

DEPARTMENT OF PUBLIC WORKS



public works

Department:
Public Works
REPUBLIC OF SOUTH AFRICA

CASE STUDIES AND COMPLETION REPORTS ON THE EXPANDED PUBLIC WORKS PROGRAMME

SYNTHESIS REPORT OF EVALUATIONS OF SELECTED EPWP PROJECTS

(Part A)

Project No: HP05/31

SUBMITTED BY

MCINTOSH XABA AND
ASSOCIATES
29 SEPTEMBER 2006



*A partnership of institutional and development
research and facilitation specialists*

TABLE OF CONTENTS

1 EPWP Glossary and Definitions	8
1.1 EPWP programme / projects	8
1.2 Institutional	8
1.3 Health Sector	9
1.4 Environmental Sector	9
2 Introduction	1
2.1 The Expanded Public Works Programme (EPWP)	1
2.2 EPWP Monitoring and Evaluation Framework	1
2.3 Evaluation Methods	1
2.4 The Sample	2
2.5 The Evaluation Reports	2
2.6 Evaluation Steering Committee	3
2.7 Timing of the Evaluation	3
2.8 Limitations and Constraints	3
3 Synopses of Projects	4
4 EPWP Quantitative Analysis – Results Compared	30
5 EPWP Issues Analysed	33
6 Lessons Learnt and recommendations	37
6.1 Strategic Alignment and EPWP Conditionality	37
6.2 Institutional Capacity for EPWP	37
6.3 Design and Value of Assets created	37
6.4 Training, Capacity Building and Community Empowerment	37
6.5 Sustainability	38
6.6 Job Opportunities and remuneration	38
ANNEXURE “A”: OVERVIEW OF EPWP: EPWP GUIDELINES AND REQUIREMENTS	40
ATTACHMENT B - ASSUMPTIONS AND RISKS OF EPWP	43
ATTACHMENT C - TERMS OF REFERENCE	44
ATTACHMENT D - DOCUMENTS REVIEWED	46
ATTACHMENT E - METHODOLOGY: QUESTIONNAIRE	48
ATTACHMENT F: A COMPARATIVE TABLE OF THE PROJECTS EVALUATED	56

Executive Summary

The Expanded Public Works Programme (EPWP), which was launched in May 2004, is one of government's short to medium-term strategies to address the challenge of unemployment in South Africa. President Mbeki announced the programme in his State of the Nation Address in February 2003. The target is to provide **one million employment opportunities with training to unemployed people, within the first five years** of the programme. The EPWP will achieve this aim through the provision of work opportunities combined with training so that workers gain skills while they work and increase their capacity to earn an income. The programme utilises public sector budgets in the infrastructure, environmental, social and economic sectors. Monitoring and evaluation of the EPWP is regarded as integral to the successful implementation of the programme. A monitoring and evaluation (M&E) framework has been designed for the EPWP. The framework combines ongoing reporting and monitoring (using existing departmental channels) with a number of new evaluation tools to measure the impact of the programme. Conducting case studies and completion reports are two of the methods appropriate for the evaluation of the EPWP, which is the object of this study. The purpose of the assignment was to develop case studies and compile completion reports, across the infrastructure, environment and culture, and social sectors to investigate the nature and extent of the relationship between the EPWP and specific outcomes. This will help feedback implementation lessons to improve the program.

In this assignment 10 Case Studies were written up and 10 Completion Reports were prepared. This report represents the synthesis report for the entire study i.e., case studies and the completion reports. Table 1.1 shows the specific projects that were investigated. The structure of this report is such that each project has briefly been discussed, the main findings indicated, areas of concern highlighted, and recommendations made. The study involved interviewing about 1000 people, focus group discussions, and beneficiary/stakeholder surveys. Both qualitative and quantitative data were obtained and analysed. The results have also been compared to draw common lessons and to analyse trends. The study revealed the following;

Labour Distribution: The EPWP targets for women (40%) and that of the Youth (30%) have largely been achieved as evidenced by 54% having 60% or more for female representation in the labour force. The area of greatest disappointment is the employment of disabled persons where only 15% of the projects achieved the EPWP target of 2% or more.

Work System: Three work systems were identified from the study: time based (daily wages), task-based, and a combination of time-based & task-based system in the same project. *It was found that the task-based system yields better productivity than daily-wages system.* Some projects using "time-based system" are considering converting to task-based system. The greatest concern with task-based systems is how to precisely define a task. Poorly defined tasks can disadvantage the workers and supervisors need to be trained in how to define tasks.

Employment Duration: Three categories of employment duration could be identified through the study: 3 months period (23% of the projects), 6 – 10 months employment duration, and two years or more. Projects that use 3-month employment system are usually found in areas where labour is in abundance such as urban settlements. Participants in such projects complained bitterly about the short duration of employment. In the projects that employ staff for two or more years, training is more heavily emphasized and comprehension and the exit strategies are better. It appears that the duration of the project has direct impact on the training and post project employment opportunities.

Wage Rate: 62% of the projects investigated (8 out of 13) paid wage rates between R40/day to R60/day. 4 out of 13 projects (31%) had a wage rate varying from R61/day to R100/day. The lower paid projects seemed to be located in areas of high population density where there is an abundant supply of labour.

Percentage Labour Cost: Cost data could not be obtained for 54% of the projects investigated, signaling a problem of financial record keeping. Though some projects have very low labour cost 4.5% and 25% (30-40% ideal for Li projects), they still called the projects labour-intensive. *It seems labour-intensity has been misconstrued and most project implementers are not aware of what constitutes a labour-intensive project.* What makes a project labour-intensive needs to be clarified.

Training: 85% of the projects investigated offer technical training together with other forms of training such as lifeskills, Safety, health and Environment (SHE), and social interventions. This is a positive development.

Cost Per Job: A comparative analysis of the cost per job reveals that the cheapest cost per job created was from the social sector (R12,661/job), followed by the environmental sector (R18,519 to R62,331), and lastly the infrastructure sector (on average R73,000 to R95 000 per job). *The implication of this is that the potential for job creation, both cheaply and labour-intensively, lies mostly within the social sector, followed by the environment sector, and lastly by the infrastructure sector.* Most infrastructure projects have limited capacity for labour-intensity. At best labour can be used to enhance some of the infrastructure projects.

Job creation Potential: The study revealed that 69% of the projects investigated had potential for job creation subject to overcoming certain constraints such as funding, financial, and project management. Simply put more jobs could be created with increased funding. What is at issue is sustainability in terms of the asset created and the participants finding employment or self-employment after the projects. Though longitudinal survey will put the picture in better perspective, exit opportunities appear disappointing for all the projects investigated. The exception to this being the social project (Thembisile Home Based care Center) where 73% of the participants that worked as volunteers in the project managed to find jobs in the formal sector. Self-employment appears to be a viable option for some participants as well.

EPWP Assumptions: EPWP makes some crucial assumptions that were tested as part of this study (See Attachment 2). According to the study, the EPWP assumptions on private and public sectors having capacity to implement EPWP projects, SETAs having capacity to deliver, adoption of labour intensive methods, and systems in place to check corruption were found to be valid. However, a few individuals expressed concern about lack of performance and delayed payment from SETAs. The study found exit options, funding provision for projects, and awareness about EPWP to be unsatisfactory.

Expansion/Replicability: 10 out of the 13 projects investigated (77%) are worth expanding and replicating. This is an indication of the overall success of the EPWP, despite some challenges.

Maintenance

Although most EPWP projects have indicated that the labour intensive approach stops when EPWP project implementation ends, there must, in virtually every case of environmental and infrastructure projects at least, be a sustained follow on with the labour intensive approach, throughout the project life cycle. Every EPWP project in the infrastructure and environmental sectors should have a maintenance programme built into it, if the investment made and the intended benefits are to be sustainable.

General Conclusion

The EPWP is generally very well received by communities. EPWP projects have even brought real enjoyment to some participants. The programme has demonstrated enough real benefits to be continued, with the necessary improvements.

Recommendations

In the light of the foregoing the following recommendations are worth considering:

- More project implementers such as Consulting Engineers, Contractors, responsible people in Public Bodies, on training waiting lists, need the courses on Labour Intensive work/methods.
- Infrastructure that has been developed with EPWP should be acknowledged and publicized to encourage those Departments who are failing to comply with EPWP
- Incorporate a EPWP maintenance plan in all the contracts that are to be awarded.
- There is the need to develop an EPWP selection matrix to determine whether a project can qualify as EPWP or not.
- Municipalities must keep an up-to-date database of EPWP projects and people trained/certificated.
- SETA/CETA and DoL shortcomings in providing support to EPWP need to be investigated and dealt with urgently.

- Communication with all stakeholders, particularly the workers/potential workers is vital. There has to be a clear understanding about the objectives behind the EPWP and EPWP projects, how they are to be employed, trained (what they will learn and future prospects) and remuneration.
- Monitoring progress against plans, timing, budgets and quality should be prescribed and defined requirements for all EPWP projects.
- There is a need to review the wage rates in most projects especially those around R40/day. Contractors and EPWP implementers should be trained on realistic and accurate calculation of tasks in task-based work.
- Average extended duration of employment of six months or more could allow more time for training and would enhance exit opportunities.
- There is a need to explore potential for self-employment and to train project participants on how to run their own businesses, since participants are unlikely to find formal employment.
- Social projects must be sought and given serious consideration and be promoted if EPWP is to assist participants to find employment after the program.
- There is a need to be more flexible and to keep the tender documentation as simple as possible for local small contractors.
- EPWP implementation guidelines must be developed for other sectors.

In sum, the EPWP has shown success. However, the challenges revealed in the study and listed below need to be addressed.

- The very low labour content of some infrastructure projects
- Officials must be committed to the EPWP concepts and principals
- Inter organizational planning boundaries that have in certain cases become blurred leading to EPWP projects being loaded with other non-core activities
- Defining the task in "Task Based work" system;
- Communal ownership and participation in project planning and implementation
- Lack of active involvement of local and district municipalities in some projects
- Inefficient and insufficient delivery by SETA/CETA
- Conducting training without accreditation or certification.
- Imbalances in training provision and lack of availability of training providers in some provinces.
- Lack of exit options and the associated insecurity and anxiety felt by members of the workforce when coming to the end of a project.

Note: The piloting of (Expanded) Completion Reports, whereby the implementation teams were encouraged to add their limited self assessment to the standard project documentation required of them, has made a small but significant start in capturing the experiences of project teams in piloting the EPWP programme. This innovation should be continued, without adding unduly to their sometimes already onerous reporting requirements. A reporting template needs to be adopted.

Typical Characteristic of Labour-intensive Operations That Makes Good EPWP Projects.

Index	EPWP
General Expectations	1 The project must fill a genuine need in the Municipality or Community; 2 The Project must meet the expectation of its users; 3 Select projects which have been shown to be conducive to high numbers of employment opportunities per unit of expenditure; 4 Positive identification of sufficient labour; 5 Workers located at ideal walking distance of 3-5 Km and must walk to work; 6 Availability of suitable road building materials in the vicinity (for road projects); 7 Topography: no over-abundance of rock; ideally flat to undulating with minimum steep areas; 8 Set labour cost at minimum acceptable level for area (target the poor - duty of public body); 9 Create as high a number of employment opportunities per unit of expenditure as technically feasible.
Expected Outcomes	EPWP emphasizes on asset creation, jobs, training, and exit strategies including future job potentials or self employment.
Employment	a) Work is labour intensive: Target at least 30- 40% Labour content (Labour cost) b) Target of 3,000 person-days per kilometer of road or more is typical of labour intensive works but not mandatory. c) May be task-based where possible.
Training	a) Project specific; Dept of Labour; labour intensive contractor b) <i>Labourers</i> : 2 days per 22 days of work recommended i.e. Effectively 2 days per month c) NQF level not specified for workers, but structure a training program which can be cetificated where possible. Supervisors at NQF Level 4 d) The main contractor and other project implementers required to undergo training at specified NQF levels.
Wages	Minimum wage not specified in the guidelines but must reflect local realities and should be negotiated by or through the public body.
Labour Distribution	Females – 40%; Youth – 30%; Disabled: 2%
Exit Strategy	Intention to achieve this through training, further education or self employment.

EPWP PROJECTS MONITORING SHEET: MONTHLY FIGURES

Report Date: _____

Report Compiled by: _____

Project Name:		Date Started	
Project No:		Date ended/ending	
Municipality		Months Through Project	
Local Municipality		% Complete	
District Municipality		Consultants	Name: _____ Tel: _____
Province		Project Manager	Name: _____ Tel: _____

Measureme nt Criteria	Specific Index	Units of Measure	PLANNED	ACTUAL	% Variance
			1	2	3 =((1-2)/1)x100
Time	No of Working days per month	Days			
Job creation	Total Number of people employed in the project (Gross number of job opportunities)	Number			
	Number of Youth employed	%			
	Number of Women employed	%			
	Number of Disabled employed	%			
	Total Person days of work excluding training (People x Days worked)	Person days			
	Duration of employment for each cycle	months			
Costs	Approved Budget including professional fees	Rands			
	Required Budget (Working budget)	Rands			
	Min. Daily wage (if daily wags based)	Rand/Person			
	Task rate (if task-based)	Rand/task			
	% of municipal budget committed to EPWP	Rands			
	Labour Cost	Rands			
	% Labour Content (% Labor cost)	%			
Training	No of people trained this month	People			
	Accredited person Training days	Days			
	Accredited modules	Units			
	Total cost of training	Rands			
	No trained-managerial (people x days trained)	Person days			
	No trained-technical (people x days trained)	Person days			
Technical (Project specific)	No trained-life skills (people x days trained)	Person days			
	1.				
	2.				

EPWP PROJECT MONITORING FORM CUMULATIVE FIGURES

Cumulative Cash Flow (incl. VAT) - Rands			
Year:_____	BUDGET	ACTUAL	% Variance
	1	2	$3 = ((1 - 2)/1) \times 100$
B/F			
Jan			
February			
March			
April			
May			
June			
July			
August			
September			
October			
November			
December			
Totals to Date			

Cumulative Number of Jobs Created			
Year:_____	BUDGET	ACTUAL	% Variance
	1	2	$3 = ((1 - 2)/1) \times 100$
B/F			
Jan			
February			
March			
April			
May			
June			
July			
August			
September			
October			
November			
December			
Totals to Date			

Cumulative No Trained			
Year:_____	PLANNED	ACTUAL	% Variance
	1	2	$3 = ((1 - 2)/1) \times 100$
B/F			
Jan			
February			
March			
April			
May			
June			
July			
August			
September			
October			
November			
December			
Totals to Date			

% Labour Distribution			
Year:_____	% Women	% Youth	% Disabled
B/F			
Jan			
February			
March			
April			
May			
June			
July			
August			
September			
October			
November			
December			
Totals to Date			

1 EPWP Glossary and Definitions

1.1 EPWP programme / projects

EPWP contract	A contract provided to a worker or contractor to perform a task under the EPWP
EPWP agency	An implementing agency responsible for delivery under the EPWP
EPWP worker	1.1.1.1 A person employed to work in an EPWP under the Code of Good Practice for Special Public Works Programmes or the Learnership Determination for unemployed learners

Employment creation

Work opportunity	Paid work created for an individual on an EPWP project for any period of time. The same person can be employed on different projects and each period of employment will be counted as a job.
Person year of employment	One person year = 44 weeks of work. For task-rated workers, tasks completed should be used to as a proxy for 40 hours of work.
Expenditure per work opportunity	Total project costs divided by the work opportunities created
Person year of work	One person year = 44 weeks of work. For task-rated workers, tasks completed should be used as a proxy for 40 hours of work.

Training

Training	1 training day = at least 7 hours of formal training. Includes literacy and numeracy, life skills, vocational training, business training. Includes assessment of prior learning of workers.
Training day	At least 7 hours of formal training. Is further categorised as literacy and numeracy, life skills, vocational skills, business skills. This includes the assessment of prior learning of beneficiaries.
Accredited training	Training provided by a training service provided accredited to provide such training by the relevant Sector Education Training Authority (SETA)
Skills programme	A skills programme is occupationally based training that, when completed, constitutes a credit towards a qualification registered in terms of the NQF as defined by the SAQA. Only accredited training providers may provide the training.
Learnership	A learnership combines work-based experience with structured learning and results in a qualification that is registered within the National Qualifications Framework (NQF) by the South African Qualification Authority (SAQA).
Learnership Agreement	An agreement entered into between an organ of state and a Learner in terms of Section 14 of the Skills Development Act 97 of 1998, in terms of which the Learner will be educated and training in accordance with the Learnership Agreement
Learner Contracting Company	The juristic entity formed by individuals who have entered into Learnership Agreements as a team comprising one contractor and two supervisors, each of whom will receive training and independent project experience in terms of the Learnership Agreement
CETA	The Construction and Education Training Authority, a sector education and training authority

1.2 Institutional

Public Body (PB)	An organ of State that: Has signed a Memorandum of Agreement with the NDPW (DPW) and the CETA to implement the DPW's EPWP; Has made a budget available to provide workplace experience for Learner Contracting Companies under the EPWP; and Enters into a contract with the Learner Contracting Company and the Consulting Engineer for a Project
Consulting Engineer	The natural or juristic person appointed by the PB to administer the contract with the

	Learner Contracting Company for a Project in accordance with the provisions of that contract
Mentor	An experienced and trusted advisor appointed by the National Department of Public Works (NDPW) tasked with provision of assistance to Learners and Learner Contracting Companies in planning, execution and management of on-site training projects in terms of this specification
Practical Completion Certificate	A certificate issued in terms of a Project by the Consulting Engineer, signifying that the whole of the construction works have reached a state of readiness for occupation or use for the purposes intended, although some minor work may be outstanding

1.3 Health Sector

Presidential Lead Project	A project initiated by the Presidency. Usually identified by a Presidential Task Team which would serve as a Pilot Project/Prototype for similar programmes/projects/events in the Republic in the future.
Revitalisation Project	A Revitalisation Project sets out to revitalize health facilities in line with the National Dept. of Health (NDoH) ten-point plan. Covers upgrading, refurbishing or constructing physical facilities, equipping of facilities and upgrading of infrastructure servicing the facilities. Can mean an upgrade of the health facility itself from a Clinic or a Local Hospital to a District Hospital.
District Hospital	First level hospital with general medical doctors but no medical specialists. Some surgical operations conducted (e.g caesarian, appendectomy).
Primary Health Care Clinic	First level of contact for patients with the health services. It is staffed by nurses and visited by doctors from the District Hospital. Some cases will be referred to the District Hospital.

1.4 Environmental Sector

Biome	Natural vegetation zone
Invasive alien plants (IAPs)	Plants, animals and microbes that are introduced into countries, and then out-compete the indigenous species Introduced species become invasive because they are adapted to similar environmental conditions. They do not have the same levels of predation and competition as indigenous plants
Invasive species clearing (ISC) in AENP	Black wattle (<i>Acacia mearnsii</i>), Gums (<i>Eucalyptus</i> species), Jointed cactus (<i>Opuntia aurantiaca</i>), Blackwood (<i>Acacia melanoxylon</i>), Lantana (<i>Lantana camara</i>), Bugweed (<i>Solanum mauritanium</i>), Bramble (<i>Rubus flagellarius</i>), Rooikrans (<i>Acacia cyclops</i>), Port Jackson (<i>Acacia saligna</i>)

2 Introduction

2.1 The Expanded Public Works Programme (EPWP)

The Expanded Public Works Programme (EPWP) is a short-to-medium term national programme across all spheres of government and state-owned enterprises (SOEs) which is aimed at alleviating and reducing unemployment. President Mbeki announced the programme in his State of the Nation Address in February 2003. The target is to provide **one million employment opportunities with training to unemployed people, within the first five years** of the programme. The EPWP will achieve this aim through the provision of work opportunities combined with training so that workers gain skills while they work and increase their capacity to earn an income. The programme utilises public sector budgets in the infrastructure, environmental, social and economic sectors.

2.2 EPWP Monitoring and Evaluation Framework

“An EPWP Unit has been established within the Department of Public Works (DPW) to coordinate, monitor and evaluate the implementation of the EPWP and to provide support to provinces and municipalities who are the primary implementers of EPWP projects on the ground. Evaluation studies will be commissioned as per the EPWP M&E Framework”.¹

Monitoring and evaluation is regarded as integral to the successful implementation of the programme. A monitoring and evaluation framework (M&E) framework has been designed for the EPWP.² The framework combines ongoing reporting and monitoring (using existing departmental channels) with a number of new evaluation tools to measure the impact of the programme. DPW has developed a Logical Framework for the M&E of the EPWP Programme.³ The EPWP Unit maintains a database of EPWP projects, receives quarterly Monitoring reports on all EPWP projects and publishes an annual EPWP report. All the provinces and municipalities have to report on the EPWP according to selected performance indicators.

The Evaluation Brief

The purpose of the assignment is to develop Case Studies and compile Completion Reports which were conducted across the infrastructure, environment and culture, and social sectors to investigate the nature and extent of the relationship between the EPWP and specific outcomes.

