan work as this provides information about progress, lessons, pitfalls, etc.

9 Conclusion

The Gauteng Master Skills Plan has been presented as a useful document to provide statistics on the province as well as a forecasting mechanism for different economic growth patterns. But the plan is not helpful as an implementation strategy. It presents a long list of things that could be done by a whole range of individuals. As a starting point, the province needs to revise the plan. First, there is a difference between a skills plan and a normal education and training system. The GMSP seems to collapse the two into one. The latter should be seen as a targeted intervention to develop skills associated with employment and livelihood. The former is not just a means to something else - it is an end in itself, as education is a critical foundation for any society, not just for the purpose of employment.

Secondly, the province needs to prioritise in terms of skills required and the target population. In other words, the GPG must make a choice about whether or not their Skills Plan is for attracting outside talent, up-skilling the current labour force, or looking for integrating future generations of young people into the labour market. Then GPG must prioritise in terms of economic areas and the skills levels it needs. This is as far as the skills plan can go in the initial stages. It is the projects that will make the plan evolve and shape it as it grows. GPG must be mindful of the fact that a skills plan is long-term and has to be built up, adapting to the rapid obsolescence of skills and changing character of both the supply and demand side. A revised skills plan ought to be simple and easily understood by all those who will be responsible for its implementation.

The role of skills development projects in making a skills plan a reality cannot be underscored enough. But these projects must have a multi-purpose in mind as they are the content and the guide of the skills plan. On one hand, the projects must speak to the different elements of a project in general, like planning, project scope and milestones; work breakdown structures; delivery dates and outputs; allocation and control of resources; progress reports, etc. This means therefore that a project like Ithutlere Tiro, with so much money put in it, should have been treated like any significant project that wields power and should have had a proper project management system in place. On the other hand, projects like the Ithutlere Tiro should be considered as the infrastructure for a skills plan for the province. Their very nature provides rich lessons for skills development programmes in the future. The projects must be documented and not left for anecdotal recalls later on. They must be evaluated immediately – not only for future lessons – but to be posted on the Skills Plan canvas immediately. These projects should be the building blocks for GPG as it builds its own GMSP.

Lastly, skills plans need to be resourced extensively. In the first place, they need competent individuals who will be in charge as there is no recipe to be followed. They require individuals with a complex set of skills: individuals who can capture the imagination of stakeholders with a compelling vision; individuals with ability to plan and manage complex projects and role players; individuals with a sense of gravity in making critical judgments; workers to carry out tasks with consistency; academic acumen to evaluate and signal direction; and individuals with authority to make decisions when things have to change. Skills development plans also require constant collection and analysis of information. Therefore, a reporting system has to be structured upfront and not rely on general government reports. In addition, skills plans need

funds, and cannot be just tagged onto regular government functions. If GCRA is to be responsible for the future of the GMSP, there has to be serious consideration about how it is staffed and resourced.

10 References

- Allais, S.; Lolwana, P. , Marock, C. September 2011. Further Education and Training and Skills Development, (unpublished paper)
- Allais, S. August 2011. 'Economics imperialism', education policy and educational theory, Journal of Education Policy.
- Allais, S: Will skills save us? Rethinking the relationship between vocational education, skills development policies, and social policy in South Africa, forthcoming in the International Journal of Educational Development.
- Altman, M., 2008: Time to mobilise frustrated jobless youth. HSRC Review, Vol.6 (3). September; pp. 19–20.
- Birks, M; Mills, K. And Chapman, Y. 2009: A thousand words paint a picture: The use of storyline in grounded theory research. Journal of research in Nursing Vol. 14 (5) pp. 405 – 417.
- Cloete, N. 2009 (Ed.). Responding to the educational needs of post-school youth: determining the scope of the problem and developing a capacity –building model. Centre for Higher Education Transformation. Cape Town.
- Department of Higher Education and Training. 2011. Green Paper on Post School Education. DHET: Pretoria
- Froy, Francesca; Giguère, Sylvain and Hofer Andrea-Rosalinde (eds). 2009. Designing Local Skills Strategies, Local Economic and Employment Development (LEED) series, OECD Publishing.
- Gauteng Department of Education 2009: Gauteng Master Skills Plan – 2010-2015. Unpublished Document.
- Gauteng Growth Employment and Development Strategy, 2010. Department of Economic Development
- Gauteng Human Resource Planning and Development Agency: Training of the unemployed and under-employed; funding proposal for the Ithutele Tiro Project.
- Holsinger, D. B. & Cowell, R. N., 2000: Positioning secondary school education in developing countries. International Institute for Educational Planning/UNESCO: Paris; pp. 7–92.
- MacGrath, s. 2004:
- Ministerial Committee, 2008(a): Learner Retention in the South African Schooling System. Pretoria: South Africa.
- McGrath, S. 2004. The shifting understandings of skills in South Africa since industrialisation. In McGrath, S., Badroodien, A., Kraak, A. & Unwin, L., (eds.). Shifting understandings of skills in South Africa: overcoming the historical imprint of a low skills regime. Pretoria, HSRC Press
- National Skills Fund, November 2011. Final Closure Report, PGDS Strategic Projects (Ithutele Tiro Project)
- OECD 2012: Better Skills, Better Jobs, Better lives: A strategic approach to skills policies. OECD Publishing. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1787/9789264177338-en>.