2.3 Evaluation Methods

The study involved conducting Case Studies and compiling completion Reports (CRs) for purposefully selected completed projects or projects nearing completion. In some cases both case studies and completion reports have been done on the same projects, where the completion reports revealed that there was a need for a more in-depth studies.

¹ Stanley W. Henderson, EPWP Unit, Chief Director: M&E Specialist, 8 June 2006

² Department of Public Works, January 2005: Framework for Monitoring and Evaluation.

³ Department of Public Works, 20 May 2004: Draft Expanded Public Works Programme (EPWP) Consolidated Programme Overview and Logical Framework

2.4 The Sample

The evaluation sample was drawn from the EPWP database of projects. From the list of about 4000 projects provided, the selection was made on the following basis.

- Projects from each EPWP sector: infrastructure, environment, social and economic.
- Projects from the four priority poverty nodes: Alfred Nzo and Maluti-a-Phofung ISRDPs and Motherwell and Alexandra URPs.
- Projects that were 80-100% complete.
- Projects where the client or stakeholders requested the evaluation to support decision making about the future of the project or to resolve differences of opinion about the project.

The spread of projects was widened beyond the 4 priority nodes when suitable projects in the nodes had been exhausted and in response to specific requests for evaluation (from the Western and Northern Cape Provincial Administrations). The economic sector was not represented because of the unavailability of projects at the time of the evaluation. Table 1.1 summarizes the projects that were evaluated.

Table 1.1 EPWP Evaluation: Project Sample

Sector	Province/Node	Project	Completion Report	Case Study
Environment/Economic	Gauteng	ABI Alex Jukskei River	X	X
Environment	Eastern Cape	SANParks Addo Working for Water	X	X
Infrastructure	Western Cape	Gansbaai-Bredasdorp Road Upgrading		X
Infrastructure	Kwazulu-Natal	Hlabisa Hospital Construction	X	X
Environment	Gauteng, Alexandra URP	Jukskei Environmental Rehabilitation	X	X
Infrastructure	Northern Cape	Kgalagadi Transfrontier Road		X
Infrastructure	Free State	Makwane Road	X	X
Environmental	Eastern Cape	Metropolitan Gateways and Beautification	X	X
Environment	Eastern Cape	Motherwell Greening Project	X	X
Infrastructure	Eastern Cape, Alfred Nzo ISRDP	Ntsikeni Access Road and Ntsikeni Nature Reserve Access Road	X	X
Environment	Free State	Qwa Qwa Invasive Plant Removal Project	X	X
Social	Mpumalanga	Thembisile Home Community Care Center	X	

2.5 The Evaluation Reports

There was a significant difference between the two kinds of reports in this study:

- With Completion Reports the intention was to expand the existing project reporting on Inputs and Outputs so as to capture some preliminary Outcomes /Impacts and Lessons Learned. Documenting the project through more self assessment added value in three ways by:
 - capturing the experience of the project implementers themselves (the “project lore”);
 - providing early indications of projects that will need independent evaluation (because of successes or failures or decisions that need to be taken about the project); and

- providing some feedback on early Outcomes and Impacts for the majority of projects that will, in all probability, never be evaluated.
- Case Studies were evaluations done by independent evaluators and included beneficiary and stakeholder assessments.

Ideally the sequence would be for Completion Reports to routinely be conducted, inform the selection of projects for independent evaluation and serve as a point of departure for Case Studies. In this case, they proceeded concurrently.

2.6 Evaluation Steering Committee

An Evaluation Steering Committee was established, comprised of EPWP management and representatives of the other sector departments involved in the EPWP (DEAT and DSD). The Committee met twice, at the start and at the end of the evaluation.

2.7 Timing of the Evaluation

The evaluation commenced on 1 May 2005 and had to be finalized by 29 September 2006.

2.8 Limitations and Constraints

The main constraint was on the Completion Reports. As expected, the project implementers were not familiar with the notion of expanding the routine project completion documentation to include some focus on preliminary Outcomes and Impacts and also on the value of their own experience of and reflections about the project. The implementation teams were provided with the Completion report template for self completion, assisted by the evaluators. When encouraged to do so, the project team leader or client did provide valuable input on their own views of the project, which are captured in the Lessons Learned parts of the Completion Reports. However, their abilities to report on preliminary Outcomes and Impacts appear limited and need strengthening through Logframe training. It must also be stated that the implementation teams were under pressure of time.

End Products and Utilization of the Evaluation

The evaluation was commissioned to deliver 10 Completion Reports and 10 Case Studies. The anticipated value of the Evaluation Case Studies as Teaching Case Studies has led to the inclusion of illustrative material, to a greater or lesser extent, to inform their use for teaching purposes. It is hoped that the EPWP will place the Case Studies (as well as the Completion Reports) on the DPW website so that they can be publicly accessible to education and training staff and their students for this purpose. EPWP implementers should be encouraged to draw on the implementation lessons to inform future project implementers.

3 Synopses of Projects

Introduction

The synopses combine key information from both the Completion Report and the Case Study on each project. They present both a summary of quantitative information against EPWP criteria and some qualitative insights gained from the project context, institutional arrangements, and beneficiary and stakeholder assessments. The actual Completion Reports and Case Studies are presented under separate cover (Part B).

(i) The Abi Alex Jukskei River Project

The project is summarised below.

Project Summary								
EPWP Category	Program Name		Prov	District Muni	Local Muni	Current Start/ Finish	Total Budget	% Spent
Environmental	Abi Jukskei Project	Alex River	Gauteng	Johannesburg Metro		October 2003 to May 2005	R3.3 million	100%

A. Project description

The ABI River Project was an environmental project that was undertaken in Alexandra, which is an informal settlement in Johannesburg, between October 2003 and May 2005. The project involved the Jukskei River Clean-up and Maintenance and Development of Community based Integrated Waste Management Model. The large population, inappropriate sanitary infrastructure, raw wastewater discharge, lack of collection and disposal of solid wastes on a regular basis, uncontrolled liquid and solid waste discharge and low level of community awareness all contribute to environmental pressure on the local environment as well as the Jukskei river downstream of Alexandra. The result has invariably been a polluted Jukskei river.

To rehabilitate the Jukskei river and to restore it to its natural state, the SOUL Foundation (an environmental NGO) developed and implemented an eco-sanitation model in September 2003. This was a comprehensive model that aimed at cleaning the Jukskei River of solid waste together with the management of the waste to avoid further pollution. It was an integrated waste management system that addressed waste at source empowering the local community through job creation and skills training as well as developing social entrepreneurs and environmental leaders. There were two aspects to the project: 1) One section that cleaned the Jukskei river, and 2) the other section that focused on household waste management through recruiting and empowering several households.

In all 1600 households were involved. As part of the development of an integrated waste management model, a community-based buy-back center for recyclables was set-up. Households as well as businesses were recruited into the program as suppliers of recyclables, which then were sold to recycling partners. This project represented the community Public Private Partnership arrangement. The main partners included the Department of Public Works that supported the project by being the principal funding agency. SOUL Foundation – An NGO implementing agent, WITS University (that monitored the river quality), the Private Sector (mainly recyclers that contributed financially to the project. They also offered markets for the recyclables, and the community (beneficiaries).

B. The Main Findings

Objectives: It was noted that the overall the objectives of the project were achieved. The performance of the project in terms of delivery of outputs was satisfactory. This project is first of its kind it, through the development

of the Integrated Waste Management Model, provides a baseline for measurements in future projects. The project has the potential to engage several households, funds permitting initially and can be self sustaining in future.

Job Opportunities: The project exceeded the EPWP targets: 462 people were employed in the project of which 70% were youth (EPWP target 30%), 75% were women (EPWP target 40%), but there were no disabled employed (EPWP target 2%).

Finance (Wages): The minimum wage that was paid by EPWP was R40 per person per day. This was topped up by R25.00 by the NGO to make R65 per person per day. The project over-spent its budget by 8.5% (9% over-expenditure on manpower and 7% over-expenditure on the on materials). Although EPWP contributed 62% to the total budget, the rest was contributed by the private sector. Stricter financial control will be necessary in similar future projects.

Training: The nature of training given was quite comprehensive and provided beneficial skills to not only work on the projects but also to set up their own waste management micro-enterprises. 50 community members were trained. This amounted to 1350 training days. Two of the training courses were accredited modules in life skills. All beneficiaries also received technical training in waste sorting and river cleaning.

EPWP assumptions: the study revealed that the public sector has capacity to implement such an EPWP program. Labour-intensive methods have been embraced by the private sector in this project, limited job opportunities are available for some beneficiaries after the project, and systems are in place to check corruption at project management units. Out of 464 beneficiaries that participated in the project, about 30 (7%) have apparently found jobs after the project. Although this falls short of 10% EPWP target, it shows the potential for self-employment in this project. The labour content of the budget was 70%, which makes the project very labour-intensive. Two areas of weakness were identified, notably the partnership between public and private sectors to provide an enabling environment or to raise awareness about labour intensive methods and the capacity of SETA to deliver the relevant NQF accredited service providers.

Achievements of the project: It brought about a significant improvement in the aesthetic conditions and relief of bed environmental consequences caused by waste disposal into the river. This included: the reduction of Coli count (a measure of contamination) by 90% over three months; before and after photographs that were taken; and interviews with the community and key stakeholders. It also motivated residents to start looking for income generating opportunities within their own community that they would otherwise not attempt.

C. Areas of concern

- The situation has since regressed to the same levels one-and-a-half years after the project started. The river is as dirty as before the project was undertaken. Without attacking the root cause of polluting the river, efforts to clean the river will not be sustainable.
- The project did not recover recyclable volumes at significant levels to make an impact on poverty alleviation, in spite of the recycling potential in the Alexandra area.
- Lack of EPWP environment related training guidelines and the capacity of SETA to deliver the relevant NQF accredited service providers;
- Need for the project to have truly communal ownership.

D. Recommendations

- Owing to its job creation potential, it is recommended that the project be expanded and/or replicated, albeit using a more integrated approach. This means educating the community about the dangers of polluting the river, engineering solution to clean the river, and environmental round table meetings to secure proper community buy-in.
- It is also necessary to link with other ongoing environmental initiatives in Alexandra such as Alexandra Renewal Program, Buyisa E Bag project, and the City of Johannesburg integrated environmental action program upstream of Jukskei. After cleaning of the river, it could be used for tourism purposes and fish farming that will result in further creation jobs. This is where sustainability of project benefits can possibly come from.

(ii) SANParks Working for Water Programme at Addo Elephant National Park

The following is a summary of the WfW programme at Addo which is ongoing.

Programme/Project Summary for current Financial Year								
EPWP Category	Program Name	Prov	District Muni	Local Muni	Current Finish	Start/	Current Budget	% Spent
Environ/ Culture	SANP Addo	EC	Nelson Mandela	Sundays River	Ongoing April 05 to March 06	– FY	R1.7million	42%

Note: 16% of budget for project management and 84% of budget for operational expenses.

Because Working for Water is a multi-year programme, the period covered in this report is the current FY of the programme, which is identified as the “project”, i.e. April 2005 to March 2006.

A. Project description

The Working for Water Program (WfW) was included in the Expanded Public Works Programme when the EPWP was launched by the Department of Water and Forestry Affairs (DWAF) in February 2003 because it combines the development of communities with environmental conservation. Short-term contract jobs are created through Invasive Alien Plants (IAP) clearing activities. The MoA between DWAF and SANParks (003/2006) requires SANParks to co-ordinate, operate and maintain WfW projects on behalf of DWAF according to EPWP principles and in line with the EPWP indicators. The WfW Programme is specifically aimed at clearing invading alien plants and the control of their spread.

WfW's mission statement is: “The Working for Water programme will contribute to the sustainable prevention and control of invasive alien plants and thereby the optimising of the conservation and use of natural resources. In doing so, it will address poverty relief and promote economic empowerment and transformation within a public work's framework.” The Invasive Species Control Unit (ISCU) of SANParks controls all invasive species in the Parks. The Unit provides implementation capacity and communication between ISC projects in the field and funding organizations. The Department of Water Affairs (DWAF) through the Working for Water (WfW) programme and the Department of Environmental Affairs and Tourism (DEAT) through Projects Empowering People (PEP) are the main partners for ISCU projects, which are part of the Extended Public Works Programme (EPWP). The total budget for the 2004/05 current year is R1.7 m, which is jointly contributed by DWAF and SANParks. Program planning and implementation for the SANParks Addo programme is jointly done by the WfW/ISC.

The planning and scoping of labour intensive work in WfW is a scientific and technological process that involves the GIS facility of SANParks. It provides an accurate basis for planning task based work. How this is done could provide an input into improved task based work calculations in other EPWP sectors. The result of WfW/EPWP at Addo Elephant National Park is an exemplary demonstration of the Expanded Public Works Program. This success can be attributed to the 11 year period in which WfW has had time to develop its systems and implementation plans, the sound conceptualization and design of WfW, the political and financial commitment given to the program, modern scientific and technological support, the rigorous and regular self assessment conducted by this Unit, good training, and good community relations in the Sundays River Valley Municipality.

B. The Main Findings

Biodiversity result (Achievement): The WfW /ISCU Program has achieved notable success with results as follows: Woody Cape Nature Reserve (Addo south) has been cleared of aliens 100%; Addo central (Zuurberg region) has been 40% cleared; and Addo north (Mountain Zebra) is still outstanding for clearing. Overall eradication stands at about 30-40% for SANParks Addo: WfW/ISC. The Addo WfW/ISC program has achieved IA Plant eradication of (30-40%), increased water runoff (indeterminate), and tourism grew in 2005/6 AENP by 140 000 visitors (54% foreign). 3.52 persondays/ha is usually achieved.

Job opportunities: In all 66 jobs (soon to be 88) have been created in current 2 year contract cycle. Employment of women (av 52 %) is hampered by physically tough conditions. The youth constitute 20% of the labour force and disabled (5%).

Wages (Income creation): For the 2 years contract the wage rates vary between EPWP R43.16 – R67,50/day. Work is allocated to contractors on task-bases who in turn allocate work to their employees on task-based system.

Training: 489 person days training were achieved in the 2 year cycle. This includes both the contractors and workers. Training is offered in 2 days out of 22 days as per EPWP guidelines. Training is offered at NQF levels 1 – 5 and is accredited. Three types of training is offered: General orientation, technical and SHE training, and social interventions.

EPWP Assumptions: To some extent some of the participants appear to have found jobs although the full picture will be clearer with a more thorough longitudinal survey.

C: Areas of concern

- Unnecessary delays in payment to contractors for work completed, in turn resulting in late payment of workers.
- Unacceptably high labour turnover
- Over-burdened reporting requirements.
- Beneficiaries were concerned that no certificates were issued for the training and the quality of training, perhaps sub standard.

E Recommendations

- Although self-assessment through reporting seems well developed in the project, a study needs to be done to cut back on some reporting.
- The process followed by the SANParks Addo WfW/ISC Unit for calculating task based work and the scope of contracts should be adapted to the extent possible in other EPWP sectors.
- Training should be accredited and certificates issued by the Forestry Industry Education and Training Authority (FIET).
- Problems with late payment of contractors (and thus other project beneficiaries) should be urgently addressed.
- The WfW project should be integrated with the local government's IDP to ensure support from the Sundays River Valley Municipality and cross-integration of poverty alleviation efforts.

(iii) Gansbaai-Bredasdorp Road

The following is a summary of the Gansbaai-Bredasdorp Road which is in early implementation.

Programme/Project Summary Phase I							
EPWP Category	Program Name	Prov	Client Dept	District Muni	Current Start/ Finish	Current Budget	% Spent
Infrastructure	Gansbaai-Bredasdorp Road	W Cape	Transport & Public Works	Overberg	January 2006 to December 2007	R90 m in Ph I	R20.6 m (23%)

A. Project Description

The Gansbaai-Bredasdorp Road is a Western Cape Provincial road upgrading project located in Overberg District Municipality. It will complete a fully tarred route through the Southern Cape region which has previously been cut off from development by poor road access. This has considerable economic significance for the region. The project was conceptualized as being an EPWP anchor project on which to hang the LED plan for the area. It was commissioned on a Design and Construct tender basis with the good intention of creating a private-public initiative to enhance development impact.

It consists of road construction, through an environmentally sensitive wetland that is being recognized as a World/National Heritage Site. The total length of the project is 62 km consisting of two parts: 1st phase from Elim to Murekhaal - 24 kms and 2nd phase from Murekhaal to Uilenskhaal - 38 kms. Implementation started in January 2006 with a project budget of R195 million for Phases I and II. The amount of R90m recorded in the EPWP database is the budget for Phase I.

The road traverses expansive clays and the road bed has to be excavated and filled with material that is transported in dump trucks from the borrow pits. This immediately imposes a constraint on its potential to be a labour intensive project. The Design and Construct tender process failed to elicit from the private sector any further labour intensive responses to this challenge. To enhance both its contribution to integrated economic development and to qualify as an EPWP project, the project is loaded with non-construction training that focuses on the farming, fishing, and tourism sectors including 200 Learnerships. There is also a job placement service.

There is disagreement in the Western Cape Provincial Government about whether this is in fact an EPWP project or not. In addition, the District Municipality and others have questioned why the Provincial roads department is involved not only in road construction but in non-construction training for income generation and job placement/SMME development for those exiting the programme. Phase II is not proceeding on this basis.

B. The Main Findings

Job Opportunities: Eight months through implementation the project employs 153 people in the construction sector. This means 19 278 person-days have effectively been achieved for 14 kilometer of the road constructed. This equates to 2602 person-days per kilometer which is less than 3 000 person-days per kilometer that is typical of some labour-intensive roads. This makes the operation quite machine-intensive. Females constitute 8% of the labour force which falls short of EPWP target of 40%. The potential for employment creation for the road construction is quite limited as they budgeted for 9% on labour cost and currently working on 3% (EPWP target is 30%).

Wages: Wage payment is based on the Sectoral Determination Act and the minimum wage is R10.27 per hour. This translates to R 82.16 per day for trainees who work for 8 hours a day and R 97.57 per day for the workers most of who work 9.5 hours per day. This is relatively higher than minimum wages in several EPWP projects. The project uses both task-based (payment related to output of work) and time-based systems (daily payments).

Training: The project is unusual in that it has a Training College on site but has not yet provided the evaluation team with its Training Plan. The training programme includes construction, non-construction, and life skills, with the contractor involved in both construction and non-construction learnerships. It is unclear why the contractor should be involved in non-construction learnerships. It appears that the EPWP training strategy has been distorted on this project. The project spends 6% on training budget which is in excess of the once debated DPW

limit of 5%. CETA has also reneged on its promise of funding of R6 million for training placing the roads department in the position of having to make good R4 million of the training budget from the roads budget (DoL provided the other R2 million).

EPWP assumptions: Judging from labour cost perspective (spending only 3% on labour), location of borrow pits that necessitates material haulage by dumper trucks, and the fact that labour has to be transported, it has more inclination towards machine intensity and can at best be classified as labour-enhanced. It is not in fact a labour-intensive project.

C. Areas of Concern

- There is a question mark whether roads project should involve non-construction activities. We think this project is more of an LED project. We think EPWP projects should not be required to solve the community's social problems and certainly, would not be burdened with non-construction training (apart from some simple life skills).
- It is unclear why the contractor should be involved in non-construction learnerships. It appears that the training strategy has been contorted on this project.
- Judging from labour cost perspective, spending only 3% on labour is quite worrying and makes the project very machine intensive. Job opportunities are bound to be very limited.

D. Major recommendations

1. It is recommended that the Provincial Road Department focus on the road construction and shift the responsibility for the non-construction aspect together with the non-construction training to the municipality since they have the requisite expertise and funding to run LED projects. This must be integrated into the municipal development plan.
2. A Project Steering Committee with provincial membership is suggested to guide the project implementation of the non-construction components if shifted to the municipality.
3. The blanket approach of applying EPWP to all projects in Western Cape should be reviewed as some projects may not qualify.
4. It is recommended that the road construction project be classified as machine-intensive, not labour-intensive. At best labour can be used to enhance the operation.

(iv) Hlabisa Hospital

The following is a summary of the Hlabisa Hospital project, Phase I.

Programme/Project Summary Phase I						
Program or Project Name	Prov	Node and District Muni Name	Local Name and Dept	Muni and Start & Finish Dates	Project Budget	% budget spent
Hlabisa Hospital Project: Revitalisation & Construction to District Hospital Standard	KZN	Mkhanyakude & Hlabisa Municipalities	Hlabisa: KZN DoH & DPW. Implementer: IDT	10 Nov 04 to Dec 06	Estimated: R95.4m; Approved: R85m Spent: R69m	91%

Contract No. WCS 027026/0001

A. Project description

The National Department of Health (NDoH) ten-point plan emphasizes both the revitalization of hospital services and Primary Health Care Clinics. In line with this and in terms of the KZN Strategic Position Statement Model (SPSM), priority is being given to Hlabisa Hospital - its buildings, maintenance and equipment. The Hlabisa Hospital Construction programme consists of two Phases (projects).

Phase I started in 2004 as a Presidential Lead Project of the Kwazulu-Natal Department of Health (KZ-N DoH), Department of Public Works (DPW) and the Independent Development Trust (IDT). It was aimed at revitalizing the old Mission Hospital in the Health District of DC27, Umkhanyakude. This phase was not designed as an EPWP Project since it started before the EPWP was operational. However Phase I of the Hlabisa Hospital project is on the EPWP database. Phase II has to do with hospital Revitalization and Upgrade Project Description. The Phase II objective has become one of constructing new facilities or refurbishing certain parts of the old Hospital to become a 296 bed, District Hospital with "step down" capacity for 600 and 17 rural clinics. Planning for the second phase is well underway. A separate tender will be advertised shortly.

Grinaker, LTA and SMS were appointed in a Joint Venture from 23 November 04 to August 06 for Phase 1. The Independent Development Trust (IDT) was appointed as the Implementing Agent, responsible for managing the implementation of the project and the quality assurance of all the work performed by the contractors. The anticipated final value of the project is R 69,487.72 (Phase I). Phase I preceded the EPWP, but the project has been notably successful with labour enhancement and with good project management and teamwork, attributable to excellent cooperation between, IDT, PSC, hospital management, consultants and contractors. Although Phase 1 was not planned as EPWP project, a number of EPWP objectives were adopted and achieved by contractors. Phase II is about to start with EPWP objectives & methods planned in.

B. The Main Findings

Achievements of Project Objectives: One notable achievement is excellent Teamwork and Project Management which allowed a conventional construction project to espouse EPWP principles, methods and standards. In future such projects should be planned against these principles, methods and standards. The project was completed within budget to quality standard within 24 instead of the planned 36 Months. This was achieved despite political maneuvering for position in the PSC. Phase I is virtually complete with Phase II (all EPWP) ready to start. The result of Hlabisa Hospital Phase I is a successful case of good project implementation management by an implementing team comprised of the Independent Development Trust (IDT) as Implementing Agent, the consultant and the contractor consortium.

Job Creation: As at July 2006, 1089 job opportunities were created; of these 20.8% were women, 43.6% were youth and 0.4% were disabled. The project engaged 18 local contractors as well.

Finances: As at July 2006, i.e., 20 months through the project of 36 months duration, an amount of R69 487.79 has been spent relative to the approved budget of R85 (91% spent). The project hopes to be completed in December 2006 (12 months ahead of schedule). R 3,136,785 was spent on labour this constituting 4.5% of the actual expenditure of R 69.5 million.

Skills Development/Training. 60 local trainees were identified and have completed their training in: Bricklaying (12), Carpentry (12), Plastering (12), Plumbing (12), Painting (16). They obtained NQF Certificates. 15 local youth were given Institutional Training by DoL and the main contractor has trained a number of local workers on site. But the CETA was not involved. The wage rate is R46.50 per day, which the beneficiaries complain about saying that it is simply inadequate.

C. Areas of Concern

- Problems experienced with lack of integrated development planning for the scope of the project included: the upgrading of other roads in the District is needed to improve access and speed for emergency vehicles, bulk supply of both water and electricity are urgently needed, and the site limitations and congestion including an old on-site cemetery that could not be re-located for cultural reasons.
- It is not fully understood why only 20% of those employed were women or why no women were appointed in management positions.
- Hospital Management complained about escalating electrical and water costs resulting from the construction.
- Certificates of service at the end of the contract not issued.
- Despite the growth reported in the town, there is still a real scarcity of jobs in the area.
- There is a need to revise the wage rate and the task- based pay should be based on the difficulty/arduousness of the task performed.
- The six months employment provides a limited exposure to construction as a profession and less benefits on the Unemployment Insurance fund.

D. Recommendations

- The Provincial infrastructure should be upgraded to ensure improved speed of movement and wear and tear on emergency vehicles. Main and transverse access roads.
- Bulk water and electricity provision should become a priority issue to service the reticulation requirements of the hospital. This should be taken up with the provincial government, particularly as it will involve ESKOM and other government departments.
- Serious consideration should be given to meeting the gender/youth/disabled quotas.
- Despite EPWP rates being low, consideration could be given to introducing a graduated travel allowance for those forced to commute from a distance.

(v) Jukskei Environmental Rehabilitation

The following is a summary of the Jukskei River Rehabilitation Program

Programme/Project Summary								
EPWP Category	Program Name	Prov	Client Dept	District Muni	Current Start/ Finish	Current Budget	% Spent	
Environmental & Infrastructure	Jukskei River Rehabilitation	Gauteng	Alex Renewal Program for Johannesburg City	Alexandria	2001 to 2006	R38. m	100%	

A. Programme Description

The Jukskei River Environmental Rehabilitation project is an environmental project that was undertaken in the greater Alexandra area (including Malboro, Wynberg and Bramley) between 2001 and 2006. The aim was to rehabilitate and reinstate the environment of the Jukskei River floodplain with specific objectives to: relocate some of the residents from the floodplain following flooding of the Jukskei River in 2000; remove rubble from the Jukskei River; trim the river banks; construct gabions to stabilise the banks; and grass the banks using a phased approach. Another parallel mini-project was the upgrading the sewers that enter the Jukskei River.

The project was part of the bigger programme of fixing the embankment of the Jukskei River and its tributaries.

- The components (relocation, rubble removal, river bank stabilisation) were not done on EPWP principles and were not classified as such ("Non-EPWP" projects). In fact some preceded the EPWP.
- Upgrading of the sewers that enter the Jukskei River was a typical EPWP project.

This report covers both aspects of the programme, non-EPWP and EPWP.

The projects made use of the service of several local small contractors as well as local labour. The project linked with Local Economic Development (LED) in terms of upgrading and providing better service to the residents. The Alexandra Renewal Program (ARP) was responsible for the section of the river in the vicinity of Alexandra whilst the City of Johannesburg was responsible for the other parts. There was no well-defined scheduling for the Non-EPWP aspects of the project, contrary to the EPWP component (Sewer upgrade) that was properly planned, scheduled, and implemented according to normal project management principles. Contractors in the Non-EPWP components were sometimes compelled to halt work due to cash flow problems and to pick it up again when payment was being made. This makes the EPWP approach a good project management strategy relative to the Non EPWP projects.

B. The Main Findings

Job Opportunities: A total of 40 612 person-days were used for the project with distribution as follows: Cleaning- 2772, Trimming – 5280, and Sewer 32,560.

Training: There were 4 weeks per phase of training for the two phases (Phase 1 of the project lasted for 22 weeks and Phase 2 lasted for 15 weeks) for the sewer upgrade component. This equates to 1,600 training person days. Training was not emphasized in the Non EPWP components.

Finances: Generally actual expenditures in all components of the project compared favorably with the budget. Financial management was rated 100% by the project implementers, an indication of a very satisfactory performance.

Outputs: The rubble removal component of the project exceeded the target by 13% whilst there was 30% under-performance (behind target) in the trimming and gabion construction component. The practical completion certificate has still not been issued by ARP as the final reports have not been done by the consultant despite the fact that the project was completed in 2003. On the EPWP components or Sewer upgrade, targets set were achieved. The overall goal of the project of relocating all the residents and rehabilitating the area was not achieved, as some residents could not be relocated due to the shortage of land.

Quality of Assets: The quality of assets created was all good. The type of grass planted (kikuyu) instead of indigenous grass, is problematic as it is difficult to manage. Vertical walls in some of the bends where erosion is very pronounced can increase the speed of flow and risk of flooding.

Community empowerment: The community was empowered through retained earnings. Local small contractors have also been used. Nonetheless the empowerment effect was not that great as the project was too small and too short.

Outcomes: The main Outcomes were achieved: river cleaned of rubble, employment for previously unemployed (and never employed) people, retained earnings to the local community, stable and safe river banks, and upgraded sewers. Other unintended outcomes included improved community cohesion but increased travel costs for the few previously employed as a result of the relocation.

Expansion/Replicability: There is limited room for expansion of all programme components in the short-term. In the long term, maintenance of the assets created, such as grassing offers additional employment opportunities. The experience gained in relocating people can be useful in allocating RDP houses constructed under the Department of Housing strategy.

C. Areas of concern

For such a project to attain maximum success some of the main challenges may need to be addressed. These relate to delayed payment by the client, very small budget (this being the result of using unspent/surplus funds from government department), lack of EPWP specific training for the project implementers, collaboration between various project implementers and among tiers of government, illegal dumping into the Jukskei River, and short employment periods. loss of jobs of some of those who were relocated is causes for concern.

D. Major Recommendations

It is recommended that:

- project implementers – project managers, contractors and the local government representative running future projects be properly trained in labour-intensive methods;
- government departments think carefully about the projects they take on board, plan properly for such projects and mainstream the projects in their normal budget rather than funding from surplus (unspent) budget;
- the employment duration for EPWP projects be extended from three to minimum six months, increase training periods and focus more on technical training to enhance the post-program employment opportunities and self-employment of the participants;
- the project be expanded but with an integrated approach that addresses critical implementation challenges;
- free dumping sites be provided or premiums for dumping industrial waste be reduced, with education and law enforcement to combat illegal dumping in the Jukskei river;
- tender documentation and processes be kept as simple and flexible as possible to enable small contractors to respond more easily.

(vi) Makwane Road Project

The following is a summary of the Makwane Road project, Phase I.

Programme/Project Summary Phase I						
Program or Project Name	Prov	Node and District Muni Name	Local Name and Muni and Dept	Start & Finish Dates	Project Budget	% budget spent
Makwane Access Road	Free State	Thabo Mafutsani DM	Maluthi-a-Phofung	February to Nov 2006	R50m	

The Makwane Road Project was selected by the Free State Department of Public Works, Roads and Transport as a project lying within a designated presidential node. The project consists of upgrading of 13kms of existing gravel road to a segmented block paving surface. Roads S1499 (3,5kms) and S1500 (9,5kms) have been constructed with a budget of approximately R50 million rand. The guidelines of the Expanded Public Works Programme form a vital element of the entire project. To cater for small Contractors (SMME development) the entire project was unbundled into 19 contracts with an average value of R2,77 million. The average contract duration is 6 months. The work was undertaken by 27 learner Contractors (engaged under the EPWP Learnership Programme) some of whom worked in joint ventures on the 19 contracts. The primary objective is to create a useful asset being a 13km of 8m wide surfaced road. The method of achieving this objective is through a labour-intensive approach using small local Contractors. As part of the objective, training and skills transfer has been achieved.

The project has undoubtedly produced a useful asset using labour-intensive methods. The project carries approval of a wide range of stakeholders and is seen as a more than satisfactory outcome of an EPWP initiative. Training has been provided, skills have been transferred and the ability of those involved to move onto other employment has undoubtedly been enhanced. The design approach in the documentation appears to have been informed by the "Guidelines for the Implementation of Labour-Intensive Infrastructure Projects under the Expanded Public Works Programme" and is thereby more closely aligned to the objectives of the EPWP. Stakeholder response has, by and large, been positive and for those who understand the implication, the EPWP has been credited. The fact that a task rate was set (by the Project Steering Committee presumably at the request of the Public Body) and that this task rate was accepted by the community and adhered to throughout the contract is a very positive issue.

B. The Main Findings

Job Opportunities: It is reported that to date approximately 220 000 person days of employment opportunities have been created. This is at a reported cost of R10 million. This roughly aligns with the statement that the task rate (included in the contract documentation) set by the Public Body (in this case the Project Steering Committee) is R40 per task ($220\ 000 \times 40 = R8,8$). No explanation has been given as to the variances, but it may be attributed to a higher task rate for certain categories of skilled workers. On average, a reported average of 684 people will be employed each day on the project which has a duration of 8,9 months (included an extension of time granted by the Engineer). Taken together with the training and skills transfer, this is a fairly significant achievement.

Training: As part of the objective, training and skills transfer has been achieved. Participants have been prepared to participate in the economy through training and experience which aligns them with the market economy and provides them with the ability and confidence to obtain other employment opportunities, both for themselves and for their employees. Formal training has been specified and has been carried out by accredited trainers. It is reported that 15 of the 27 training modules required by the learner Contractors have been completed and that an aggregate 2 176 formal training days have been attended by the trainees. In addition, it is reported that general life skills training has been imparted to approximately 200 people. This does not comply completely with the Guidelines which state that every person working on an EPWP project is entitled to 2 days training per month of work. Generally the respondents (workers) did not receive formal training and that training received was very specific (edge beams, bricks).

Quality of Assets: The professionals involved have provided evidence that a high quality of asset was created and that full quality control was consistently implemented. This appears to be so. It is obvious that this type of project lends itself to labour-intensive construction and the outcome should be predictably good, this appears to be the case in Manakwe road project. Analysis of the responses from interviewees indicates their satisfaction. It must however be noted that few of the respondees are technically qualified and their assessment is, at best, subjective. Satisfaction with the product is widespread amongst the interviewees.

Community empowerment: Undoubtedly capacity has been created within the learner Contractors undergoing the training and mentorship in terms of the learnership programme. In addition, community leaders, and in particular Councillors, have been capacitated through the identification, approval of the scope of the works and many issues such as labour selection and serving on the Project Steering Committee. Insufficient data is available to quantify this capacity building.

Expansion/Replicability: EPWP assumptions on SETA and NQF accredited services providers having capacity to deliver training and the project providing skills to enable participants exit into opportunities were found to be valid. This may perhaps be due to the learnerships that are very well coordinated relative to other non-learnership projects. Areas of concern relate to the capacity of public and private sector to implement programs and the private and public sector embracing labour-intensive approaches.

Expansion/Replicability: The project could undoubtedly be expanded and invariably the respondents stated that the project was too short. The implication is that the project could be expanded and would definitely be welcomed in the community. The positive input which has been reported on the part of the local politician is a definite plus and comments regarding the growth of friendship and community awareness.

C. Areas of Concern

- Training required as a pre-requisite for involvement in the EPWP, particularly on the part of the professionals, appears to have been lacking.
- There are some inconsistencies in the contract and, in particular, some contradictions, indicate that the professionals preparing the document did not have proper training.
- The fact that only 25% that was paid to labour indicates that the design was not particularly labour friendly.
- The interview results showed the poorest perception in respect of Labour Intensive Methods an indication that the LI concept was not well understood or received.

D. Recommendations

- 1) Training of all involved in a delivery programme such as the Makwane Road must be a legal requirement of those Consultants and Contractors being appointed .
- 2) A specific mandatory requirement of all appointments should be that information required for monitoring and evaluation of projects must be provided to appointed third parties on request.
- 3) Project selection needs to focus on the types of work which maximise employment opportunities.
- 4) Formal method of estimating the amount of labour and the cost thereof such as team balancing must be agreed and used to inform all involved as to what to expect and what can be achieved.

(vii) The Kgalagadi Transfrontier Park Access Road

The following is a summary of the Kgalagadi Transfrontier Park Access Road

Programme/Project Summary							
EPWP Category	Program Name	Prov	Client Dept	District Muni	Current Start/ Finish	Current Budget	% Spent
Infrastructure	The Kgalagadi Transfrontier Park Access Road	Northern Cape	Siyanda District Municipality	Siyanda District Municipality	2004 to 2007	R 44.2 m	18%

A. Programme Description

The Kgalagadi Transfrontier Park access road was designed in 1994 for military purposes. It was initially designed as conventional machine-intensive road and not labour-intensive. It was planned to employ 371 people but was later revised to 273. There were problems with the initial planning. In 2004 Kwezi V3 compiled a business plan for the 60km long access road to the Kgalagadi Trans Frontier Park to provide road infrastructure 60km from Andriesvale to Twee Rivieren. This was approved by the Northern Cape Tourism Association. EPWP then got involved. Construction began in late 2004. The first two kilometres of the road was constructed entirely by hand but had to change to machines due to the slow pace of work. To date 10.5 km of the road has been tarred of which 8.5km was machine-intensive. Workers are transported to work from a camp located at the beginning of the road. This is followed by the transportation of tools, which make workers wait for the tools before they can start work. The total budget is R 44.2 Million. The national Department of Environment and Tourism provided R38 Million (86%) whilst the remaining R6.2 Million (14%) is funded by the Provincial Department of Roads. Effectively workers work six days per week. One day is spent on traveling from and to Upington. Prior to this road project, the unemployment rate in some of the communities was as high as 90% but has been dramatically reduced as a result of the project. Despite the fact that this project was originally designed to be constructed conventionally, albeit using an enhanced number of labourers, the conversion to a labour intensive construction project in terms of the EPWP can be regarded as being relatively successful. It is obvious that few, if any, of the original design professionals or representatives of the implementing agency had had adequate training in labour intensive methods when they embarked on the project. The contract documentation apparently does not clearly set out what has to be recorded and reported and as a result, information was not readily available.

B. The Main Findings

Job opportunities: The project was initially designed to use machine-intensive methods and to employ 60 people. The change over to labour-intensive construction demanded employing 300 people (5 times the original number). The objectives of the project were revised accordingly. The delay caused by the change over together with other factors resulted in 50% increase in cost (R6 m to R12.8m). It has not been easy to find labour either. Material haulage from borrow pits located at distances of 7 and 13 km have of necessity had to be done by truck, instead of hand as planned. These issues began to raise concern in the provincial roads department as a result of which they started considering abandoning the labour-intensive operation and to change to machine intensive operations.

Training/Capacity building: Workers are trained in both technical and life skills with more emphasis on technical training. The service provider issues certificates of attendance but the course is not SETA accredited, which places a question mark on the worth of the certificates issued. Nonetheless, --- the current employment period (2 year employment period) will assist participants acquire enough experience to be able to gain employment after the program.

Project design, effectiveness and quality of Assets/service: The finding is that the quality of the road completed thus far appears to be entirely acceptable. In particular the large culvert near the beginning of the road is well constructed and the protection of the embankments with hardpan ferricrete (rip rap) is very well done. Great difficulty was apparently experienced with getting the layers to optimum moisture content for compaction

purposes. As far as it could be observed, proper compaction was achieved, but the current procedure of compacting the shoulders of the road in their dry state appears to be a waste of time and effort. Although the finish looks good when it is done, there is no binding in the material and it will simply erode, either through wind or water. The problem of having to import suitable aggregate from great distances was emphasized as was the cost thereof.

Replicability / Expansion of project: Given the facts that: labour has to be transported over long distance, the borrow pits are far removed necessitating that material haulage can only be by trucks and not by labour, lack of water for construction, high unit cost of operation, and low productivity, replication or expansion may not be a viable option.

Benefit to community and level of community involvement: Benefits to the community has included employment opportunities as there are not much economic activities in the surrounding communities. Unlike other EPWP projects with six months employment cycle, the duration of the duration of employment is two years which is very long compared to other EPWP projects. The road offer potential for tourism development in the area.

EPWP Assumptions: The contractor interviewed holds the following views about the EPWP: the capacity of the public and private sector stakeholders to implement EPWP and that of SETA to deliver on accredited training is still lacking; the private sector is gradually embracing labour-intensive methods, albeit at a very slow pace; funding has not been released for EPWP projects in the way that it should be; corruption risk at municipal level could still be a problem; and awareness about the EPWP is gradually building up.

C. Areas of Concern

- 1) The lack of conveniently located workers willing and able to work on the project.
- 2) The lack of road building material amenable to labour intensive techniques.
- 3) The lack of water along the route.
- 4) The lack of suitable support structures and, in particular, trainers in the area to transfer skills to the learner Contractors.
- 5) The inadequate budget.

D. Recommendations

1. It is recommended that the thorough examination of the existing resources, including the budget, be undertaken as a matter of urgency and that a winding down of the labour-intensive component of the construction of this road be immediately embarked upon due to the anticipated huge cost implications.
2. A suitable target might well be to complete the first 20kms of the road using the current (altered from the original) construction techniques to provide at least continuing temporary employment for those employed, but the project should then be converted to capital intensive construction methods, funds permitting. If this option is taken consideration regarding the acceptability of a camp further to the north for those labourers staying on site would have to be considered as would the logistics of transporting the "local labour" up the road to where they would be working.

(viii) Ntsikeni Access Road and Ntsikeni Nature reserve Access Road in the Alfred Nzo ISRDP

The study involved two linked rural road projects in Alfred Nzo ISRDP Node, designed to promote economic development through eco-tourism and improved community local access. They are the Ntsikeni Access Road and the Ntsikeni Nature Reserve Access Road. The first is only partially labour intensive (labour enhanced) and the second is fully labour intensive.