The Presidency of the Republic of South Africa, 2011: National Evaluation Policy Framework (Draft 3 document).

Social Survey Africa, 2011. Learner Tracer Study Of the ICT Learner Cohort of the Ithutele Tiro Learnership Project.

Wolf,A. March 2011. Review of Vocational Education, The Wolf Report.

Young , M. 2010: Alternative educational futures for South Africa: Some lessons from Europe. Unpublished paper delivered at the launching of the REAL programme by the EDU at Wits.

11 ANNEXURES

11.1 Annexure 1

Measuring Performance of Externally-focussed HRD/ Skills Development Initiatives in the Master Skills Plan: *A template to measure progress in implementation, outputs and outcomes to address provincial skills shortages/mismatches and improve access to employment for disadvantaged youth*

The following template lists 50 implementation goals extracted from the Gauteng Master Skills Plan. Most of these “implementation goals” were set to meet the objectives of the strategic pillars 3 and 4 of the province (“enabling economic growth through education” and “partnering with key sector organisations to respond to the skills needs of the province.”)

Each implementation goal is linked to either a single agency or a collection of agencies (some operating at the provincial level but accounting to a national department or entity) who are responsible in whole or part for its achievement.

Please identify the implementation goals for which your department or entity are responsible.

Please then use the indicators from the MSP to document quantitative measures in each of two financial years, 2010 and 2011 if you are able and your department/ organisation is listed as a responsible agent for the implementation goal. In addition please identify the source (monitoring system, registered learnerships, bursary payments etc) you have used to provide the numbers or information.

Please write make comments (either in the column or as a footnote) where these are appropriate. This is so that an assessment can be made of where there are information gaps, where only part of the picture is available or where the implementation has not been addressed as yet.

Implementation	Outputs	Outcome	Indicators	Implementing Agency	Timeline	March 2010 – February 2011 (Measure of indicator and Source)	March 2011 – February 2012 (Measure of indicator and Source)	Comments
1. Develop standardised materials, to be distributed through book stores and made available through labour centres, schools and other facilities in gateway subjects and encourage users to complete assessment in these core areas to enable entry into other programmes.	<input type="checkbox"/> Standardised learning materials in scarce and critical skills areas distributed through mainstream media.	Wide availability of information on scarce and critical skills areas.	Number of priority programmes that are distributed through mainstream media.	GDE GCRA	By 2012			
2. Accelerate accreditation of programmes that address economic priority sectors through SETAs, FET colleges and higher education institutions.	3. Provide curriculum research and support services in priority skills areas. 4. Accelerate accreditation of priority skills areas. 5. Ensure that providers are enabled to offer skills in priority skills areas.	Increased throughput in priority skills areas and sectors.	Curriculum support in priority skills areas. Reduction of backlog in accreditation. Number of providers in priority skills areas.	GDE SETAs ETQAs	By 2012			
3. Target bursaries in economic priority sectors areas for the required number of students to make a meaningful contribution to the targeted growth in these areas.	4. Allocate bursaries in economic priority sectors	Target bursaries for economic priority areas	Number of bursaries in economic priority sectors.	GDE GCRA	By 2012			

Implementation	Outputs	Outcome	Indicators	Implementing Agency	Timeline	March 2010 – February 2011 (Measure of indicator and Source)	March 2011 – February 2012 (Measure of indicator and Source)	Comments
4. Target New Venture Creation Programmes, through SETAs, FET Colleges and higher education institutions with specific focus in economic priority sectors.	□ Each SETA, FET and HEI to commit to a number of new venture creation programmes.	New Venture Creation Programmes in different sectors.	Number of New Venture Creation Programmes run Number of new ventures created	GDE SETAs GCRA	By 2012			
5. Provide career guidance at Basic Education Level on economic priority sectors.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Start career guidance activities from Grade 8 Develop Grade 8-12 Career Guidance Programme 	Start guiding people earlier into careers that they are likely to find work in.	Career guidance programme from Grade 8+	GDE	By 2012			

6. Target business sector and community partnerships to support development of skills and integrated communities in economic priority sectors.	<input type="checkbox"/> Negotiate vacation skills programmes, short term and volunteer opportunities for people to gain workplace experience with employers.	Give opportunities for exposure and experience.	<i>Number of vocational training programmes</i> <i>Number of volunteers</i> <i>Number of workplace experience programmes</i>	GDE Department of Economic Development Private Sector	By 2012			
7. Strengthen innovation through PhD and master level bursaries in economic priority sectors.	<input type="checkbox"/> Communicate needs in economic priority sectors. <input type="checkbox"/> Support bursaries financially.	Drive innovation in priority sectors.	<i>Number of PhD and Masters level bursaries in economic priority sectors.</i>	GDE DHET NRF	By 2012			
Implementation	Outputs	Outcome	Indicators	Implementing Agency	Timeline	March 2010 – February 2011 (Measure of indicator and Source)	March 2011 – February 2012 (Measure of indicator and Source)	Comments
8. Integrate initiatives with CWP, EPWP and YEI to ensure seamless transition from the exit points in	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> A tracking system that tracks potential candidates for 	Seamless integration between labour and market opportunities.	<i>Number of people employed.</i>	GCRA Dept of	By 2012			

education to labour opportunities.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> CWP, EPWP and YEI initiatives. Making available of candidate information to infrastructure programmes. 			Economic Development				
				Public Works and Infrastructure				
9. Promote the jobs in strategic and labour absorbing sectors in schools as job choices.	a. Ensure career guidance have information about relative scarcity of jobs in sectors.	Learners likely to take jobs where there is employment.	Number of youth provided with career guidance in scarce areas	GDE	By 2012			
10. Promote retention strategies and retention culture, as well as specific opportunities and programmes through SETAs.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Campaign on job retention 	Increased retention of employees by employers.	Overall labour turnover rate in Gauteng.	SETAs	By 2014			
				StatsSA Labour Surveys				
11. Target and accelerate specific green jobs skills programmes.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Establish a research capability for green skills in GDE Identify skills required specifically for the green economy. Ensure that relevant programmes are created for green skills. 	Acceleration of adoption of green skills in Gauteng.	Green skills curriculum Green skills training providers Number of people trained in green skills.	GDE GCRA	By 2012			
Implementation	Outputs	Outcome	Indicators	Implementing Agency	Timeline	March 2010 – February 2011	March 2011 – February 2012	Comments
						(Measure of	(Measure of	

						indicator and Source)	indicator and Source)	
12. Promote skills programmes to SMME's and formal business through SETAs and entrepreneurship development agencies such as the Gauteng Enterprise Propeller.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Create awareness of the skills levies and that small businesses can benefit from these. • Create more information on how to access skills training. 	Small businesses promote skills development.	Number of small businesses that access the SETA system.	SETAs	By 2012			
13. Link educational institutions to cooperatives desk in the Department of Economic Development and the Gauteng Enterprise Propeller to promote access to funding and knowledge transfer around opportunities for cooperatives.	a. Promote awareness of cooperatives as a business form through providing information through Department of Economic Development and GEP.	Awareness of cooperatives as an opportunity.	Number of cooperatives registered	GDE Gauteng Enterprise Propeller Gauteng Economic Development	By 2012			
14. Promote Gauteng based and BBBEE procurement, especially to emerging businesses.	a. Promote BBBEE through government spend in line with PFMA	Promotion of BBBEE	Value of BBBEE spend from Gauteng Companies.	GDE	By 2012			
15. Develop best-cost / best quality systems to enhance procurement of educational supplies and materials in Gauteng.	<input type="checkbox"/> Secure best price / best quality procurement systems to enable better procurement in education.	Cost efficiency		GDE	By 2012			