Ntsikeni Roads: Comparison of Efficiency and Effectiveness

Key EPWP concepts	Access Road	Nature Reserve Road
District	Alfred Nzo	Alfred Nzo
Local Municipality & Dept	Umzimvubu; Dept of Roads	Mzimkhulu; DEAT
Start & Finish	22 November - Date	June 04 – Nov 05
Budget	R 4.8 Million	R2.78 m
% Budget Spent	80%	100%
Construction method	Labour enhancing	Labour intensive
Contractor	External private sector service provider	Ntsikeni Community Trust external project manager
Construction plant	2 dump trucks & an excavator, TLB, grader, water truck, & roller (1 ea)	1 compactor
Road distance	9,6 + 20 kms	12,4 kms
Road standard	public gravel road	4x4 tourist road
Project duration	7 months est	9 months
Rand/work opportunity	R20,339	R15,275

A. Programme Description

Project 1: Ntsikeni Access Road

The Ntsikeni Access Road involved rehabilitation and gravelling of a 9,6 km stretch of access road to the gate of the Ntsikeni Reserve and other local community access roads of 20 km making a total 29,6 km. It is a full gravel road for all classes of vehicle, with good drainage. The project started in December 2005 and is scheduled to be completed in August 2007. 73% of the total budget of R4.8 million has been spent. The public body is Eastern Cape Department of Roads and Public Works, Alfred Nzo District, Kokstad. This project is registered as an EPWP project but is only partially a labour intensive (LI) project. For this project the study found out that as at 30/6/06 236 jobs had been created of which 121 were youth (51%: 84 young men & 37 young women), 14 women (6%), 99 men (42%), 2 disabled youth (1%). These people worked for 132 days – each worker working 10 days each to spread the work. The wage rate is R80/day for bricklayers to R60/day for watchmen. The study found that:

- Overall planning of construction appears to have been done well.
- Drainage was well planned. This will reduce required maintenance in the rains
- Too few CETA training courses were provided for the needy. Nonetheless, workers seem to have been well trained despite lack of CETA and Dept of Labour courses.
- The project seems to be running well, on time and with good results/output.
- The design, workmanship and drainage all appear to be good.
- EPWP principles are observed but the main part of the project was capital intensive. However, skills were found and taught.

Ntsikeni Nature Reserve Access Road

This involved the construction of 12,4 km of gravel road and tracks within the Ntsikeni Nature Reserve to give access to 2 new tourist lodges. This was intended as an all weather 4 x 4 road. This project started in June 2004 and completed in November 2005. The public body was Department of Economic Development, Alfred Nzo District Municipality, Mount Ayliffe. The main beneficiaries are Malenge Communities, Umzimkulu and the Mabandla Communities, Umzimkulu. The budget of R2,8 m was allocated by MIG Ntsikeni, all of which was

spent. R521,835.00 (27% of construction budget) was spent on local labour for 10,097 person/days of work. The wage rates of workers were R45 per task/day and supervisors R65 per day. The project involved training of learner contractors (emerging small contractors) as well. Overall planning of construction appears to have been done well. The study found the following.

- Virtually all work has been LI with minimal environmental impact.
- The project was well managed project.
- Camber may result in vehicles sliding off the road meaning ongoing maintenance with gravel may be necessary.
- signage on the roads is inadequate this justifying the need to create signage to direct visitors.
- The design, workmanship and drainage for a 4x4 road appear to meet the requirement.

B. Other Important findings for the two Projects

For the two projects, good quality roads were built. Institutional involvement of the province and the Alfred Nzo District Municipality was weak except from the Economic sector. Private sector commitment to the success of EPWP in these projects was strong. Community participation and enthusiasm was very strong. Training was provided but not supported by CETA and not accredited. No Learnerships were registered by the Department of Labour. Some workers have been taken on by the contractor and some have been empowered to leave the area in search of more work. Despite some weaknesses the EPWP projects were a success. Stakeholders' involvement has been one of the strengths in these projects. *The project proved that this was not the case as they were able to complete the project at approximately 75% of the cost of a conventional project.*

C. Areas of Concern

- Two matters for urgent attention by the EPWP are: the problem of scoping task based work and tendering that is more accessible to communities. There is no consistency in the duration of the task.
- R45 per task/day for the Nature Reserve Road Project needs to be reviewed as a one day task that takes three days yields only R15 per day – a cause of some dissatisfaction.
- There was no involvement of the district municipality for a project that was aimed at developing and testing systems and approaches as the basis for designing future projects;
- Finding labour has been difficult due to: the perception that the work is too hard to be done by hand; and such work is "below their standards" for most youth who were matriculants;
- The CETA and the Department of Labour did not play their assigned roles.

D. Major Recommendations

- The development of a planned maintenance plan is now urgently needed and budget must be set aside for maintaining the access roads.
- There is a need for identification of local institutions that can offer technical training and EPWP training within the regions.
- Municipalities must be informed about and maintain a record of projects using EPWP approaches, including a current database of EPWP projects and persons trained on EPWP.
- CETA and Department of Labour shortcomings in providing support to EPWP need to be investigated and dealt with urgently.
- There is need to revisit the task-based pay approach so that it tallies with the effective labor rate.

(ix) The Metropolitan Gateways and Beautification Project

The following is a summary of the Metropolitan Gateways and Beautification Project

Programme/Project Summary							
EPWP Category	Program Name	Prov	Client Dept	District Muni	Current Start/ Finish	Current Budget	% Spent
Environmental	Metropolitan Gateways and Beautification Project	Eastern Cape	DEAT	Nelson Mandela Metro Municipality	1 Dec2004 to March 2007	R 23m	65%

A. Programme Description

The Metropolitan Gateways and Beautification Project ('the project') is an environmental sector EPWP project being implemented in Nelson Mandela Metro Municipality (NMMM) by Afri-Coast Engineers (Afri-Coast). The Department of Environmental Affairs and Tourism (DEAT) is the sole funder of the project, providing R23 million. NMMM, particularly the Environmental Services Business Unit, plays an advisory role on the project. Begun in December 2004, the project is scheduled to conclude in March 2007. The project is roughly 65% complete. Because seven months of the project still remain, this completion report is accordingly only a preliminary document.

The principal aim of the project is to develop and beautify the gateways/entrances to NMMM, as well as main routes within the metro and points of interest adjacent to these routes. The project is thus decentralised in nature; there are multiple work sites spread across the metro. The four primary work sites are Beachfront, M4 Settlers Freeway, Uitenhage Roads, and the N2. Main elements of the work at the Beachfront site have been sand dune restoration and the construction of a pedestrian walkway. This portion of the project has been significantly praised and is 95% complete. Major project deliverables already completed include dune restoration on Pollock Beach, beautification of Allister Miller Drive near the airport, and partial beautification of the M17 and North End Cemetery. The quality of all of the assets created and services delivered by the project is generally high, but the dune restoration at Pollock Beach is particularly noteworthy and has received significant praise from the municipality, the general public, and others. The project is currently employing 369 people and it is estimated that about 200 more will be employed before the project concludes. Already, 55,910 person days of labour have been remunerated by the project.

B. The Main Findings

Objectives: The chief objective of the project—the beautification of gateways to the metro and other strategic places—has been partially met by the project thus far. The objective for the beachfront has been met, but progress at other work sites has been slower. Afri-Coast has adapted its plans many times already and with only seven months left until the project concludes there is not any time for delay. Because quantitative targets for outputs were not agreed to when the project was initiated, there is nothing solid to measure progress against.

Job Opportunities: As at 31 July 2006 396 people have been employed. Beneficiaries are happy to be receiving a daily wage and at the same time tangibly altering the face of the metro. Some beneficiaries complain about the physical nature of the work. However, the beneficiaries' greatest wish by far is for the daily wage to be increased. On the basis of the interviews conducted with beneficiaries, it seems apparent that most of the beneficiaries employed on the project were not chronically unemployed before the project, but had a work history. Beneficiaries' average period of unemployment before joining the project was about six months. This finding has important implications for exit opportunities, as it seems that the project is being utilized by beneficiaries who have a work history but have suffered through periods of unemployment as opposed to the chronically unemployed.

Finance: The total budget of the project is R23 m. 65% through the project only 37% of the budget has been spent. This means the project is currently significantly under budget. This could also signal evidence of under-budgeting albeit could not be verified in this assignment. Having a single funder (DEAT) is a definite advantage

as reporting and coordination are streamlined. Afri-Coast is currently discussing with DEAT the possibility of extending the project. The original wage rate was R40/day but increased to R45/day. Beneficiaries are not happy with this low wage rate.

Training: Training has not been made the priority that it should be. Most key informants don't seem to know anything substantial about how and why certain training courses are offered. It is true that there are a limited number of accredited training providers in the area, but even given this constraint, the project's training offerings could and should be improved and managed better. Much of the training budget has yet to be spent, which presents an opportunity to change course over the remainder of the project and provide training that is directly applicable to the work beneficiaries are performing on the project and/or the local labour market.

EPWP Assumptions: The project has reinforced some EPWP assumptions and called others into question. EPWP assumptions about labour-intensity and an enabling environment have been more or less supported by the experience of the Metropolitan Gateways and Beautification Project. Achievement of the Other EPWP assumptions (that private and public sector stakeholders have the management, technical, and financial capacity to effectively implement EPWP projects and that at least 10% will find jobs) could be problematic.

Project Design, Effectiveness, and Quality of Assets/Services: The project has benefited from the enthusiasm of the three main project partners—Afri-Coast, DEAT, and NMMM. The quality of the assets and services delivered by the project has been generally high, although not always in accordance with agreed-to timelines and work plans. The beautification of the beachfront has been especially praised.

C. Areas of Concern

- Communication difficulties between Afri-Coast and NMMM.
- Lack of capacity in Afri-Coast and NMMM.
- The project is not being managed as efficiently as it should be due to the newness of the EPWP and the inherent difficulty of coordinating a project involving many organisations.
- Absenteeism amongst the work force.
- Integrating the community into the project in a meaningful way.
- Lack of rain prompted water restrictions and halted the planting of trees. Flooding delayed work at Tiger Bay.

D. Recommendations

- The project should attempt to give beneficiaries the broadest and deepest work experience by rotating beneficiaries within and between worksites
- Appoint a Training Manager who must develop a comprehensive training strategy.
- Quarterly steering committee meetings should be held between Afri-Coast, DEAT, and NMMM.
- Reporting requirements must be clearly delineated and agreed to between project partners before project commencement. The lines of reporting and authority must be clarified.
- Assumptions about both the capacity of project stakeholders and the percentage of exiting beneficiaries absorbed by the labour market should be tested further, drawing on the results of other EPWP projects.

(ix) The Motherwell Greening Project

The following is a summary of the Motherwell Greening Project

Programme/Project Summary							
EPWP Category	Program Name	Prov	Client Dept	District Muni	Current Start/ Finish	Current Budget	% Spent
Environmental	Motherwell Greening Project	Eastern Cape	DEAT	Nelson Mandela Metro Municipality	1 Dec2004 to March 2007	R 9m	65%

A. Programme Description

The Motherwell Greening Project, commenced in late 2004, and is being implemented by Afri-Coast Engineers, an engineering firm from the private sector, with the support and endorsement of the Department of Environmental Affairs and Tourism (DEAT) and the NMMM. The completion date is 31 March 2007. DEAT is the sole funder. The project is being implemented in Motherwell, a dormitory township 25km to the north of Port Elizabeth. A report on LED strategies conducted about the same time as the project commenced indicated that Motherwell is characterised by an unemployment rate in excess of 50% and low rate of participation in the economy. The project's primary objective is therefore to stimulate local economic development and tourism in Motherwell, with the effect of reducing the abject poverty experienced by the community.

The project entails the greening of public open spaces, planting trees along major transport routes, litter collection, building pedestrian pathways in Motherwell Peace Park, fencing the Motherwell Cemetery, clearing of bush, and other tasks. The Motherwell Peace Park and Greening project seeks to overhaul the environmental degradation that characterises Motherwell while creating temporary employment opportunities for beneficiaries and thereby increase the chances of their employability after the project. The project currently employs 122 beneficiaries who are generally very happy with their involvement in the project as evidenced by the fact that almost all of the current beneficiaries have been employed since project inception. The community is also pleased with the project, as it has delivered high quality environmental assets and services to an area in which they were severely lacking. Caveats aside, the overall impact on beneficiaries and the local community is highly positive and the project is worthy of expansion and/or replication.

B. The Main Findings

Objectives/Delivery: The finding is that the project is delivering on its intended outputs. The project has significantly, tangibly benefited the community by creating a large number of temporary work opportunities and providing environmental services and assets. The level of meaningful community involvement has not been especially noteworthy. Most members of the community do support the work the project is doing but are not meaningfully involved in determining what work the project undertakes. A website has been developed that describes the history and objectives of the project as well as the roles of Afri-Coast, DEAT, and NMMM.

Job Opportunities: The project has provided well over one hundred job opportunities to residents of Motherwell. The decentralised nature of the work sites and the outsourcing of recruitment to the Ward Councillors' offices have helped to ensure geographical spread of job opportunities. The implementer should be commended for its facilitating role in bringing such a large mass of job opportunities to Motherwell. The focus should now include not just breadth of job opportunities but depth of job opportunities. Beneficiaries should be given work assignments that are as challenging as possible in order to maximise work experience and encourage upskilling.

Finance: The total budget for the project is R 9 M. The wage rate is R40/day, which participants appear very unhappy about.

Training: A critical weakness of the Motherwell Greening Project is the neglect of the formulation and implementation of a comprehensive training programme for beneficiaries. There is nearly unanimous agreement amongst beneficiaries that Afri-Coast does not adequately consult with them regarding what they want to be trained in and how they might link their training to a job opportunity when the projects concludes. This deficiency

must be rectified if the project is to succeed in leaving a legacy of increased skills, capacity, and employability in beneficiaries.

EPWP Assumptions: EPWP assumption on private sector embracing labour-intensive methods and the provision of an enabling environment are found to be valid in this project. The capacity of private and public sector to implement EPWP projects is found wanting due to serious management problems. Funding of the project is still at issue. Time will tell if participants can find job after graduation but the lack of emphasis on training can hinder this possibility.

Project Design, Effectiveness, and Quality of Assets/Services: The project concept has been formulated well but the necessary structures have not been developed to enable synergistic management and partnership between the implementer, DEAT, and NMMM. The lack of communication between the implementer and NMMM is a serious problem. This has not yet impacted the project's ability to provide quality assets and services, but it has compromised other goals such as the integration of project objectives with municipal priorities and development planning. Also, the municipality is not as informed as it should be about EPWP, and many officials do not know how they can or should assist Afri-Coast as the project implementer.

Replicability: The Motherwell Greening Project can be readily expanded in the township and would be worth doing. There are scores of other public open spaces and roadways that would benefit from greening. The project's decentralised structure lends itself more easily to expansion than if there was just one primary worksite and deliverable asset over the life of the project. Due to multiple smaller projects spread across Motherwell, visibility is greater and community buy-in is more likely. Also, the smaller nature of these projects enables easier planning, budgeting, and overall management. The downside is that this decentralisation also requires an additional measure of logistic and management capacity, which Afri-Coast has struggled to demonstrate at times.

C. Areas of Concern

- The project team has not actively consulted with the community in order to integrate community priorities into project activities.
- Lack of a comprehensive training strategy, focus of training, and short duration of training.
- The community has complained about the low wage rate.
- Most job opportunities are outside the township and formal work may require good skills which the project does not come close to addressing.
- Technical delivery is good but inefficient management of the project is a cause for concern.

D. Recommendations

- Rotate beneficiaries between work crews to enable beneficiaries gain varied work experience.
- Review the training program, designate a Training Manager, and extend duration of training.
- Formalize the working relationship between project partners through MoUs. Municipalities must state their expectation of the project clearly.
- The project is worthy of expansion but there is the need to research expansion options.
- Initiate monthly meetings for the implementer to discuss work plans and to get feedback.

(x) Thembisile Home Based Care Centre (THBCC) Project

The following is a summary of the Thembisile Home Based Care Centre (THBCC) Project

Programme/Project Summary							
EPWP Category	Program Name	Prov	Client Dept	District Muni	Current Start/ Finish	Current Budget	% Spent
Social	Thembisile Home Based Care Centre (THBCC) Project	Mpumalanga	Dept of Health	Nkangala District Municipality	May 2001 – date (Ongoing)	R 1.38m For 2004/05 to 2006/7	-

A. Programme Description

The Thembisile Home Based Care Centre (THBCC) Project was established in May 2001 to provide medical care, psychological, material and social support to: the terminally ill, particularly Aids-related illnesses; orphans and vulnerable children, their families; and youth in and out of school. The THBCC is based in Kwaggafontein within the local municipality of Thembisile in the district of Nkangala in the Mpumalanga province. It came about as an initiative of a group of concerned community members due to the large number of people living with HIV and AIDs who needed care and support in 2001. Typical of community initiated concerns the centre started with small contributions from government, donors and the private sector. Through this financial assistance the centre was able to provide care for patients discharged from KwaMhlanga Hospital, Orphans as a result of Aids related deaths, vulnerable children, Support groups and Prevention Programmes. The project is organised into three inter-related programmes, namely, Home Based Care, Childcare, and Youth Alive.

In 2004, after the launch of the EPWP, the project was reinforced with funding for purposes of upholding the principles of the Expanded Public Works Programme. The EPWP component funds the engagement of volunteers and their training to provide Home Based Care services. The funding comes in yearly tranches that are motivated by written proposals to government. Thembisile Home Based Care Centre(THBCC) falls under the social sector. The sector's focus is on the expansion of Home and Community Based Care and Early Childhood Development. THBCC is not involved with Early Childhood Development and has used its resources on Home Based Care and its resultant programmes with Orphaned and Vulnerable Children, Support Groups, Prevention Programme, and a Feeding Scheme Drop-in Centre.

B. The Main Findings

THBCC was planned and implemented by lay community members which provides the context for our findings:

Objectives: Within its very limited resources the overall objectives of the project are largely being achieved.

Performance: The performance of the project in terms of delivery of outputs is highly satisfactory attested to by both clients and the projects strategic partners. The project has experienced increasing demand, year on year, for its services which remains unmet due to lack of resources financial and infrastructural.

Jobs: A total of 109 volunteers worked on the project since 2004. Of these, 26 working on a part-time basis (4 hours a day) are in receipt of a small stipend (R500 per month) funded by EPWP via the Dept of Health for 2005/6 and 2006/7. Currently 81% of the 26 are youth (EPWP target is 30%), 92% women (EPWP target is 40%), and one person is disabled falling short of the 2% EPWP target. There is no set employment cycle, except that volunteers leave the project to take up permanent healthcare jobs elsewhere. 79 have done so to date. Although pleased that the project created the opportunity for these individuals, the Project Coordinator expressed concern at not being able to keep its trained personnel because of lack of funding. That is, 73% find employment as a result of the project (EPWP target is 10%).

Training: Training is focused mainly on equipping volunteers for the work they are required to perform in the project and has been very successful in this regard. Training provision has been conducted in the following areas: Home Base Care, palliative care, care for the carers, and counselling skills.

Labour market exit: The project is designed to produce skills to deliver its own services, however, because the project could not provide permanent jobs, 109 people have been trained since 2004 of which 79 (73%) have found jobs elsewhere (EPWP target is 10%).

Finance: EPWP contributed 12% to the total budget since 2004. The finances are being adequately managed but further controls would be required should the project expand. Nonetheless there was error in the calculation of the total income received, as reported by the client, an indication of capacity constraint. The budgets have grown from R71,874 in 2001/2 to R481, 734 in 2006/7.

EPWP Assumptions: The project pre-dates EPWP, however, some EPWP assumptions are valid; namely: capacity, training environment, labour market and exit, funding, corruption risk.

Expansion/Replication: Expansion of the project is being considered due to organic growth which would be feasible if and only if the infrastructure (staffing, funding, organization) is strengthened.

C. Areas of Concern

- Weak infrastructure (personnel, physical and organizational);
- Unable to provide sufficient management skills to office bearers of the project;
- Inadequate resources to function more effectively (eg. Transport, equipment etc);
- Insufficient financial support (salaries and other running costs) from Government (the main source of finance for such projects).
- Although pleased that the project created the opportunity for these individuals, they are not able to keep its trained personnel because of lack of funding.
- As reported by the client, there was an error in the calculation of the total income received. This is an indication of capacity constraints.
- Insufficient funding was identified as the major risk from the outset and continues to be the major project risk to date;
- Volunteerism which accounts for the success of the project so far has become a significant risk to the project's sustainability of the project as a number volunteers leave for secure paid employment elsewhere.

D. Recommendations

- The HBCC must actively strive to strengthen its organization and operating infrastructure in order to achieve optimal results.
- Based on its achievements to date HBCC should develop and implement a comprehensive marketing plan for fund raising: targeting government, grants and donations from the private sector, and income generation through outsourced work and the provision of private paid service for some clients.

(xi) Qwa Qwa Invasive Plant Removal

The following is a summary of the Qwaqwa Invasive Plant Removal Project

Programme/Project Summary							
EPWP Category	Program Name	Prov	Client Dept	District Muni	Current Start/ Finish	Current Budget	% Spent
Environment	Qwaqwa Invasive Plant Removal Project Program: WfW	Free state	DEAT	Maluthi-A-Phofung at Thabo Mafutsani DM	Dec 04 to Feb 06	R5.5m	100%

A. Programme Description

The harm and damage caused by alien plants has been widely publicized by government. Alien vegetation that not only threatens our water security due to the fact that they consume vast amounts of water on a daily basis, they are also a huge threat to the natural ecosystem and can contribute to massive environmental degradation. This is especially the case when these alien plants are located in catchment areas, where they contribute to the loss of much of the available water in the catchment areas. The Qwaqwa Invasive Plant Removal Project is a project financially supported by the Department of Environmental Affairs and Tourism and conducted in the Thabo Mofutsanyane ISRDP node in the Free State Province. The implementer was Rand Water and initial project period of 1.12.2004 -31.11.2005 was extended to 28 February 2006.

The primary objective of the project was the removal of invasive alien plants from the Northern slopes of the Elands River Catchment Area, which is a sub-catchment of the Upper Wilge Area. The project was to have linkages with other Government initiatives in this area, primarily other invasive plant removal projects, especially those in the areas of Golden Gate National Park, Ash River, Upper Wilge and Elands River. The project was positively evaluated by most task team members as well as those managing the project, particularly in terms of its contribution to creating an awareness of environmental concerns, more specifically the harm caused by invasive alien plants to the country's river systems and water supply. In addition to this, workers on the project gained skills in differentiating between indigenous and alien plants in the area as well as removing invasive plants using labor intensive methods. Besides the skills gained, participants stated huge benefits from the employment opportunities gained in addition to the reports that the experience gained would help them become more employable. The project carries approval of a wide range of stakeholders and is seen as a more than satisfactory outcome of an initiative of this nature. The total budget was R5.5 m and task rate was R40 per day typical of other EPWP projects. A Project Steering Committee assist with the hail management of the project.

B The Main Findings

Objectives: Several successes were reported in terms of outputs and deliverables. Project beneficiaries report that there has been large success in terms of the removal of alien plants along the river, that water streams have started to flow, that communities now have greater access to water, that the natural grasses and plants are starting to grow and the natural biodiversity of the area is being revived. In addition, they report a much safer environment where crime has been reduced due to the removal of the dense bush caused by the alien plants.

Job Opportunities: In terms of employment creation, the project exceeded the planned employment of 130 people as 297 people were employed. Of these 60% were women (EPWP target is 40%), 25% were youth (EPWP target is 30%), and 2% were people with disabilities (EPWP target is 2%). The only EPWP target that was slightly under target is that for youth, as the EPWP target for youth is 30%, laziness being cited as the reason for this. The project achieved a total of 53 344 for the 15 month duration of the project, which is quite significant. The finding is that the Qwaqwa invasive Plant Removal project was labor intensive, even though not an EPWP project. It assisted particularly vulnerable groups, women, youth and people with disabilities, in getting employment opportunities. However, the sustainability of this poverty reduction was very limited as participants felt that they were back where they had started prior to the project.

Training: Though it is unclear whether the training received was accredited or not, most of the beneficiaries expressed satisfaction with the training given through the project. The project participants were trained in life skills, technical skills, management and leadership skills, safety and first aid skills. The conclusion is the training conducted was relevant and useful for future job or self-employment opportunities.

EPWP Assumptions: In terms of the more direct EPWP objective of using labor intensive methods, the project indicated that these methods can be embraced by the private sector as they were successful in undertaking the project. It seems that there is more potential in self-employment for participants after their participation in the program than being employed in the formal sector. The main areas of weakness identified, were in terms of longer term employment, as by far the largest majority were back to a life of unemployment. In addition, the partnership between public and private sector to provide an enabling environment or raise awareness about labor intensive methods and the capacity of SETA to deliver the relevant NQF accredited service providers was unclear.

Project Design, Effectiveness, and Quality of Assets/Services: The assessment of this can only be based on response given by respondents as no supporting documentation was received from either Rand water, the Department of Environment and Tourism despite several attempts to receive these. Respondent noted that the removal of alien plants along the Elands River catchment area was to a certain degree successful. Conclusions are that the objectives of the project in terms of clearing the river of alien plants can assume to be achieved, though the extent of success could not be measured. However, the sustainability of this remains unclear.

D. Areas of Concern

- The main areas of weakness identified, were in terms of longer term employment, as by far the largest majority were back to a life of unemployment.
- There is a need for the management staff as well as some of the key task team members to be trained in labour-intensive methods if EPWP is to adopt this project.
- Ensuring that a good work ethic is developed and maintained remains a challenge
- The late arrival of goods and equipment as well as bad weather conditions (rain), late payment of workers were mentioned as occasional stumbling blocks.
- Concerns were raised around ownership and coordination by the municipality as well as ensuring sustainability.

D. Recommendations

- It is recommended that the project be expanded and replicated. It should be linked to other Alien clearing initiatives in the province;
- Project managers and task team members need to ensure that training is accredited
- Clearer and more direct integration of the project in municipal plans and reports is needed.
- Involve the community in the project, identification, design and planning phase of projects.
- EPWP should adopt the project owing to its job creation potential and self-employment potential.

(xii) Upper Wilge Wetlands Rehabilitation Project

The following is a summary of the Upper Wilge Wetlands Rehabilitation project

Programme/Project Summary							
EPWP Category	Program Name	Prov	Client Dept	District Muni	Current Start/ Finish	Current Budget	% Spent
Environment	Upper Wilge Wetlands Rehabilitation project	Free state	DEAT	Maluthi-A-Phofung at Thabo Mafutsani DM	1 April 2004 to 31 March 2007	R4.5m	79%

A. Programme Description

The Upper Wilge Wetlands Rehabilitation Project, is a wetlands rehabilitation project, aimed at the rehabilitation of both the Rhebokkop Wetland as well as the Sane Souci Wetland areas in the Free State Province. It was launched in April 2004 and is aimed for completion in March 2007, with funds provided by the Department of Environment and Tourism (DEAT). These wetlands fall within the Rural ISRDP node of Thabo Mafutsanyane District, specifically the Maluthi a Phofung Local Municipal area. The project is largely an environmental initiative aimed primarily at restoring the natural biodiversity of the targeted wetlands. The restoration of the wetlands is based on the installation of concrete structures, gabion structures, earth works and earth structures. The focus is on stopping erosion, lifting the water table and the revegetating the wetlands.

The primary clients of the Upper Wilge Wetland Rehabilitation project is the south African National Biodiversity Institute as the project coordinator focusing largely on ensuring that the EPWP objectives and principles are met and the Central Wetland Rehabilitation organization as the project implementer. Despite the fact that the project period was not yet concluded at the time of the study, it was evident from the work undertaken in the almost two and a half year period that the results would be in line with the planned project objectives. The project is a typical public private partnership arrangement in an impoverished community. Several departments are also involved: DWAF – removal of alien vegetation; Dept of Agriculture - provided insight into land care; Dept of Labour and social welfare – provided skills development component. The project has been implemented according to EPWP principles. The study indicates that the project has largely been successful in restoring the wetlands in the Wilge River catchment area as well as providing training and employment opportunities to community members in the area as a means to address poverty in the targeted communities.

B The Main Findings

Objectives: It was noted that the overall objectives of the project were expected to be achieved within the set timeframes considering the outputs delivered in the timeframe evaluated. *Performance:* The performance of the project in terms of delivery of outputs was satisfactory. Key lessons have been learnt where shortfalls were previously reported and the assets produced were of a good quality.

Training: The nature of training given was quite comprehensive and provided beneficial skills to not only work on the projects but also set up own micro-enterprises as contractors in the construction and transport business. Training has been provided in the areas of lifeskills, vocational, numeracy, leadership and managerial.

Labour market exit: It is reported that a large percentage of the work undertaken used labour intensive methodologies and practices, in line with EPWP recommendation. It is however unclear whether any of the beneficiaries that participated in the project have found jobs in the open labour market after the project.

Finance: The total budget for the project is R4.5m out of which R3.5 m is spent (79%). For the first two years the project spent in accordance to planned budgets, with under-spending about 15% in the second year. There has nonetheless been gross under-expenditure in the third year. This situation needs to be rectified to catch up spending for the rest of the project. It would facilitate sustainability if private sector companies partner with

government also in the allocation of financial resources to projects of this nature. SANBI provided firm financial control on the budgets and expenditure.

Jobs created: Two and a half years through the three year project implementation (83% through implementation), 47 people have been employed in the project. This translates into 13082 person-days of work. Jobs created compare favourably with targets set for the various categories of employees: labourers, managerial, skilled and supervisors. Most jobs are created in the semi-skilled categories (twice the target set). No scheduling tool was evident in this project, though clear plans and milestones were provided.

EPWP Assumptions: In this project EPWP assumptions on private sector embracing labour intensive methods, capacity of municipalities to implement programs, labour market, and training are valid. What is problematic relates to funding, exit options, and enabling environment. It is recommended that EPWP revisits its assumptions on funding, enabling environment, and exit options. EPWP projects should promote and emphasize self-employment training during participant's time of employment. The potential of participants to be self-employed is more likely than to find jobs in the formal market given their experience, nature, and duration of the training.

Expansion/Replication: Expansion of the project could be through ensuring the maintenance of wetlands as well as the provision of other related products and services.

E. Areas of Concern

- Payment of funds by DEAT usually delayed
- Workers' wages: Delays encountered
- Delays by DoL in the provision of training
- 3-months employment cycles by Public Works:
- Insecurity and anxiety among workforce
- Sustainability
- Lack of ownership by relevant local authorities
- Inter-racial and inter-cultural conflict
- Counter-productive actions by various parties

D. Recommendations

- Greater community consultations need to be undertaken in the planning phases, not only in the implementation phases
- Payments need to be consistently on time
- The local authorities need to have greater ownership as well as have a greater oversight role in such initiatives.
- More analytical reporting needs to be documented if key lessons are to be learnt
- Conflict management mechanisms could be beneficial for such multi-stakeholder initiatives.

4 EPWP Quantitative Analysis – Results Compared

In this section all the projects investigated have been compared (See Attachment F). The criteria for comparison include among other things labour distribution, work systems, employment duration, wage rates, percentage labor cost, training, cost/job, job creation potential, EPWP assumptions, and replicability. Attachment 3 shows the comparative Table. In all about 1000 people were interviewed for 13 projects through Case Studies and preparation of Completion Reports. The findings of the study have been quantitatively analysed and the results discussed below.

Labour Distribution: 7 out of the 13 projects investigated (54) % had 60% or more of the female representation in the labour force. This is a positive development in light of the fact that EPWP target is 40% of women. Where female representation were found to be very low is where the work is very strenuous such as rubble removal from Jukskei River where the percentage is 10%, the Ntsikeni Acces road project and Gansbai-Bredasdorp Road project with female representation of 6% and 10% respectively. 77% of the projects investigated achieved the youth target of 30% or more. This means the EPWP target of employing youth has largely been achieved. The area of greatest disappointment is the employment of disabled persons where only 2 out of 13 projects (15%) achieved EPWP target of 2% or more. This is a cause for concern and needs to be rectified.

Work System: Three work systems were identified from the study

- a) *Time based (Daily wages)* – 8 out of 13 projects (62%) use the daily wage system. Concerns were raised about low productivity in the projects that use this system. Some projects are considering converting to task-based system.
- b) *Task-based system:* Three of the projects use task-based system. Although they argue that this system is more productive they are confronted with the issue of accurately defining what a realistic task is. In some cases workers have used two days to accomplish a task for which they are paid R40 per task. This means effectively they work for R20/day, which is disturbing. It is apparent supervisors need to be trained in defining tasks.
- c) *A mixture of time-based & task-based system:* Two of the projects namely Gansbaai-Bredasdorp and Jukskei Environmental rehabilitation projects use daily wage system for some activities and task-based system for other activities within the same project. They reckon the task based achieved relatively better productivity.

Employment Duration: Three categories of employment duration could be identified through the study.

- a) *3 months Period:* Three out of 13 projects (23%) have employment duration of 3 months. This category of projects tend to be very labour-intensive, follow EPWP principles strictly, and are usually funded by an EPWP implementing agent such as IDT. They are usually found in areas where labour is in abundance such as urban settlements. Participants in such projects complained bitterly about the short duration of employment.
- b) *6 – 10 months:* Two of the projects had duration of 6 months and 10 months respectively.
- c) *2 years or more:* These projects are usually located in areas of scarce labour and remote locations. Example include rural roads. One characteristic of such projects is that they are usually labour-enhanced and not necessarily labour-intensive as the project implementers struggle to find labour. Training is usually emphasized and the projects have better exit strategies just by virtue of their duration. It appears the duration of the project has direct implication for the training.

Wage Rate: 62% of the projects investigated (8 out of 13) paid wage rates between R40/day to R60/days. 4 out of 13 projects (31%) had wage rate varying from R61/day to R100/day. The reasons cited for such relatively higher wage rate include the location of the project. Projects in Johannesburg such as Jukskei Environmental Rehabilitation Project tend to pay more as the cost of living is very high. For the Gansbai-bredarsdorp case that paid the highest rate of R97.16/day, management decided to pay that as the project is more of a LED project. They wanted to match the minimum wages as a means to alleviate poverty in the area.

Percentage Labour Cost: This is a good indication of extent of labour-intensity of the project. Cost data could not be obtained for 7 out of 13 cases investigated (54%), signaling a problem of financial record keeping. Only

two projects had a labour content of 70% or more. 4 out of 13 projects had labour content varying between 4.5% and 25% but still called the projects labour-intensive. *It seems labour-intensity has been misconstrued and most project implementers are not aware of what constitute a labour-intensive project.* By way of example Hlabisa hospital project merely achieved 4.5% labour content. Gansbaai-Bredasdorp project achieved 3.5 against a planned target of 6.5. The criteria for a project to qualify as a labour-intensive project needs to be clarified.

Training: 11 out of 13 projects (85%) offer technical training together with other forms of training such as lifeskills, Safety, health and Environment (SHE), and social interventions. This is a positive development. The short employment period for some projects (3 months) and the special public works conditions for training that specified 2 days of training for 22 days worked means effectively 6 days can of training can be offered for 3 months. About five of the 13 projects offer training of duration one week or less. The implication is that most participants can not find jobs after their participation in the program, an issue that has been raised in most by most of the people interviewed. 8 out of 13 projects (62%) offer accredited training in selected courses, which is very encouraging. There were isolated cases such as Gansbaai-Bredasdorp project and Hlabisa hospital project that offered training for 50% of the time i.e., six months out of one year. The intension here is to satisfy some EPWP requirements without necessarily being labour-intensive. This could be counter productive. It is recommended that the employment period for EPWP be extended to minimum of 6 months to allow some reasonable time for training to enhance post-project employment opportunities of participants.

Cost Per Job: A comparative analysis of the cost per job reveals that the cheapest cost per job created was from the social sector (R12,661/job), followed by the infrastructure sector (R18,519 to R62,331), and lastly the infrastructure sector (averagely R73,000 to R95 000 per job). Some of the environmental projects have economic components such as tourism development within them. Within the infrastructure sector untarred road projects such as the Ntsikeni road project had very low cost (R18,182/job). Tarred roads such as the Transfrontier Kgalahari Road had very high cost per job of R147,333. An exception is the ABI Jukskei River project where the cost per job is very low, R6,509 as virtually no machinery is involved. The downside though is that expansion/replicability of such a project is limited. *What the study reveals is that the potential for job creation, cheaply and labour-intensively, lies mostly within the social sector, followed by the environment sector, and lastly by the infrastructure sector.* Most infrastructure projects have limited capacity for labour-intensity. At best labour can be used to enhance some of the infrastructure projects. Decisions on labour intensity should be based on technical merit rather than political, as has been the case in some provinces.

Job creation Potential: The study revealed that 9 out of the 13 projects (69%) investigated has job creation potential subject to overcoming certain constraints such as funding, financial, and project management. Simply put, more jobs could be created with increased funding. What is at issue is sustainability in terms of asset created and the participants finding employment or self-employment after the projects. Though longitudinal survey will put the picture in better perspective, exit opportunities appear disappointing for all the projects investigate except the social project (Thembisile Home Based care Center) in which 73% of the participants that worked as volunteers in the project had managed to find job in the formal sector. There have been isolated cases where self-employment through establishing micro-enterprises have been successful for participants, as ABI Jukskei case revealed. Some project also made peculiar arrangement for job creation. The Ntsikeni Road project created jobs at the expense of leanerships. The Gansbaai-Bredasdorp road project over-emphasized training, both in construction and non-construction, as a job creating strategy.

Response to validity of EPWP assumptions: EPWP makes some crucial assumptions that were tested as part of this study (See Attachment 2). The findings from interviews with about 100 people in the 13 projects on EPWP assumptions are summarized in Table 4.1. EPWP assumptions on private and public sectors having capacity to implement EPWP projects, SETAs having capacity to deliver, adoption of labour intensive methods, and systems in place to check corruption were found to be valid. However few individuals expressed concern about lack of performance and delayed payment form SETAs. The study found exit options, funding provision for projects, and awareness about EPWP to be problematic.

Expansion/Replicability: 10 out of the 13 projects investigated (77%) are worth expanding and replicating. This is an indication of the overall success of the EPWP, despite some challenges discussed in the next Chapter. Some of the projects are worth replicating subject to correcting some inefficiencies or addressing issues such as using integrated approach as in ABI Alex Jukskei river project, good maintenance of assets, training, provision of additional resources and infrastructure. Few such as Transfrontier Kgalahari and Gansbaai Bredasdorp road

projects are not recommended for expansion, as they lend themselves more to machine intensity rather than labour-intensive projects.

Maintenance

Although most EPWP projects have indicated that the labour intensive approach stops when EPWP project implementation ends, there must, in virtually every case of environmental and infrastructure projects at least, be a sustained follow on with the labour intensive approach, throughout the project life cycle. Every EPWP project in the infrastructure and environmental sectors should have a maintenance programme built into it, if the investment made and the intended benefits are to be sustainable.

Table 4.1 Response to Validity of EPWP Assumptions

EPWP Assumption	Positive (Supported)	Negative (Not true)
Capacity: The public and private sector stakeholders have the management, technical and financial capacity to implement the programme.	60%	40%
Training Environment: Sector Education and Training Authorities (SETAs) have the capacity, systems, and competence to deliver and that adequate capacity exists in NQF accredited service providers.	60%	40%
Labour intensive methods: Labour intensive methods and approaches will be adopted by the private sector, parastatals and NGOs and that they take up opportunities to implement labour intensive approaches on an increasing scale.	75%	25%
Labour market and exit strategy: The market is able to absorb 10 % of the new job seekers and that the skills and experience gained by participation in the programme are relevant to labour demand in the economy.	25%	75%
Funding: EPWP is predicated on a multi-year budgeting system that ensures steady flow of government investment in the identified service areas and that additional <i>funding</i> is secured in for the expansion of the programme [Provincial]	0	100%
Enabling Environment: The public sector, in partnership with the Business Trust, raise awareness of the benefits of labour-intensive approaches and to create an enabling environment for adoption of such approaches	50%	50%
Corruption risk: Strong management, good systems and auditing capacity within each of the project management units to mitigate corruption risk.	67% (No)	33% (Yes)

5 EPWP Issues Analysed

In this section the word “project” will be used to cover “programmes” as well.

In this section we discuss some of the main issues that were raised by the interviewees: project managers, contractors, consultants, beneficiaries, provincial and district municipal officials. Some of the issues are cross-cutting and common to most projects.

Strategic alignment and EPWP conditionality

All projects reviewed were already in existence and at various stages of implementation. In each case one can identify the alignment to government strategy. However in some cases it is difficult to assess whether or not the actual plan for the project/s stemmed from strategic necessity. We believe most do not stem from the overall annual Strategic Planning process where priorities and resource allocation are considered across the strategic entity. In some cases (such as the Alexandra Jukskei Rehabilitation project) projects have been funded from surplus or unspent funds, which brought uncertainties in terms of funding, timely payments etc. EPWP projects need to be aligned with the organizational strategic objectives and then planned as EPWP projects from the outset.

There is considerable debate about which projects should be EPWP projects. There is the view that, provided there are unemployed people living close to the site or sites virtually all projects could be planned to be labour intensive. Another view is that the smaller projects with a lesser need for heavy plant/equipment are the ones that should be planned and implemented as EPWP projects.

It seems that the real issues are, not size of project but:

- The availability of unemployed community members living in the area who make up a labour pool for the project.
- The organizational strength of the “implementation team” and the project/s being planned from the outset as EPWP project/s.

To address the controversy surrounding the issue of which projects do qualify as Labour intensive or EPWP project, Table 5.1 has been designed by the researchers to put in perspective the attributes or characteristics of a typical labour-intensive project. Other strategic issues related to the strategic alignment of the project and EPWP conditionality, as uncovered through the project include the following:

- Guidelines being provided for the infrastructure sector and none for the other sectors. Without basic rules the project implementers do their own thing.
- Very low labour content of some projects e.g. labour content of 3% in the Gansbaai Bredasdorp road is quite worrying and makes the project very machine intensive.
- Finding labour has been difficult due to perception that the work is too hard.

Institutional capacity for EPWP

- *Organizational strength* has to be planned to ensure that all aspects of the project can be planned, set up logistically, directed and then controlled across all phases of the project. Good examples of the development of such capacity are:
 - Partnerships like the WfW project at Addo where SANParks/DWAF and DEAT work together with a MoA.
 - Community Trusts as encountered on the Ntsikeni Access Roads project/s
 - Hlabisa Hospital where the Provincial DoH's project is project managed by DTI, the contractors are a joint venture by Grinaker/LTA/SMS and training was organized by DoL.

Table 5.1 Typical Characteristic of Labour-intensive Operations That Makes Good EPWP Projects.