Implementation	Outputs	Outcome	Indicators	Implementing Agency	Timeline	March 2010 – February 2011 (Measure of indicator and Source)	March 2011 – February 2012 (Measure of indicator and Source)	Comments
16. Utilise opportunities to produce educational materials in Gauteng (promote local beneficiation)	<input type="checkbox"/> Identify materials that are not produced in Gauteng <input type="checkbox"/> Establish preferential policy for locally benefited products. <input type="checkbox"/> Identify enterprise opportunities for local beneficiation.	Promoting the Gauteng economy.	Percentage of spend redirected from non-local to locally benefited products in Education in Gauteng	GDE	By 2012			
17. Enable young people to make the transition from school to further education and/or work that provides further training opportunities.	<input type="checkbox"/> Establish tracking systems indicating where people exit into the system. <input type="checkbox"/> Provide bridging and support programmes for people not entering the formal labour market.	Higher labour absorption, lower levels of crime.	Numbers of school leavers entering work/FET Numbers of youth provided with bridging programmes	GDE GCRA NYDA Providers	By 2012			
18. Strengthen GDE's partnerships with all stakeholders, resulting in	<input type="checkbox"/> Strengthen the stakeholder management capability within the	Better stakeholder relationships	Number of partnerships	GDE	By 2012			

education become a societal priority.	GDE		<i>Results per partnership</i>					
Implementation	Outputs	Outcome	Indicators	Implementing Agency	Timeline	March 2010 – February 2011 (Measure of indicator and Source)	March 2011 – February 2012 (Measure of indicator and Source)	Comments
19. Create awareness with local authorities on the needs and offerings of the GDE to take into consideration when doing LED planning.	<input type="checkbox"/> Integration of plans by GDE <input type="checkbox"/> Taking into consideration GDE needs when doing LED plans.	Local economic development plans that take into consideration needs for schools and other social infrastructure.	<i>Involvement in the LED planning process by GDE, districts and existing schools.</i>	GDE GDLG&H	2010-2014.			
20. Focus on new venture creation programmes and related skills building support to fit into LED priorities to ensure that there is integrated cooperative governance.	<input type="checkbox"/> Integrate LED information into skills planning to ensure local economic needs are integrated.	Education plans take into consideration local government needs.	<i>Updated skills requirements from Local Economic Development Plans.</i>	GDE GDLG&H	2010-2014.			
21. Work with stakeholders such as higher education, labour centres, schools and other entities on integrated skills and education responses to LED developments over the medium term.	<input type="checkbox"/> Develop curricula around local economic development and provide access to these programmes to various entities in government.	Better local economic development planning	<i>Number of people trained on Local Economic Development</i>	GDE GCRA All Departments.	2010-2014			

22. Provide opportunities for learners to transition into the labour force seamlessly	<input type="checkbox"/> Establish a clearing house of labour information that links people that are unemployed with skills to opportunities that have been identified.	Labour market supply and demand is matched.	Number of people that have found jobs through this system.	GDE Department of economic development	2010-2014			
Implementation	Outputs	Outcome	Indicators	Implementing Agency	Timeline	March 2010 – February 2011 (Measure of indicator and Source)	March 2011 – February 2012 (Measure of indicator and Source)	Comments
23. Identify critical needs for key infrastructure projects and ensure that SETAs/FET colleges and training providers are aware of emerging needs.	<input type="checkbox"/> Provide information on upcoming infrastructure projects and likely skills requirements.	Creates awareness of emerging needs.	Communication between Departments and agencies.	GDE SETAs FET	Short to Medium			
24. Monitor the fulfilment of skills requirements for these projects.	<input type="checkbox"/> Develop system for monitoring the levels of skills in the province and if they are adequate to service needs.	Identify critical skills needs before they arise.	List of identified skills.	GDE SETAs FET	On-going			
25.	<input type="checkbox"/> Identify potential	Sustainable	Number of people	GDE	Short to			

Focus on strategies for migrating people that have completed work on infrastructure projects to other parts of the economy.	<input type="checkbox"/> retraining programmes <input type="checkbox"/> Develop courses on how to run your own business	employment	employed	SETAs FET	Medium			
26. Addressed through the Gauteng Master Skills Plan	<input type="checkbox"/> Development of critical and scarce skills outlined in the Gauteng Master Skills Plan.	Greater efficiency and effectiveness in Gauteng provincial departments and municipalities.	Number of people capacitated as specified in the Gauteng Master Skills Plan	GDE GCRA SETAs FET All Departments	Short to Medium			
27. Promote awareness around Green skills requirements	More learners whose careers are guided in this direction	Capacitation of institutions driving the Green Economy	Better management of sustainable resources	GDE SETAs FET	By 2014			
Implementation	Outputs	Outcome	Indicators	Implementing Agency	Timeline	March 2010 – February 2011 (Measure of indicator and	March 2011 – February 2012 (Measure of indicator and	Comments

						Source)	Source)	
28. Promote educational programmes around the Green economy at all levels of education.	Learners trained on issues related to the Green economy and sustainable resource usage.	Greater awareness of the green economy and adoption of green solutions.	Number of educational programmes on the green economy. Number of people trained in the Green economy and sustainable resource usage.	GDE GCRA FET	2010-2014			
29. Build sector partnerships with SETAs to ensure that accurate and relevant skills need information guides the curriculum development process.	<input type="checkbox"/> Regular forums between GDE and SETAs in Gauteng. <input type="checkbox"/> Communication of issues and information between GDE and SETAs	Linking skills and education systems.	Strategy report and implementation plan detailing the sectoral partnership's joint plan of action	GDE SETAs	By 2012			
30. Improve access to RPL for unemployed.	<input type="checkbox"/> Establish assessment centres <input type="checkbox"/> Refer unemployed to assessment centres to determine if they do have skills that could be certifiable and if so, enable certification. <input type="checkbox"/> Monitor statistics from assessment centres	Certification of skills in the economy.	Number of unemployed that participate in skills programmes. Percentage of unemployed that become employed after a skills programme.	GPL SETAs Department of Economic Development	By 2012 to By 2014			

Implementation	Outputs	Outcome	Indicators	Implementing Agency	Timeline	March 2010 – February 2011 (Measure of indicator and Source)	March 2011 – February 2012 (Measure of indicator and Source)	Comments
31. Improve access to RPL for employees with experience.	<input type="checkbox"/> Establish assessment centres <input type="checkbox"/> Monitor statistics from assessment centres.	Skills advancement, retention	Number of employees that enter the skills system	GPL SETAs Department of Economic Development	By 2012			
32. Make information available to students around the SETA system and how they can utilise the skills development system to advance their careers.	<input type="checkbox"/> Information on SETAs, their programmes and ways that this assists your career - distributed through schools.	Better informed learners.	Number of learners taking skills programmes.	GDE SETAs	By 2012			
33. Ensure that there are transition points from the skill system into the formal education system.	<input type="checkbox"/> Create awareness of the number of credits that are required to be considered a formal qualification.	Increased further studies from skills courses.	Number of SETA learners entering the HEI sector.	SETAs HEIs	By 2014			

Implementation	Outputs	Outcome	Indicators	Implementing Agency	Timeline	March 2010 – February 2011 (Measure of indicator and Source)	March 2011 – February 2012 (Measure of indicator and Source)	Comments
34. Work with SETAs to simplify administration of learnerships	<input type="checkbox"/> Identify administrative barriers to learnerships and optimise these processes to enable faster output and to ease the administrative burden of the employer. <input type="checkbox"/> Enhance	Simplified learnerships procedures. Increased number of learners in learnerships.	<i>Number of learnerships</i>	GCRA SETAs	By 2012			

	ability of people to apply for learnerships through SETAs							
35. Disseminate information around the role of learnerships, apprenticeships and internships to employers through web-sites and other mediums.	<input type="checkbox"/> Create awareness about the need for learnerships, apprenticeships and internships in companies.	Increased participation in creating these opportunities by employers.	Number of messages through radio, TV and other mediums promoting the need to support workplace programmes.	GDE Communications	2010-2014			
Implementation	Outputs	Outcome	Indicators	Implementing Agency	Timeline	March 2010 – February 2011 (Measure of indicator and	March 2011 – February 2012 (Measure of indicator and	Comments

						Source)	Source)	
36. Develop clear and integrated statistics around learnerships, workplace skills programmes, apprenticeships and other skills interventions.	<input type="checkbox"/> Establish a centralised system for processing skills information. <input type="checkbox"/> Ongoing processing of WSPs into a centralised system. <input type="checkbox"/> Integration of statistics from this system.	Realistic view of skills needs in the province on an ongoing basis.	Monthly reports on skills gaps in Gauteng that integrate information from SETAs, GDE and other sources.	GDE GCRA SETAs	By 2012			
37. Investigate the potential of a structured volunteer programme in Gauteng.	<input type="checkbox"/> Profile and create mechanisms by which volunteerism can be promoted in a structured programme that gives workplace experience.	Volunteer programmes that give people exposure to social opportunities and experience.	Number of volunteers in Gauteng	GDE GCRA	By 2014			
38. Develop a strategy for supporting the roll-out of testing centres for trades.	<input type="checkbox"/> Integrate trade testing with assessment centres. <input type="checkbox"/> Roll-out at least 15 trade testing centres in Gauteng.	Testing centre for trades.	Number of testing stations for trades Number of trade qualifications	GDE DOL	By 2012			