Index	EPWP
General Expectations	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. The project must fill a genuine need in the Municipality or Community; 2. The Project must meet the expectation of its users; 3. Select projects which have been shown to be conducive to high numbers of employment opportunities per unit of expenditure; 4. Positive identification of sufficient labour; 5. Worker located at ideal walking distance of 3-5Km and must walk to work; 6. Availability of suitable road building materials in the vicinity (for road projects); 7. Topography: no over-abundance of rock; ideally flat to undulating with minimum steep areas; 8. Set labour cost at minimum acceptable level for area (target the poor - duty of public body); 9. Create as high a number of employment opportunities per unit of expenditure as technically feasible.
Expected Outcomes	EPWP emphasizes on asset creation, jobs, training, and exit strategies including future job potentials or self employment.
Employment	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> a) Work is labour intensive: Target at least 30- 40% Labour content (Labour cost) b) Target of 3,000 person-days per kilometer of road or more is typical of labour intensive works but not mandatory. c) May be task-based where possible.
Training	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> a) Project specific; Dept of Labour; labour intensive contractor b) <i>Labourers</i>: 2 days per 22 days of work recommended i.e. Effectively 2 days per month c) NQF level not specified for workers, but structure a training program which can be cetificated where possible. Supervisors at NQF Level 4 d) The main contractor and other project implementers required to undergo training at specified NQF levels.
Wages	Minimum wage not specified in the guidelines but must reflect local realities and should be negotiated by or through the public body.
Labour Distribution	Females – 40%; Youth – 30%; Disabled: 2%
Exit Strategy	Intention to achieve this through training, further education or self employment.

- *Commitment of Officials to the EPWP concept and principles* is vital. This is often not the case and institutional coordination and integration is very weak:
- At the institutional level there is an apparent lack of commitment to EPWP in the provincial departments, municipalities and especially in the CETA.
- There is no integration of activities between the District Municipality and the department of Roads and Public works. Officials at provincial offices who advocate for LI methods, or lack of it, often do not even bother to visit projects. This situation were encountered on three separate projects: Ntsikeni Access Roads

project, Alfred Nzo District Municipality officials (never attended single meeting on held on provincial roads), and the Gansbaai-Bredasdorp Road (an official arguing that it should not be an EPWP project).

- *Inter organizational planning boundaries* have in certain cases become blurred leading to EPWP projects being loaded with other non-core projects activities. A case in point is the Gansbaai-Bredasdorp Road where the planning boundaries between Province and District Municipality were poorly defined and project had both core activities (road construction) and non-core activities such as fishing, farming, tourism etc. It is recommended that projects focus on their core mission.
 - Linked to the issue of which project/s should be classed as EPWP project/s, is the whole issue of *remuneration* where in most cases beneficiaries say the rate for the job is too low.
 - *Task Based Pay* is an issue that needs to be reviewed. For example on the Ntsikeni Access Roads the issue raised was that some tasks were more arduous than others and in certain cases the task might take two days as opposed to the planned one day. The workers would only be paid for one day.
 - *Monitoring progress against plans* (including timing), budgets and quality will always be a requirement. Where the Institutional Capacity is well established such disciplines are usually well understood and progress is good. However, informal or less formal organizations require assistance in driving the project in this way.
 - Projects implementers such as Architects, Consulting Engineers, Contractors, responsible people in Public Bodies need to be *trained on Labour Intensive work/methods*. Although some courses are being run by the CETA (and EIEC) more is urgently required to meet the demand and reduce the backlog of those waiting to attend.
 - *Communal ownership* and participation in planning have, in certain cases, been found to be questionable. However community participation in implementation has in most cases been good.
 - *Late payment* by the client couple with inadequate budget puts severe constraints small sub-contractors who are sometimes compelled to terminate operations until payment is done, as they can not pay their labour force.
 - *Lack of active involvement of local and district municipalities* in some cases hindered project delivery.

Training and Capacity Building

- Most of the projects have failed to obtain *support from the responsible SETA/CETA* and one is given to understand that there are no funds available. DoL has proved to be highly supportive of some project but not of others, in different areas. DoL has in general been unable to assist with the registration of learnerships.
- On most projects the required *training has been done albeit without accreditation or certification*. Participants are left in dark as to the worth training and whether certificates issued (which are sometimes not SETA accredited) can be acceptable elsewhere.
- The result of training on the Ntsikeni Access Roads has resulted in those trained on the building of culverts either being employed full time by the contractor or moving out of the area to seek work. In this case EPWP has been credited.
- *Imbalances in training provision and lack of availability of training providers* in some provinces were noted. For instance in the Eastern Cape both the CETA and the DoL did not play their assigned roles and so far as one knows there was nothing provided by the National Skills Fund. The CETA is criticized for causing a bottleneck which results in capacity problems.
- EPWP training for Architects, Consulting Engineers, Contractors, Supervisors, Public Body officials is available but there are two problems:
 - *Demand is too heavy for the number of courses*. There is a backlog of those wishing to attend.
 - *Entry qualifications are too high (NQF 5/6)* and this does not include social science diplomats or graduate.

Sustainability

- Most projects are set to end at what seems to be a very final end point. The question that often looms large in the evaluators' minds is that of "what happens at that point". *Exit strategies*; yes. But in the case of most infrastructural, environmental or construction project there is bound to be a requirement for maintenance. Therefore in each case a planned maintenance programme should be designed and people who worked on the project earmarked or taken on to manage and work on the programme.

Less labour intensive perhaps, but ongoing work with additional training/experience. In addition District/Local Municipalities might then use such teams to cover a wider geographic area, leading to more permanent employment. In the initial plan for projects this aspect should be considered.

- └ *Sustainability will not be realized without it being planned.* ABI Alex Jukskei River is an example where the objectives of the project in terms of cleaning the river and sorting out waste were achieved. Based on the results of the Coli count that reduced from 24 Million per 100 ml, Sept 2003 to 2.5 Million after November 2003 (a reduction of 90% within three months). However the situation has regressed. "The benefits can only be sustained through continued ongoing effort. Without attacking the root cause of pollution, efforts to clean the river will not be sustainable".
- └ *Insecurity and anxiety among workforce getting to the end of the project.* The result is reduced productivity level, as workers are not sure of where to go after their participation.

6 Lessons Learnt and recommendations

A. Lessons Learnt

6.1 Strategic Alignment and EPWP Conditionality

- In future EPWP principles need to be recognized from the beginning and made part of the planning process.
- The tender documentation in some cases was too thick and complicated for very simple work. The small emerging local contractors found it difficult to interpret and respond to it.
- Community involvement in all aspect of projects – from conceptualization, planning, implementation and closure will be crucial to secure their “buy-in” for the project success. In fact such community based initiative should be community owned and driven and facilitated by consultants and contractors.

6.2 Institutional Capacity for EPWP

- Ownership of the project by local authorities needs to be assured so that the project receives the necessary support for a sustainable operation.
- It was evident from the study that massive communication gap exists between the three tiers of government: the national, provincial and local government. Lack of integration between the various project participants was also a disincentive to the project.
- Cultural issues are always important but more so in rural areas. Although it complicated the full development of an already crowded site, and involved the
- Tendering procedures and problems with materials suppliers can slow project work considerably.
- When a project falls under multiple spheres of authority, it has the potential to create significant confusion for all parties involved.

6.3 Design and Value of Assets created

- Positive identification of sufficient labour is prerequisite to the success of Labour-intensive construction. Availability of suitable road building material is equally important.
- A thorough analysis of road and team balancing must be done to determine the level of labour intensity during the feasibility phase of a project.
- In converting a project from labour-intensive to machine-intensive work and visa-versa the implications of the change process need to be well analyzed, understood, and properly managed.
- Since potential project implementers are not paid for the design phase of a project, this result in a perverse incentive to rush this process and not adequately conceptualize and plan the project. Making funds available for project design could help rectify this.
- It is apparent that the enthusiasm and dedication of professionals for a labour-intensive approach is a reasonable, if inadequate, substitution for a clear technical understanding of the methods to be employed.

6.4 Training, Capacity Building and Community Empowerment

- The informal dwellers are not helpless and that with small support, they can be empowered to earn income on their own.

- The alleviation of poverty cannot be achieved solely by means of an external intervention but requires, in addition, internal commitment by the communities themselves to mobilise their own efforts in identifying opportunities for development including EPWP projects.
- Community ownership of projects is fundamental for frictionless implementation of project. Active involvement by the relevant government sector is as important as the community for any EPWP initiative to be successful.
- Formal training, as required in terms of the Guidelines, is an essential element of the successful conception, design and implementation of a labour-intensive contract.
- Some of the community beneficiaries trained never got their certificates. Those that have been trained should be given proper certification.
- The lack of quantitative deliverables agreed to at project initiation hindered evaluation. Clarity on lines of reporting and authority is important for project success.
- Finding accredited training providers can be a major constraint.

6.5 Sustainability

- Building the capacity and developing the skills development of the most vulnerable community members can contribute to empowerment of these communities
- In meeting environmental imperatives, some unplanned community benefits can also be derived in this case, a reduction in crime levels in the area

6.6 Job Opportunities and remuneration

- Waste management projects have inherent potential to help the poorest of the poor, which if properly harnessed can be sustainable for years.
- Unnecessary delays in payment to contractors for work completed, in turn resulting in late payment of workers, disillusionment of workers, lowered morale, and reduced productivity
- On task-based work, realistic and accurate calculation of task-based work is a key to the success of EPWP. Whatever approach is considered should cater for the interests of the workers as far as fair labour practices are concerned, as well as those of the contractor as far as their obligations are concerned.
- It is not easy for the workers to differentiate between EPWP basic conditions and the condition of permanent contracts. It therefore takes a contractor to explain this to them, otherwise, if it is left unattended, it can create a lot of confusion amongst the workers.
- Utilizing Ward Councillors' offices to recruit labour seems to be a very effective way of fairly allocating job opportunities; many other project stakeholders do not want to get involved in this potentially highly politicized process.
- One of the few criticisms is that the period of employment is too short. While the period of employment could be extended in terms of the Guidelines, this needs to be weighed up against the alternative of providing opportunities to as many people as possible.

B. Recommendations

The following recommendations are worth considering:

- Projects implementers such as Architects, Consulting Engineers, Contractors, responsible people in Public Bodies need to be trained on Labour Intensive work/methods.
- Infrastructure that has been developed with EPWP should be acknowledged and publicized to encourage those Departments who are failing to comply with EPWP
- Citations for excellence in EPWP projects should be awarded to implementation teams (Public Body, consultants, contractors, supervisors and community participants.)

- Incorporate a maintenance plan in all the contracts that are to be awarded to ensure sustainability and avoid loss of assets and benefits.
- There is the need to develop an EPWP selection matrix to determine whether a project can qualify as EPWP or not.
- Municipalities must keep an up-to-date register of EPWP projects.
- CETA and DoL shortcomings in providing support to EPWP need to be investigated and dealt with urgently.
- Communication with all stakeholders, particularly the workers/potential workers is vital. There has to be a clear understanding about the objectives behind the EPWP and EPWP projects, how they are to be employed, trained (what they will learn and future prospects) and remuneration.
- *Monitoring progress against plans* (including timing), budgets and quality should be a requirement for EPWP projects.
- Local institutions that offer technical training and EPWP training in the various regions need to be identified and captured in EPWP data base.
- There is the need to review the wage rates in most projects especially those around R40/day. Contractors and EPWP implementers should be trained on realistic and accurate calculation of task-based work.
- Extended duration of employment, six months or more could allow more time for training and will enhance exit opportunities.
- Explore potential for self-employment and train project participants on how to run own business, as participants are unlikely to find formal employment.
- Social projects must be given serious thoughts and promoted if EPWP is to assist participants to find employment after the program.
- There is the need to be more flexible and to keep the tender documentation as simple as possible for local small contractors.
- The Department of Public Works should schedule EPWP meetings for all district councils with compulsory participation and regular attendance by Infrastructure managers.
- There is the need to improve employment of disabled people as EPWP targets for the disabled appear largely unmet by most projects.

ANNEXURE “A”: OVERVIEW OF EPWP: EPWP GUIDELINES AND REQUIREMENTS

A. The Expanded Public Works Programme (EPWP)

The Expanded Public Works Programme (EPWP) is a short-to-medium term national programme across all spheres of government and state-owned enterprises (SOEs) which is aimed at alleviating and reducing unemployment. President Mbeki announced the programme in his State of the Nation Address in February 2003. The target is to provide **one million employment opportunities with training to unemployed people, within the first five years** of the programme. The EPWP will achieve this aim through the provision of work opportunities combined with training so that workers gain skills while they work and increase their capacity to earn an income. The programme utilises public sector budgets in the infrastructure, environmental, social and economic sectors.

The EPWP is guided by documented principles and compliance requirements. All Public Bodies (PBs) involved in infrastructure provision are expected to contribute to the EPWP by creating additional work opportunities through the introduction of labour-intensive construction methods. These involve the use of an appropriate mix of labour and machines, with a preference for labour where technically and economically feasible, without compromising the quality of the project.

B. The EPWP Objectives

The EPWP has set central objectives for redressing unemployment and poverty.

- Create temporary work opportunities and income for at least 1 million unemployed South Africans over the first 5 years by increasing the labour intensity of:
 - government-funded infrastructure projects
 - public environmental programmes (e.g. Working for Water)
 - public social programmes (e.g. community health workers)
- Create/provide needed infrastructure, facilities, goods and services through labour-intensive work, at acceptable standards, mainly through use of public sector funds and both public and private sector implementation capacity
- Increase the potential for at least 14% of EPWP participants to earn future income by providing work experience, training/information related to work opportunities and further education and training, and SMME development by:
 - providing unemployed people with work experience
 - providing education and skills development programmes to the workers
 - providing the work experience component of small enterprise learnership/incubation programmes

C. EPWP Guidelines and Requirements

The EPWP is guided by documented principles and compliance requirements⁴.

Conditionalities On Project Finance (MIG or PIG)

The National Treasury's *Division of Revenue Act* has placed additional conditional ties on the Provincial Infrastructure Grant (PIG) and the Municipal Infrastructure Grant (MIG) that require provinces and municipalities to use the Guidelines.

⁴ Division of Revenue Act (DORA); Ministerial Determination: Special Public Works Programmes; Code Of Good Practice For Employment And Conditions Of Work; Guidelines For The Implementation Of Labour-Intensive Infrastructure Projects Under The EPWP.

Guidelines for Implementation

'Guidelines For The Implementation Of Labour Intensive Infrastructure Projects Under The EPWP' were agreed between SALGA, National Treasury and the Department of Public Works for the identification, design and construction of projects financed through the MIG or PIG. These provide provinces and municipalities with the tools to put out tenders as labour-intensive projects and minimize the additional work required from provincial and municipal officials.

NQF-Accredited Training Programmes

The Guidelines include an eligibility requirement for the appointment of contractors and consulting engineers. Key staff involved in EPWP projects must undergo special NQF-accredited training programmes in labour-intensive construction. The DPW has given the Construction Education and Training Authority (CETA) the responsibility to develop and implement the training.

Contractor Learnership Programme

The DPW has established a labour-intensive Contractor Learnership Programme to qualify small contractors to execute work in accordance with the Guidelines. The CETA is responsible for paying for the classroom training of the contractors. Partnering provinces and municipalities may allocate EPWP projects to the learner contractors on a negotiated price basis so they can gain practical experience.

Consultants and Contractors

The Guidelines provide *Standard Forms Of Contract* to be used for implementing labour based works that must be used by both consultants and contractors. The DOL's *Ministerial Determination* and *Code Of Good Practice* prescribe the requirements for the employment and training of unskilled and semi-skilled workers in labour-intensive works.

C. EPWP Monitoring and Evaluation Framework

"An EPWP Unit has been established within the Department of Public Works (DPW) to coordinate, monitor and evaluate the implementation of the EPWP and to provide support to provinces and municipalities who are the primary implementers of EPWP projects on the ground. Evaluation studies will be commissioned as per the EPWP M&E Framework".⁵

Monitoring and evaluation is regarded as integral to the successful implementation of the programme. A monitoring and evaluation framework (M&E) framework has been designed for the EPWP.⁶ The framework combines ongoing reporting and monitoring (using existing departmental channels) with a number of new evaluation tools to measure the impact of the programme. DPW has developed a Logical Framework for the M&E of the EPWP Programme.⁷

The EPWP Unit maintains a database of EPWP projects, receives quarterly Monitoring reports on all EPWP projects and publishes an annual EPWP report. All the provinces and municipalities have to report on the EPWP according to selected performance indicators.

Measure	EPWP Performance Indicators	Logframe level
Economic	No. people exiting to employment, education/training, SMME	Impact

⁵ Stanley W. Henderson, EPWP Unit, Chief Director: M&E Specialist, 8 June 2006

⁶ Department of Public Works, January 2005: Framework for Monitoring and Evaluation.

⁷ Department of Public Works, 20 May 2004: Draft Expanded Public Works Programme (EPWP) Consolidated Programme Overview and Logical Framework

Employment	No. of work opportunities by gender, age, disability	Outcome
	No. person days of work	Outcome
Income	Rands average income of EPWP participants	Outcome
Training	No. of people trained	Output
	No. accredited person training days	Output
	No. skills programmes and learnerships registered and mentors appointed	Output
Cost	Rands value of goods/services provided to standard	Input
	Rands cost of each work opportunity created	Input
	Rands cost of training day	Input

Evaluation Methods

Conducting Case Studies and Completion Reports (CRs) are two of the methods appropriate for the evaluation of the EPWP.

Comparison of Approaches

The two Approaches are related components of Monitoring and Evaluation (M&E), but there are important differences. Ideally, Completion Reporting, which is a function of Monitoring and marks the end of the Project Implementation stage of the project cycle, would precede Case Studies which are one method of Evaluation, the need for which would be identified by the Completion Reports. The most significant difference is that Completion Reports are self assessments that are usually conducted by the Project Implementation Team comprised of the Project Consultants and Contractor and also ideally, the Project Client and the intended Project Beneficiaries. Completion Reports are usually focused more on the Inputs and Outputs of the project.

Case Studies are usually independent evaluations conducted after the project is in operation and some results (Outcomes) and processes are in evidence. Case studies involve: a holistic view of complex relationships, observation, progressive focusing, searching for patterns and developing assertions. They address the “how” or “why” of evaluation questions. Case studies are appropriate for knowing: a) what a best or worst case looks like and what makes it different; or b) what a typical case looks like; or c) to illustrate a pattern of cases.

Comparison of ICR and Case Study

Features	ICR	Case Study
Type of M&E	Monitoring	Evaluation
Stage of the Project/Programme	End of Implementation	At operational stage
Carried out by	Self assessment	Independent
What is	Implementation Efficiency and early Effectiveness	Effectiveness
Purpose	Early lesson learning	Beneficiary assessment and Later lesson learning

The Evaluation Team

The evaluation team comprised:

- 4 experienced EPWP evaluators including two engineers and two social specialists
- 1 environmental specialist
- area specialists for Eastern Cape and KwaZulu Natal

The teams operated in pairs including one EPWP evaluator and a specialist for environment and/or beneficiary and stakeholder assessment.

ATTACHMENT B - ASSUMPTIONS AND RISKS OF EPWP

There are a number of key assumptions underlying delivery in the EPWP. These have been identified by the EPWP as follows.⁸⁹

Capacity

It is assumed that public and private sector stakeholders have the technical, financial and management capacity to implement the EPWP projects within the required time frames. This includes the capacity of all stakeholders at all levels of government to implement the programme in respect of planning, people, systems, budgeting provision, the delivery of goods and services tied to EPWP and /or the planning required to develop such capacity. It is assumed that key partners such as SETAs, NGOs and CBOs will be able to absorb the increased workloads.

Enabling Environment

It is assumed that labour intensive methods and approaches will be adopted by the private sector and Non Profit Organisations (NPOs) and those they will take up opportunities to implement labour intensive approaches on a sufficient scale. An enabling environment for labour intensive contracts needs to be in place, especially with regard to tendering requirements.

Training Environment

It is assumed that sufficient skills training capacity is made available and that the relevant SETAs have the capacity and competence to deliver and that adequate capacity exists in NQF accredited service providers and that learnerships can be registered and that 85% of learnerships can be completed.

Labour Market and Exit

Assumes that: participants will be able to sustain their growth after exiting the programme; that the market can absorb 10% of new job seekers; that experience gained will assist the job seekers; the private sector takes up the option of labour intensive delivery; there will be more information on employment for job seekers; that further training opportunities will be made available and be funded by external entities; and that government will encourage procurement from SMMEs.

The identified assumptions and risks need to be monitored and tested by evaluation, such as in the present case studies.

⁸ Investigation into the Optimisation of Mentorship Services and EPWP Learnership Programme Management Support Based on Different Financing Scenarios. February 2006

⁹

ATTACHMENT C - TERMS OF REFERENCE

Terms of Reference (ToR) for case studies and completion reports to be conducted on the implementation of the Expanded Public Works Programme (EPWP)

Purpose and Background

The purpose of this submission is to provide clear guidelines for case studies and completion reports to be conducted across the infrastructure, environment and culture and social sectors to investigate the nature and extent of the relationship between the EPWP and specific outcomes.

The Expanded Public Works Programme (EPWP) is one of government's short to medium-term strategies to address the challenge of unemployment in South Africa. The programme was agreed to at the Growth and Development Summit (GDS) held in June 2003 and the President launched the programme in May 2004. The EPWP aims to draw significant numbers of unemployed people into productive work opportunities, accompanied by training, so that they increase their capacity to earn an income.

Monitoring and evaluation of the EPWP is regarded as integral to the successful implementation of the programme. A monitoring and evaluation (M&E) framework has been designed for the EPWP. The framework combines ongoing reporting and monitoring (using existing departmental channels) with a number of new evaluation tools to measure the impact of the programme. Conducting case studies and completion reports are two of the methods appropriate for the evaluation of the EPWP.

Scope of Work

Case studies permit an *in-depth analysis or description of how programmes or projects operate and how they are affected by the social, economic and political environment in which they operate*. They normally concentrate on a small number of cases (e.g. individuals and communities). These cases are examined in-depth, normally through qualitative, rather than quantitative methods. Cases can examine one moment in time or one event, or they can be used to examine processes that evolve over long periods of time. In the case of the EPWP, one needs multi-site studies to be conducted to allow for cross-site comparisons.

Case studies will serve to verify and validate the findings of the surveys and other techniques, while at the same time yielding information that cannot be accessed through the other methods. A good example is the problems with programme design and implementation that pose an obstacle to achieving its stated objectives.

The case studies will be selected on the basis of their representivity in terms of sectors and geographical location. Ten case studies will be conducted *annually* over a four year period.

The following categories of case studies are proposed:

- 3 for the Infrastructure Sector: 1 provincial roads project, 1 municipal roads project and 1 water reticulation project;
- 3 for the Environment and Culture Sector: 1 administered by DEAT, 1 administered by DWAF and 1 administered by NDA.

- 2 for the Social Sector: 1 HCBC site and 1 ECD site.
- 2 for the Economic Sector (to be informed by the sector plan)

Project Completion Reports review and assess all aspects of project implementation and compares intended and actual performance with regard to physical implementation, costs and timing. The completion reports will be reviewed and lessons learnt fed into planning for other evaluation studies.

Prospective service providers will submit clear milestones and timeframes as part of the proposal. The survey results and report should be submitted to DPW by end February 2006.

The successful service provider will make presentations on progress to the EPWP Evaluation Committee once every month after commencement of the survey as per agreed dates.

The survey will commence as soon as possible after approval of tender and signing of tender documentation.

The following deliverables are required:

- Bound reports (hard copies) containing the results of the surveys
- Electronic copies in MSWord format of said reports
- Electronic copies of all data sets generated during study

Copyright

Copyright with regard to the surveys will be vested in the DPW. All materials (hard copies and electronic) produced during the surveys become the sole property of the DPW and is subject to confidentiality clauses as per government regulations. Application should be made to DPW for the use of material for any future presentation or publication. After approval of such application, due acknowledgement will be given by user as to the source of data and information.

ATTACHMENT D - DOCUMENTS REVIEWED

Completion Reports

DPW, EPWP	The Abi Alex Jukskei River Project, Gauteng Province, July 2006
DPW, EPWP	The Addo National Elephant Park (SANParks) Working for Water Project, Eastern Cape Province, August 2006
DPW, EPWP	The Hlabisa Hospital Construction Project, Kwazulu-Natal Province, September 2006
DPW, EPWP	The Jukskei Environmental Rehabilitation Project – Alexandra, Gauteng Province, August 2006
DPW, EPWP	The Kgalagadi Transfrontier Road , Northern Cape Province, September 2006
DPW, EPWP	The Makwane Road Project, Free State Province, July 2006
DPW, EPWP	The Metropolitan Gateways and Beautification Project, Eastern Cape Province,
DPW, EPWP	The Motherwell Greening Project, Eastern Cape Province, July 2006
DPW, EPWP	The Ntsikeni Access Road and Ntsikeni Nature Reserve Access Road, Eastern Cape Province, July 2006
DPW, EPWP	The Qwa Qwa Invasive Plant Removal Project, Free State Province, August 2006

Case Studies

DPW, EPWP	The Abi Alex Jukskei River Project, Gauteng Province, July 2006
DPW, EPWP	The Addo National Elephant Park (SANParks) Working for Water Project, Eastern Cape Province, August 2006
DPW, EPWP	The Gansbaai-Bredasdorp Road Upgrading Project, Western Cape Province, September 2006
DPW, EPWP	The Hlabisa Hospital Construction Project, Kwazulu-Natal Province, September 2006
DPW, EPWP	The Jukskei Environmental Rehabilitation Project – Alexandra, Gauteng Province, August 2006
DPW, EPWP	The Kgalagadi Transfrontier Road , Northern Cape Province, September 2006
DPW, EPWP	The Makwane Road Project, Free State Province, July 2006
DPW, EPWP	The Metropolitan Gateways and Beautification Project, Eastern Cape Province,
DPW, EPWP	The Motherwell Greening Project, Eastern Cape Province, July 2006
DPW, EPWP	The Ntsikeni Access Road and Ntsikeni Nature Reserve Access Road, Eastern Cape Province, July 2006
DPW, EPWP	The Qwa Qwa Invasive Plant Removal Project, Free State Province, August 2006

EPWP documents

National Treasury	Division of Revenue Act (DORA) 2004 http://www/treasury.gov.za
Department of Labour	Basic Conditions of Employment Act, 1997. Ministerial Determination: Special Public Works Programmes. Government Gazette, No 23045, No. R63. 25 January 2002
	Basic Conditions of Employment Act, 1997. Code of Good Practice for employment and conditions of work for Special Public Works Programmes. No 23045, No. R 64, 25 January 2002
Department of Public Works (DPW)	Framework for Monitoring and Evaluation, January 2005
	Draft Expanded Public Works Programme (EPWP) Consolidated Programme Overview and Logical Framework, 20 May 2004
	Guidelines for the Implementation of Labour-Intensive Infrastructure Projects under the Expanded Public Works Programme (EPWP). Prepared with the assistance of DfID and the European Union

	Expanded Public Works Programme – Creating opportunities towards human fulfillment. Powerpoint presentation
	Investigation into the Optimisation of Mentorship Services and EPWP Learnership Programme Management Support Based on Different Financing Scenarios. February 2006
EIEC	Review of M&E System Reports for the Expanded Public Works Programme (EPWP), July 2004
	The Importance of Expanded Project or Programme Implementation Completion Reports for the Monitoring and Evaluation of the EPWP. 24 August 2004
Business trust	EPWP ISRDP Projects, Business Trust via dplg
EPWP	Multi-year projects between Q4 (2004-05) and Q1 (2005-06)
	Concluded projects Q2 (2005-06)
	Concluded projects Q4 (2004-05)
	Expanded Public Works Programme (EPWP) – 4 th Quarterly Report for the period 1 Jan-31 March - Financial year 2004/05 - (continuing cumulative data for the period: 1 April 2004 to 31 March 2005)
DEAT	DEAT-Projects for the EPWP Impact Study
Johannesburg Metro	Letter re. Request for ECD Sites in Jo'burg Municipality
Frimpong M, Delius P, McCutcheon R, Taylor Parkins F	Assessment of Existing Programmes Under the Expanded Public Works Program. November 2004

ATTACHMENT E - METHODOLOGY: QUESTIONNAIRE

DRAFT QUESTIONNAIRE FOR THE CASE STUDY

KEY INFORMANT INTERVIEWS

[Directed at Consultants, Contractors or Project manager, Project implementers, provincial Project Managers, Key Municipal Informants e.g. Program Manager, LED Manager]

Part 1: GENERAL

NAME(S) OF INTERVIEWEE(S)	
JOB TITLE	
DATE OF INTERVIEW	
INTERVIEWER	
PROJECT	

A. CAPACITY BUILDING / TRAINING

1	Were you provided with any guidelines for implementing EPWP project? If so which one, and do you use it? [GIVE THE TITLE]
2	Did consultants appointed on the project have any prior training (or the requisite qualification in terms of the EPWP Guidelines) in labour-intensive methods? If not, was there a system put in place to train the consultants?
3	Was there any specific training/capacity building in labour-intensive methods and project management for the local authority representatives who run the project?
4	What type of training did the project participants (beneficiaries) receive? Do you think it can really help them gain employment elsewhere?

B. COMPLIANCE AND REPORTING

5	Have you, in your opinion, complied with the compliance criteria as set out in the Guidelines a/or required in terms of the applicable Laws?
6	Did you ever attend any road show on EPWP and if so did any of your project implementing team members attend such a road show?
7	Given the choice, would you willingly use labour-intensive methods or recommend this to other people? [GIVE REASONS]
8	What type of report do you produce for EPWP and how often do you report to them? Do monitoring EPWP indicators as part of your normal departmental reporting pose any challenge to you?
9	Did the project manager and/or contractors keep records on the project implementation relating to productivity, labour rates and costs? [Can we please have copies?]

C. PROJECT FORMULATION & PARTICIPATION

10	Describe the participation of provincial, municipal, and other stakeholders in the project
----	--

	planning process?
11	How are the communities involved in the project? [QUANTITATIVE]
12	How many women, youth, disabled are in this project? [QUANTITATIVE]
13	Who is involved in the coordination and integration of this project and why?
14	Describe how the project was founded? [DESCRIPTIVE]
15	Are there incentives in place to promote private sector investment in labour intensive delivery method? [PROVINCIAL/MUNICIPAL LEVEL] Y/N

PART 2: ADDITIONAL SECTOR SPECIFIC QUESTIONS

[This part should be informed by Sector specific issues identified through EPWP documentation and the desktop study]

A. INFRASTRUCTURE SECTOR PROJECTS

1	What was the exact product (asset) or service that came out of the project?
2	Are there any criteria/benchmarks against which to verify the quality of the product and/or service that you know of? If not how do you ascertain that the project meets its performance expectations?
3	Do you use EPWP guidelines document entitled "Guidelines for the implementation of labour-intensive Infrastructure projects under EPWP" or any other guidelines for implementing your project?
4	If so, are you aware of the responsibilities of the public bodies regarding the selection of projects? What's your comment on the guidelines?
5.	Is EPWP a good strategy of addressing infrastructural backlogs and to ensure sustainable economic growth of the node?
6.	EPWP proposes to assist municipalities with the execution of the project by assisting municipalities with managing contractors and consultants to ensure that the labour intensive works are executed properly. Is this happening in this project?
7.	

B. ENVIRONMENTAL SECTOR PROJECTS

1	What environmental benefit did the project set out to deliver?
	Was the contract seeking to remedy the cause of an environmental problem or address the symptoms? Please elaborate?
2	Were the environmental goals made clear to the contractors?
3	Were the environmental goals achieved? To what extent were goals achieved?
4	Is there a tangible human benefit arising from the environmental impact, beyond the employment created? (cleaner water, less litter, less soil degradation etc)
5	Were contractors given specific environmental goals or were these implicit in the contract?
6	Were emerging contractors and contractors trained in the course of the contract? If so what was the nature of this training and how was it assessed?
7	In 2004 EPWP planned establishing audit team in the various program whose mandate would be to develop benchmarks for each programme, train national and provincial staff in the lead departments and to develop a culture of assessment and audit programs annually. Was your project ever audited by EPWP? If it was audited did the audit include measures of environmental impact?
8	In your opinion will the environmental impact be short-term, medium term, long term?
9	EPWP contemplated providing assistance to develop appropriate unit standards to

	supplement SETAs existing unit standards, provide information packs, and induction training for service providers in the environmental sector. Were these provided in your project?
10	Did the project draw on inputs from any other department or institution either in setting procedures, in implementing the contract or in gauging the impact?
11	Were there unforeseen positive/ negative environmental impacts arising from the project? (Look for evidence of change in the natural environment: soil erosion, new vegetation growth etc)
12	What are the lessons that were or can be drawn from the project? Have these lessons been applied subsequently?

C. SOCIAL SECTOR PROJECTS

1	What was the exact product or service that came out of the project?
2	In the social sector do non-profit organizations participate in training and the bulk of the delivery indicated in the EPWP program plan?
3	EPWP promises to assist Municipalities develop and design projects based on the national norms and standards and develop the appropriate systems to manage such projects in the social sector. Was this project designed according to such norms and standards? If not how do you ascertain that the project meets its performance expectations i.e. quality standards?
4	In 2004 just over 7 000 of the estimated 23 000 Early Childhood Development sites were registered. The Department launched information campaign and a capacity building component and a series of provincial workshops for all ECD service providers to meet registration requirements and be registered by 2006. Are you aware of such campaign and are you registered?
5	EPWP contemplated providing assistance to develop appropriate unit standards to supplement SETAs existing unit standards, provide information packs, and induction training for service providers in the social sector. Were these provided in your project?
6	In 2004 EPWP planned establishing audit team in the various program whose mandate would be to develop benchmarks for each programme, train national and provincial staff in the lead departments and developing a culture of assessment and audit programs annually. Were your project ever audited by EPWP?
7	

D. ECONOMIC PROJECTS

1	What was the exact product or service that came out of the project?
2	Were venture capital learnerships to establish SMMEs completed as planned by EPWP? [PROVINCIAL /MUNICIPAL LEVEL]
3	Do you have standards or benchmark against which to monitor your project? If not how do you ascertain that the project meets its performance expectations?
4	
5	

DRAFT QUESTIONNAIRE FOR THE CASE STUDY

BENEFICIARIES SURVEY

[Directed at project beneficiaries and the community]

Part 1: GENERAL

NAME(S) OF INTERVIEWEE(S)	
DATE OF INTERVIEW	
INTERVIEWER	
PROJECT	

	QUESTION	TYPE OF QUESTION	MEASURE/INDICATOR
1	What do you consider to be the major successes of the project and why?	Outcome	Lessons Learnt
2	What challenges did you encounter in executing the project and how did you go about addressing them?	Outcome	Lessons Learnt
3	Would you willingly recommend this project to a friend to participate? [GIVE REASONS]	Behavioral Change	Replication / Expansion
4	EPWP contemplates providing opportunities for participants such as longer-term employment, self-employment, or further education or training. What happens to participants after leaving the program?	Impact	Sustainability
5	Are there project beneficiaries that have secured job after the program that you know of?	Impact	Empowerment
6	What difference has the income from this EPWP project made in your life?	Livelihoods Impact	Empowerment
7	Describe how you communicate within the project?	Institutional	Management Effectiveness
8	What problems do you encounter in the project?	Descriptive	Efficiency & Effectiveness
9	What form of training did you receive in the project and do you think it can help you secure job elsewhere?	Impact	Community Empowerment
11	What have been your sources of income before and after joining this program?	Descriptive Before/after	Empowerment
12	How has the project benefited you and the	Descriptive &	Empowerment

	community at large? Is EPWP a good employment creation and training strategy?	Normative	
13	Was the community consulted when the project was identified and implemented? [COMMENT]	Institutional	Community Cohesion
14	How do you select participants to work on EPWP projects?	Descriptive	Community Cohesion
15	Has the project helped to cement relationships in the community? [GIVE EVIDENCE]	Outcome	Community Cohesion
16	What is your perception about the duration of employment cycle.	Normative	Program Effectiveness
17			
18			
19			
20			

Who to Interview in Beneficiary Survey

Though not explicitly stated for the Case studies and completion report, the cross sectional survey, which is part of the broader EPWP M & E framework prescribe 15 beneficiaries to be interviewed per project. The profile of interviewees is as follows:

- 9 beneficiaries;
- 2 community members in which the project is located or from which the beneficiaries are derived;
- 1 site staff who has completed CETA-accredited unit standards training;
- 1 contractor;
- 1 consultant; and
- 1 provincial or local government official.

I suggest that we interview 15 – 20 beneficiaries [Just interview those who will co-operate]

DRAFT QUESTIONNAIRE FOR THE CASE STUDY

FOCUS GROUPS / STAKEHOLDERS

[Directed at project stakeholders, provincial Program Managers, Task team members, and Municipal official]

GENERAL

NAME(S) OF INTERVIEWEE(S)	
JOB TITLE	
DATE OF INTERVIEW	
INTERVIEWER	
PROJECT	

A. INSTITUTIONAL CAPACITY

	ITEM	RATING			
		BELOW AVERAGE	AVERAGE	GOOD	V. GOOD
1	The project received the necessary support/backing from the local government.				
2	Payment to beneficiaries done on schedule				
3	Local participation in the design and implementation of the project				
4.	Project managed within time, cost, and required performance.				
5.	Quality control on the ground i.e. quality of asset/service.				

B. ASSUMPTION MADE BY EPWP

[EPWP make the following assumptions. Give your comments in the form of rating about the realities on the ground in relation to these assumptions. Are they correct?]

	ITEM	RATING			
		BELOW AVERAGE	AVERAGE	GOOD	V. GOOD
6	Capacity: The public and private sector stakeholders have the management, technical and financial capacity to implement the programme.				
7	Training Environment: Sector Education and Training Authorities (SETAs) have the capacity, systems, and competence to deliver and that adequate capacity exists in NQF accredited service providers.				
8	Labour intensive methods: Labour intensive methods and approaches will be adopted by the private sector and NPOs and that they take up opportunities to implement the labour intensive approaches on a sufficient scale.				
8	Labour market and exit: The market is able to absorb 10 % of the new job seekers and that the				

	skills and experience gained by participation in the programme are relevant to labour demand in the economy.				
9	Funding: EPWP is predicated on a multi-year budgeting system that ensures steady flow of government investment in the identified service areas and that additional <i>funding</i> is secured in for the expansion of the programme [Provincial]				
10	Enabling Environment: The public sector, in partnership with the Business Trust, raise awareness of the benefits of labour-intensive approaches and to create an enabling environment for adoption of such approaches				
11	Corruption risk: Strong management, good systems and auditing capacity within each of the project management units to mitigate corruption risk.				

C. EPWP SPECIFIC QUESTIONS & OUTCOMES

	ITEM	RATING			
		BELOW AVERAGE	AVERAGE	GOOD	V. GOOD
12	The project was successful in terms of delivery.				
13	The project is efficient enough to alleviate poverty.				
14	Project addresses local needs and priorities?				
15	Project provides work experience, training and information related to local work opportunities and SMME to enable participants secure work or be self-employed after participation.				
16	Such EPWP Projects an efficient means to address communal social and economic infrastructural back log i.e. create assets and services				
17	Criteria used to select project participants.				

6.6.1 RATING SCALE

Below 40%	-	Below Average
41% - 60%	-	Average
61% - 80%	-	Good
81% and above-		Very Good

ATTACHMENT F: A COMPARATIVE TABLE OF THE PROJECTS EVALUATED

Basis	Index	ABI Jukskei River Project	Gansbaai Bredasdopr Road	Jukskei Environmental Rehabilitation Project	Tranbsfro ntier Kgalagadi Access Road Project	Working for Water program min SANParks Addo National Park	Hlabisa Hospital	Ntsikeni Access Road and Nature Reserve Access Road	The Metropolit an Gateways and Beautifica tion Project	Motherwel l Greening Project	Thembi sile Home Based Care Center Project	Qwaqwa Invasive alien Plant Removal project	Upper Wilge Wetlands Rehabililit ation Project	Makwane Access Road
Genera l Project Inform ation	Project Descriptio n	Jukskei River Clean-up and Maintena nce and Developm ent of Communi ty based Integrated Waste Managem ent Model	Anchor road projects to hang LED projects for the upliftme nt of the area	Project to rehabilitate and reinstate environme nt of the Jukskei river flood plain including relocation of affected flood victims	To construct a 60 Km access road from Andriesval e to Twee Rivieren	The WfW Programm e is specifically aimed at clearing invading alien plants and the control of their spread.	Revitalisati on & Constructi on to District Hospital Standard	Two linked rural road projects in Alfred Nzo ISRDP Node, designed to promote economic developme nt through eco-tourism and improved community local access.	Developme nt, design, and beautificati on the gateways/e ntrances to Nelson Mandela Metro Municipality (NMMM).	LED project involving litter removal campaign, beautificati on and planting of trees, leveling of grasses and beautificati on of cemetery.	Provides medical care, psycholo gical, material and social support to: the terminall y ill, particula rly Aids-related illnesses ; orphans and vulnerab le children, their families; and youth in and out of school.	Removal of invasive alien plants from the Northern slopes of the Elands River Catchment , which is a sub-catchment of the Upper Wilge Area.	Rehabilitati on of both the Rhebokko p Wetland as well as the Sane Souci Wetland areas in the Free through restoration of the wetlands is based on the installation of concrete structures, gabion structures, earth works and earth structures.	