Implementation	Outputs	Outcome	Indicators	Implementing Agency	Timeline	March 2010 – February 2011 (Measure of indicator and Source)	March 2011 – February 2012 (Measure of indicator and Source)	Comments
39. Support and partner the FET system to ensure that these facilities enable the economic growth of the province	<input type="checkbox"/> Completion of the FET Revitalisation Programme <input type="checkbox"/> Communicate information on scarce and critical skills to FET colleges. <input type="checkbox"/> Monitor numbers that go through the FET system. <input type="checkbox"/> Identify avenues of cooperation with FET colleges.	High level of integration between FET and Gauteng priorities.	FET Partnerships	DHET GDE FET Colleges.	By 2012			
40. Influence policy to ensure that FET colleges have high quality standards, excellent curriculums and teachers that inspire and motivate young people to take up technical trades that are relevant and that respond to the needs of business.	<input type="checkbox"/> Identify challenges in collaboration with FETs and determine strategies to assist in overcoming these challenges.	High Quality FET colleges.	Policies that reflect specified quality indicators. Reports reflecting implementation of quality standards.	GDE GCRA	Short and By 2014			
41.	<input type="checkbox"/> High level engagement	Delivery of critical programmes for	Number of critical skills	GDE	2010-			

Work closely with HEIs to advance the education and skills agenda.	with HEIs to determine strategies and action plans for ensuring prioritisation of critical skills.	skills in the province.	programmes offered by HEIs	DHET	2014			
Implementation	Outputs	Outcome	Indicators	Implementing Agency	Timeline	March 2010 – February 2011 (Measure of indicator and Source)	March 2011 – February 2012 (Measure of indicator and Source)	Comments
42. Create access programmes that are building closer relationships between the private sector and the secondary school and FET sectors.	<input type="checkbox"/> Create opportunities for part time lecturers <input type="checkbox"/> Create innovative curricula that involve external participants. <input type="checkbox"/> Involve private sector in curriculum construction.	Information transfer between industry and education sector	Involvement of private sector in improving education.	GDE Secondary Schools FET Colleges.	By 2012			
43. Design interventions to track youth in higher education and further education.	<input type="checkbox"/> Develop systems to track progression of youth through higher and further education. <input type="checkbox"/> Identify the reasons for youth remaining or dropping out	Increased number of youth enrolled at higher and further education institutions	Number of youth in higher education and further education.	GDE HEIs CGRA	Short and By 2014			

	<input type="checkbox"/> of higher education and further education. <input type="checkbox"/> Develop a strategy to increase number of youth in higher education and further education.			NYDA				
Implementation	Outputs	Outcome	Indicators	Implementing Agency	Timeline	March 2010 – February 2011 (Measure of indicator and Source)	March 2011 – February 2012 (Measure of indicator and Source)	Comments
44. Investigate linking education and skills programmes to youth development agency activities.	<input type="checkbox"/> Develop a strategy that links education and skills programmes that will equip youth with scarce and critical skills.	Education and skills programmes addressing the scarce and critical skills gap	Number of youth trained in scarce and critical skills	GDE SETAs HEIs GCRA	Short and By 2014			
45. Create exposure to market and entrepreneurship opportunities.	Profile entrepreneurship opportunities through the media, web-sites and interaction at various points.	Higher awareness of opportunities	Number of promotion events.	GDE Gauteng Enterprise Propeller.	By 2012			

				DTI, IDC, SETAs Department of Labour Department of Economic Development				
46. Profile incubators, innovation centres and growth hubs in the province.	<input type="checkbox"/> Provide links to incubators, innovation centres and growth hubs in the province on web-site. <input type="checkbox"/> Promote protocols for interacting with these facilities.	Provide access and create awareness of the availability of these facilities.	<i>Number of people being entering innovation centres, incubators and growth hubs.</i>	Dept of Economic Development	By 2012			
Implementation	Outputs	Outcome	Indicators	Implementing Agency	Timeline	March 2010 – February 2011 (Measure of indicator and Source)	March 2011 – February 2012 (Measure of indicator and Source)	Comments

47. Promote successful entrepreneurship models in schools.	<input type="checkbox"/> Develop a set of case studies for starting different business practices and promote in schools.	Encourage entrepreneurship in schools.	Number of case studies Number of small businesses established.	GDE Dept of Economic Development SETAs	By 2012			
48. Promote skills necessary for new venture creation.	<input type="checkbox"/> Require SETAs to show results in New Venture Creation programmes.	Develop entrepreneurial culture in Gauteng.	Number of SETAs with new venture creation programmes. Number of learners starting new businesses.	GDE SETAs	By 2012			

Implementation	Outputs	Outcome	Indicators	Implementing Agency	Timeline	March 2010 – February 2011 (Measure of indicator and Source)	March 2011 – February 2012 (Measure of indicator and Source)	Comments
49. Build targeted relationships with trade and professional bodies to ensure integration of skills development initiatives.	<input type="checkbox"/> Meetings with trade and professional bodies around the Gauteng skills needs and requirements. <input type="checkbox"/> Targeted recruitment and placement of school and SETA graduates with the	Integrated response to education and professional bodies to ensure skills needs of Gauteng	<i>Number of meetings with professional bodies.</i> <i>Number of continued relationships with professional bodies.</i>	GDE	By 2012			

	professional bodies. <input type="checkbox"/> Alignment of professional qualifications with unit standards and vice versa.							
50. Support the establishment of professional bodies in key sectors that are relevant to the Gauteng economy.	Provide financial and logistical support for the establishment of professional bodies in key sectors including <input type="checkbox"/> Housing <input type="checkbox"/> Local Government <input type="checkbox"/> Greening initiatives <input type="checkbox"/> Technology <input type="checkbox"/> Engineering	Strengthening the socio-institutional capacity to provide skills.	<i>Number of professional bodies that are active in the province.</i> <i>Number of technical support grants for professional bodies.</i>	GDE Department of Labour DTI	Medium to Long Term			

11.2 Annexure 2:

GAUTENG PROVINCIAL GOVERNMENT MID-TERM REVIEW

TERMS OF REFERENCE: INDEPENDENT EVALUATIONS OF KEY PROGRAMMES–MASTER SKILLS PLAN

INTRODUCTION

As November 2011 marks the midpoint of the current five year government term of office, the Gauteng Provincial Government is undertaking a mid-term review of its performance. The review is intended to contribute to improving the implementation of government's programme to the end of the current term of office in 2014, and provide the basis for public communication of government's achievements in implementing its mandate. The review will be conducted on the basis of the eight provincial outcome areas based on information provided by departments.

OBJECTIVES OF THIS PROJECT

As part of the Midterm review process, the Gauteng province wishes to conduct independent reviews and evaluations of some of its key programmes. This therefore calls for proposals from independent specialists to conduct these evaluations. Specialists are urged to consult the draft National Evaluation Policy Framework (<http://www.info.gov.za/view/DownloadFileAction?id=150348>) to structure their work.

SCOPE OF WORK – GAUTENG MASTER SKILLS PLAN 2010-15

The Gauteng Master Skills Plan (GMSP) was developed to address skills shortages and skills demands for the period 2010 to 2015 and beyond. One of its main objectives is to give impetus to the government's strategy of providing the province with a sustainable pool of economically relevant skills so as to contribute towards the eradication of poverty and unemployment. It is a cross cutting driver of the Gauteng Employment, Growth and Development Strategy and aims to address the mismatch between skills demand and supply within Gauteng, thus ensuring that a truly inclusive and globally competitive city region is realised in Gauteng.

While the GMSP outlines interventions relating to skills development within the education system and within the public service in Gauteng, these are not the focus of this evaluation. The aim of this evaluation is instead to provide an overview and assessment of the implementation of the Master Skills Plan and related projects and programmes within the province as it relates to the skills needs within the province's economy. The study should explore how this contributes to addressing the skills shortage and mismatch in Gauteng and the extent to which skills development initiatives contribute to improving beneficiaries' access to employment and other opportunities to generate income on a sustainable basis, especially among young people from disadvantaged communities.

The work will consist of the following:

- Assessing documentation related to Gauteng's Master Skills Plan and the Gauteng Employment, Growth and Development Strategy
- Conducting a literature review of similar projects conducted elsewhere, and of any related studies conducted on the Master Skills Plan and Gauteng Provincial Government skills projects.
- Review the legislative and institutional arrangements related to skills development, with a particular focus on intergovernmental roles and responsibilities, and its impact on the GMSP.
- Reviewing performance against key indicators and targets as set out in the strategy Implementation Plan Identifying additional relevant key indicators that will be used to assess the success of the Master Skills Plan, and accessing and analysing data to measure performance against these indicators where possible
- Conducting interviews with key relevant stakeholders including SETAs, FETs, Higher Education Institutions, non-governmental organisations, the private sector namely industry and professional bodies, provincial officials, educators and participants to develop an understanding of the process of receiving training to access into the labour market from the strategic planning phase to implementation, outlining the successes and challenges experienced.
- Identifying challenges that inhibit the proper implementation of the Master Skills Plan and developing proposals for corrective action. Developing recommendations on an approach to improving the Master Skills Plan in addressing the skills shortage in the province for the future and improving employment levels, especially among youth, based on the above assessment.
- A review of the Ithutlele Tiro programme as a case in point.
- Writing a report presenting this information (approximately 30 pages) and developing a presentation.

Deliverables

The deliverables for this assignment will include:

- An agreed schedule of work indicating timeframe, project resources and project milestones
- An inception report detailing e.g. the agreed methodology that will be adopted in conducting the study
- A draft findings report
- A final consolidated report

TIMEFRAMES

A draft report is due by 20th January, 2011, with a final report and presentation due no later than 31st January, 2012.

CONFIDENTIALITY

All research, including interviews will be owned by GCRO/ GPG and evaluators will be required to sign confidentiality agreements to that effect.

Technical and financial offers by prospective service provider

A prospective service provider shall submit, along with the project proposal, a profile of the organisation (detailed below), as well as a detailed breakdown of the proposed project cost to be considered for the project.

This assignment requires the expertise of a specialist with considerable experience in education and training; skills development; a good understanding of the South African education and skills development policy environment and landscape; research and analysis, ability to do skills supply - demand and labour market analysis.

The specialist may be an individual, company or consortium that can demonstrate the required expertise. The appointed service provider will be required to sign a Confidentiality Agreement over and above a Service Level Agreement.

a. Company profile

The service provider shall provide a business/company profile with a detailed CV(s) of the Consultant(s) that will be directly involved in the project. Such profile will detail the history and official registration of the business, postal and physical addresses of the business,

reference to similar projects that have been successfully completed as well as names of contactable references.

The technical offer shall illustrate the appreciation and understanding of the scope of the required project work, a full project plan confirming that the work will be completed within one calendar month.

b. Proposed cost for the project

The offer should detail the cost breakdown of the whole project as per project plan and also show VAT separately.

A certified copy of a tax clearance certificate, not older than six months, must be attached.

11.3 Annexure 3: Key Informant Interviews

Name	Organisation	Contact Details	Date Interviewed
HOD Mr Boy Ngobeni	GDE	Boy.Ngobeni@gauteng.gov.za 082 377 4817 Agnes.Vumazonke@gauteng.gov.za 011 843 6517 011 843 6578	Monday 12 March 2012 13h00
Albert Chanee	GDE	Albert.Chanee@gauteng.gov.za Neo.Mataboge@gauteng.gov.za 011 355 0729 011 556 9000	No response (Met with Mr Chanee 12/3 who deputised for Mr Ngobeni)
Dr David Makhado	GDE	082 815 1590 David.Makhado@gauteng.gov.za	No response
Dr Anthony Naidoo	GCRA	Anthony.Naidoo@gauteng.gov.za 011 5569143 083 287 8355	Wednesday 15 February 2012 08h30
Dr Sazi Kunene	GCRA	Sazi.Kunene@gauteng.gov.za 083 602 4086 011 556 9000	Wednesday 15 February 2012 08h30
Nomhle Ndlovu	GCRA	011 556 9007 082 4111231 Nomhle.Ndlovu@gauteng.gov.za	Monday 6 February 2012
Nonkululeko Mdlela	GCRA	011 556 9026 Nonkululeko.Mdlela@gauteng.gov.za	Monday 6 February 2012
Simon Nkontlha	GCRA	011 Simon.Nkontlha@gauteng.gov.za	Monday 6 February 2012 13 February 2012
ESDA N. Goba	MD Goba and Associates	082 376 8165 goban@vodamail.co.za	14/02/01 10h00
ESDA Dr Dick Rayner	Gauteng Online	083 310 2068	14/02/01 07h30 - 09h30
David Kramer	SciBono	082 5583971	14 Feb

		011 639 8400	14h00 - 15h30
SETA 1 Takalani Murathi	MERSETA	011 551 5200 tmurathi@merseta.org.za	No response
SETA 2 Zanele Maseko	MICT SETA	zanele.maseko@mictseta.org.za	16 February 2012 08h30 - 10h30
FET 1 Mokaba Mokgothle	Director of FET Colleges	083 310 2081 mokaba.mokgothle@gauteng.gov.za	No response
Provider 1 Antoinette Engelbrecht	Xtensive ICT Academy	011 023 7340/1/2 antoinette@xtensiveict.co.za	17 February 2012 10h30 - 12h30