Basis	Index	ABI Jukskei River Project	Gansbaai Bredasdorp Road	Jukskei Environmental Rehabilitation Project	Transfrontier Kgalagadi Access Road Project	Working for Water program in SANParks Addo National Park	Hlabisa Hospital	Ntsikeni Access Road and Nature Reserve Access Road	The Metropolitan Gateways and Beautification Project	Motherwell Greening Project	Thembisile Home Based Care Center Project	Qwaqwa Invasive alien Plant Removal project	Upper Wilge Wetlands Rehabilitation Project	Makwane Access Road
	Location	Alexandra, Johannesburg	Overberg District Municipality, W. Cape	Alexandra, Gauteng	Siyanda District Municipality, Upington	Sunday river, Nelson Mandela municipality, EC	Mkhanyakude node & Hlabisa Municipalities, KZN	Ntsikeni, Alfred Nzo District Municipality, EC.	Nelson Mandela Metro Municipality, EC	Nelson Mandela Metro Municipality, EC	Kwaggafontein, Thembisile Local Municipality at Ngangala DM, Mpumalanga	Qwaqwa, Maluthi-A-Phofung at Thabo Mafutsani DM	Harrismith, FS194 Maluthi-a-phofung, Thabo Mafutsanyana DM.	Maluthi-a-Phofung, Thabo Mafutsani DM, Free State
	Implementing/Project Mgr	Soul Foundation (NGO)	W Cape Provincial Roads Dept	Alexandra Renewal Program (ARP)	Siyanda District Municipality, N Cape	SANPARKS	IDT	NAR: MBSA consultants, East London. NRR: Makhaotse	Afri-coast Engineering	Afri-coast Engineering	Lay community members; Has Management committee.	Rand water	SA National Biodiversity Institute & Central Wetlands Rehab organization	Free state Dept of Public works, Road & Transport

Basis	Index	ABI Jukskei River Project	Gansbaai Bredasdopr Road	Jukskei Environmental Rehabilitation Project	Transfrontier Kgalagadi Access Road Project	Working for Water program min SANParks Addo National Park	Hlabisa Hospital	Ntsikeni Access Road and Nature Reserve Access Road	The Metropolitan Gateways and Beautification Project	Motherwell Greening Project	Thembiile Home Based Care Center Project	Qwaqwa Invasive alien Plant Removal project	Upper Wilge Wetlands Rehabilitation Project	Makwane Access Road
	Client	Independent Development Trust (IDT)	W Cape Provincial Roads Dept	Johannesburg City	N Cape Provincial Road Dept	DWAF	KZN DoH & DPW	EC Dept of Roads & Public Works, Alfred Nzo DM & Kokstad	DEAT	DEAT	Kwaggafontein community	Free State DEAT	Maluthi-a-Phofunf Local Muni.	Free state Dept of Public works, Road & Transport
	Project period/Start & End Date	October 2003 to May 2005	Ph 1: Jan 06 to Dec 07 Ph 2: Jan 08 to Dec '08	2001-2006	Oct 2004 to Dec 2008	WfW program started in 1995. Multi-year program. This report FY April 05 to March 06.	10 Nov 04 to Dec 06	Ntsikeni Access Road (NAR): Dec 05-Aug 07; Nature Reserve Road (NRR): June 04-Nov 05.	1 Dec 2004 to 31 March 2007.	1 Dec 2004 to 31 March 2007.	Started May 2001 to date; EPWP involvement from 2004	Dec 04 to Feb 06	1 April 2004 to 31 March 2007	1 March 2006 to 31 Nov 2006

Basis	Index	ABI Jukskei River Project	Gansbaai Bredasd opr Road	Jukskei Environme ntal Rehabilitati on Project	Tranbsfron tier Kgalagadi Access Road Project	Working for Water program min SANParks Addo National Park	Hlabisa Hospital	Ntsikeni Access Road and Nature Reserve Access Road	The Metropolita n Gateways and Beautificati on Project	Motherwell Greening Project	Thembis ile Home Based Care Center Project	Qwaqwa Invasive alien Plant Removal project	Upper Wilge Wetlands Rehabilita tion Project	Makwane Access Road
	Duration of Project	2 Years	4 Years	6 Years	5 years	Ongoing	2 years but Plan is 3 yrs	NAR: 21 mth NRR: 18 mth	28 months	28 months	Ongoing since 2001	15 months	36 month	8.9 months
	% Completi on	Complete d	30%	100%	18%	42%	66%	NAR: - 65% NRR: 100%	65%	65	-	100%	83%	80%
Emplo yment record s	No Employed	462	153	Cleaning: 20 Trimming: 40 Sewers: 40	278	66	1089	As at 30/06/06 NAR: 236 NNR: 182	369	As at 30/06/06 169	109 volunte ers with 29 Part- time staff	297 (plan – 130)	47	As at August 2006: 200 employees
	Person- days	17 850	19 278	Cleaning: 2772 Trimming: 5280 Sewers: 32560	12 793	16632	197 982 pd	NAR: - 31 152 pd NRR: 10 097 Pd	55 910 Pd	45 147 Pd	-	53 344Pd	13 082 Pd	Achieved: 220,000 Pd; Entire Project: 275 000 Pd

Basis	Index	ABI Jukskei River Project	Gansba ai Bredasd opr Road	Jukskei Environme ntal Rehabilitati on Project	Tranbsfron tier Kgalagadi Access Road Project	Working for Water program min SANParks Addo National Park	Hlabisa Hospital	Ntsikeni Access Road and Nature Reserve Access Road	The Metropolita n Gateways and Beautificati on Project	Motherwell Greening Project	Thembis ile Home Based Care Center Project	Qwaqwa Invasive alient Plant Removal project	Upper Wilge Wetlands Rehabilita tion Project	Makwane Access Road
	Labour dist													
	% <i>Women</i>	75%	8%	10%	60%		21%	NAR: 6%	61%	64%	92% (of the 26 part- time)	60%	40%	36% (money paid)
	% <i>Youth</i>	70%	54%	30%	40%		44%	NAR: 51%	34%	21%	81%	25%	19.3%	58%
	% <i>Disabled</i>	0%	1%	0%	2%		0.4%	NAR: 1%	1%	1%	1 person	2%	1.3%	1%
	Work system	Time based (Daily wages)	70% Task- based; 30% Time based	Non- EPWP: Time based EPWP (Sewers): Task based	Time based (Wage system)	Task- based	Time based	NAR: Daily wages NRR: Task based	Daily wages (Time based)	Daily wages (Time based)	Wages for part- time	Daily wages	Task based	Task based

Basis	Index	ABI Jukskei River Project	Gansbaai Bredasdopr Road	Jukskei Environmental Rehabilitation Project	Tranbsfrontier Kgalagadi Access Road Project	Working for Water program min SANParks Addo National Park	Hlabisa Hospital	Ntsikeni Access Road and Nature Reserve Access Road	The Metropolit an Gateways and Beautifica tion Project	Motherwel l Greening Project	Thembi sile Home Based Care Center Project	Qwaqwa Invasive alient Plant Removal project	Upper Wilge Wetlands Rehabililit ation Project	Makwane Access Road
	Employment duration	3 months	6 months	3 months	2 years	2 years	6 months		Life of project (28 months)	Life of project (28 months)	No employment cycle		10 month cycle	Workers-3 months; Learnerships – 6 months
Finance / Wages	Wage rate	R65/day	R 10.27/Hr Trainees : R82.16/day Labourers: R97.16/day	Cleaning: R65/day Trimming: R70/day	R40/days	R43.16 – R46.48 per days (depends on task)	R46.50	NAR: R80/day (bricklayers) & R60/day (watchman) NRR: R45/task/day	Stared at R40/day but increased to R45/day.	Stared at R40/day but increased to R45/day.		R40/day	Labourers: R39/day; Transporters R60/day	R40/task

Basis	Index	ABI Jukskei River Project	Gansba ai Bredasd opr Road	Jukskei Environme ntal Rehabilitati on Project	Tranbsfron tier Kgalagadi Access Road Project	Working for Water program min SANParks Addo National Park	Hlabisa Hospital	Ntsikeni Access Road and Nature Reserve Access Road	The Metropolita n Gateways and Beautificati on Project	Motherwell Greening Project	Thembis ile Home Based Care Center Project	Qwaqwa Invasive alien Plant Removal project	Upper Wilde Wetlands Rehabilita tion Project	Makwane Access Road
	Budget	R 3.3 Million	Ph 1: R90 m Ph 2: 195 m	Non- EPWP: R600 000 EPWP (Sewers): R3.2 m	R44.2 m	R1.7 for FY 2005/06	Estimated: R95.4m; Approved: R85m Spent: R69m	NAR: R 4.8m NRR: R2.8m	R23 m	R9 m	R1.38 for 2004/5 to 2006/7	R5.5m	R4.5 m	R 50m Spent: R10m
	% spent	100%	23%	100%		42%	91%	NAR: 73% NRR: 100%	37% spent			100%	79%	20%
	% Labour cost	70%	Budget – 9% Actual – 6.5%	Non- EPWP: 90% EPWP (Sewers): 44%			4.5%	NRR: 27%						25% (Such project could yield 30-40%)

Basis	Index	ABI Jukskei River Project	Gansbaai Bredasdopr Road	Jukskei Environmental Rehabilitation Project	Tranbsfroitier Kgalagadi Access Road Project	Working for Water program min SANParks Addo National Park	Hlabisa Hospital	Ntsikeni Access Road and Nature Reserve Access Road	The Metropolitan an Gateways and Beautification Project	Motherwel I Greening Project	Thembi sile Home Based Care Center Project	Qwaqwa Invasive alient Plant Removal project	Upper Wilge Wetlands Rehabililitation Project	Makwane Access Road
	Funders	a) EPWP b) ABI	Prov. Roads Dept; DoL	Johannesburg City	DEAT: R38m Prov. Rds Dept: R6.2m		DoH & EPWP	NAR: DPW (PIG) NRR: Dept of Eco. Dev. (MIG)	DEAT (from Poverty Relief Fund)	DEAT (from Poverty Relief Fund)	DoH, SABS	DEAT	DEAT	Free state DPWR&T
Training	Types	a) Technical – Waste sorting b) Life skills c) Safety	Learners hips for both construction & non-construction	Non-EPWP: No training EPWP (Sewers): construction training	Technical & life skills. Consultant @ NQF level 7. Supervisors @ 2 & 3	* General orientation; * Technical & SHE; * Social interventions	* Institutional * Technical & SHE;	NAR: Technical training NRR: Learnerships established	Life skills, vocational and business management	* Arm robbery response * Quality customer care * Pavings	Home Base Care Paliative Care for the Carers Counselling skills	Participants: Life skills, technical & management; Instructors: Communication, leadership & management	Life skills, numeracy, vocational, leadership & mgt	Technical; Life skills; First Aid

Basis	Index	ABI Jukskei River Project	Gansbaai Bredasdopr Road	Jukskei Environmental Rehabilitation Project	Tranbsfrontier Kgalagadi Access Road Project	Working for Water program min SANParks Addo National Park	Hlabisa Hospital	Ntsikeni Access Road and Nature Reserve Access Road	The Metropolitan Gateways and Beautification Project	Motherwell Greening Project	Thembisile Home Based Care Center Project	Qwaqwa Invasive alien Plant Removal project	Upper Wilge Wetlands Rehabilitation Project	Makwane Access Road
	Accreditation	2 accredited modules	4 modules		Not SETA accredited	Accredited modules offered.	Yes, but in some cases training certificates not issued.	No CETA accreditation	Some courses accredited and others not	50% accredited as per DEAT target.	-	Not accredited	721 days accredited; 164 days non-accredited	Because its contractor learnerships, training offered by accredited providers.
	Duration	1 week	6 mths/year	8 weeks for 37 weeks project	Pipe laying-10 days Strom Drainane-10days Culvert-15 days	2 days training for 22 days worked, as per EPWP guideline.	6 months		10% of a persons days of labour planned but only achieved 2%	Adhoc nature: 1 – 4 days				Not complying with EPWP 2 days per month

Basis	Index	ABI Jukskei River Project	Gansba ai Bredasd opr Road	Jukskei Environme ntal Rehabilitati on Project	Tranbsfron tier Kgalagadi Access Road Project	Working for Water program min SANParks Addo National Park	Hlabisa Hospital	Ntsikeni Access Road and Nature Reserve Access Road	The Metropolita n Gateways and Beautificati on Project	Motherwell Greening Project	Thembis ile Home Based Care Center Project	Qwaqwa Invasive alien Plant Removal project	Upper Wilge Wetlands Rehabilita tion Project	Makwane Access Road
	Number trained	400	Construc tion -105				62 people. Attended 45 courses	20 people trained in technical skill	As at July 06 1075 days of accredited and 225 days non accredited.		109		47 beneficiari es	Ist aid: 38; Brick paving & Stone pitching: 40 Learnershi p: 15 modules for 200
	Person- days	1200	3 325	1600		489			13000 Pd	2756 Pd				2176 days for 200
Compa rative assess ment	Unit cost of operation													
	Cost/job													
	% Labour cost		6.5%					27%	Budget 33% but spent 54%					25%

Basis	Index	ABI Jukskei River Project	Gansba ai Bredasd opr Road	Jukskei Environme ntal Rehabilitati on Project	Tranbsfronti er Kgalagadi Access Road Project	Working for Water program min SANParks Addo National Park	Hlabisa Hospital	Ntsikeni Access Road and Nature Reserve Access Road	The Metropolitan Gateways and Beautificati on Project	Motherwell Greening Project	Thembis ile Home Based Care Center Project	Qwaqwa Invasive alien Plant Removal project	Upper Wilge Wetlands Rehabilita tion Project	Makwane Access Road
	Labour efficiency													
	Technical performa nce	a) 1 600000 Kg of waste removed for 2 yrs. b) 300 000Kg of recyclable s collected & sold c) E-coli count reduced by 89% within 9 months	2602 Pd/Km	Rubbles: Cleaned 90m ³ (Plan 80m ³). Trimming: 350m ³ (Plan 500m ³)	10.5 km out of 60 Km done	3.52 personday s/ha	2602 Pd/Km	NAR: 9.6 km access gravel road constructed ; NRR: 12.4 m of gravel road constructed .			80300 Home care visits (Target – 90 000 visits)			11.7 km of 13 Km constructe d (90% complete)

Basis	Index	ABI Jukskei River Project	Gansbaai Bredasdopr Road	Jukskei Environmental Rehabilitation Project	Tranbsfrontier Kgalagadi Access Road Project	Working for Water program in SANParks Addo National Park	Hlabisa Hospital	Ntsikeni Access Road and Nature Reserve Access Road	The Metropolitan Gateways and Beautification Project	Motherwell Greening Project	Thembiile Home Based Care Center Project	Qwaqwa Invasive alien Plant Removal project	Upper Wilge Wetlands Rehabilitation Project	Makwane Access Road
Concluding remarks	Job creation potential	Yes; Recycling 10% of Alex waste could generate R10 Million/yr	Construction – Very limited Non-Conct-Good Potential	Limited room for expansion in the short term. Long-term maintenance of assets created.	Limited due to remote location of project and the fact that labour has to be transported to work.	Good job creation potential. Local contractors developed and empowered to in turn employ local people.	Good job creation potential. Local contractors developed and empowered to in turn employ local people.	. Both projects have job creation potential but using labour to enhance work	Project highly labour intensive (spends 53% on wages); Active women participation (61%).	Very good especially for women (62%).	Mainly volunteers with few Part-time. But 73% of volunteers find paid work.	Potential to employ several households but post-employment options problematic	Job creation potential exists in the project.	Project has good potential for job creation but apparently not designed to be particularly labour-intensive.

	Areas of concern	<p>a. Situation regressed to old level (River dirty again)</p> <p>b. Inadequate recycling collected</p> <p>c. No guidelines for EPWP env. Training</p> <p>d. Communal ownership questionable</p>	<p>a. Should roads project involve non-construction activities?</p> <p>b. It is unclear why the contractor should be involved in non-construction learnships.</p> <p>c. Labour content of 3% is quite worrying and makes the project very machine intensive.</p>	<p>a) Community involvement in planning not good but implementing okay.</p> <p>b) Late payment by the client.</p> <p>c) Lack of EPWP training for project implementers.</p> <p>d) Illegal dumping into the Jukskei river.</p> <p>e) Short employment periods (3 months)</p>	<p>a) The lack of conveniently located workers.</p> <p>b) The lack of road building material amenable to labour intensive techniques.</p> <p>c) The lack of water along the route.</p> <p>d) The lack of suitable support structures and, in particular, trainers of learner Contractors.</p> <p>e) The inadequate budget.</p>	<p>a) Unnecessary delays in payment to contractors for work completed, in turn resulting in late payment of workers.</p> <p>b) Unacceptably high labour turnover</p> <p>c) Overburdened reporting requirements.</p> <p>d) No certificates were issued for the training and the quality of training, perhaps substandard.</p> <p>e) realistic and accurate calculation of task-based work an issue.</p>	<p>a) lack of integrated development planning.</p> <p>b) 20% of those employed were women and no women in managerial position;</p> <p>c) escalating electrical and water costs.</p> <p>d) Certificates of service at the end of the contract not issued</p> <p>e) need to revise the wage rate and the task-based pay</p>	<p>a) The Problem of scoping task based work and tendering.</p> <p>b) No consistency in the duration of task.</p> <p>c) R45 per task/day for the Nature Reserve Road Project needs to be reviewed.</p> <p>d) There was no involvement of the district municipality</p> <p>e) Finding labour has been difficult due to perception that the work is too hard</p> <p>f) The CETA and the Department of Labour did not play their assigned roles;</p>	<p>a) Communication difficulties between Afri-Coast and NMMM.</p> <p>b) Lack of capacity in Afri-Coast and NMMM.</p> <p>c) The project is not being managed as efficiently as it should</p> <p>d) Absenteeism amongst the work force.</p> <p>e) Meaningfully integrating the community into the project.</p>	<p>a) Community not consulted and their priorities not integrated into project.</p> <p>b) Lack of a comprehensive training strategy, focus of training, and short duration of training.</p> <p>c) The low wage rate has been voiced out by the community.</p> <p>d) Most job opportunities are outside the township</p> <p>e) Management of the project is a cause for concern.</p>	<p>a) Weak infrastructure (personnel, physical and organizational);</p> <p>b) Unable to provide sufficient management skills to office bearers of the project;</p> <p>c) Inadequate resources to function more effectively (eg. Transport, equipment etc);</p> <p>d) Insufficient funding a major risk from the outset</p>	<p>Exit opportunities limited; Training management staff in labour-intensive methods if EPWP is to adopt this project.</p> <p>Ensuring that a good work ethic is developed and maintained</p> <p>Occasional late arrival of goods and equipment & bad weather conditions, late payment of workers;</p> <p>Ownership and coordination by the municipality problematic</p>	<p>Payment of funds by DEAT usually delayed</p> <p>Workers' wages: Delays encountered</p> <p>Delays by DoL in the provision of training</p> <p>Insecurity and anxiety among workforce</p> <p>Sustainability Lack of ownership by relevant local authorities</p> <p>Interracial and inter-cultural conflict</p>	<p>a) Training required as a pre-requisite for involvement in the EPWP appears to have been lacking for workers.</p> <p>b) Inconsistencies and in some cases contradictions in the contract signaling lack of training of professional staff that prepared the document</p> <p>c) The 25% paid to labour indicates that the design was not particularly labour friendly.</p> <p>d) Poorest perception in respect of Labour Intensive Methods or received.</p>
--	------------------	--	--	---	--	--	---	---	--	---	--	--	--	---

	EPWP assumptions	Assumptions on public sector capacity, private sector embracing LI, and corruption risk valid.	Project 4 months through implementation. Too early to assess.	Public private sector capacity to manage projects, private sector adopting LI methods valid. SETA training, labour market exit strategy, and providing enabling environment problematic.	Capacity of public and private sector to implement LI methods and SETA to deliver lacking. Private sector slowly embracing LI. Funding and corruption risk an issue.	Few participants appear to have found jobs, after the program.		Projects achieved EPWP targets for employment, training, and income generation. Buy-in from province, municipality & CETA problematic. EPWP well embraced by community.	EPWP assumptions on labour intensity and enabling environment supported by this project. Assumption on public & private sector capacity to manage project and exit options problematic.	Private sector embracing LI methods and provision of enabling environment valid. Capacity to implement project, funding, & exit problem.	EPWP assumptions are valid; namely: capacity, training environment, labour market and exit, funding, corruption risk.. Funding problematic.	Not EPWP project but people beginning to embrace EPWP principles; Short Employment duration and lack of exit options a concern.	Private sector embracing LI methods, capacity to implement programs, training are valid. Exit options, funding, provision of enabling environment problematic.	EPWP assumption on exit options, systems to check corruption, and training positive. Areas of concern relate to embracing LI methods and capacity to implement projects.
	Comments	Objectives of project achieved	-											Project selection needs to focus project types that maximise employment opportunities.

Basis	Index	ABI Jukskei River Project	Gansbaai Bredasdopr Road	Jukskei Environmental Rehabilitation Project	Transfrontier Kgalagadi Access Road Project	Working for Water program min SANParks Addo National Park	Hlabisa Hospital	Ntsikeni Access Road and Nature Reserve Access Road	The Metropolitan Gateways and Beautification Project	Motherwell Greening Project	Thembiile Home Based Care Center Project	Qwaqwa Invasive alien Plant Removal project	Upper Wilge Wetlands Rehabilitation Project	Makwane Access Road
	Recommendations				52 wks anticipated delay due to change over to LI methods.		Bulk water and electricity provision should become a priority issue	Promote Planned maintenance plan and set aside budget for it; Revisit the task-based pay approach to tally with the effective labor rate.	Strongly support expansion of project but with refined management strategies.	Develop comprehensive training strategy. Formalize the working relationship between project partners	Must strengthen infrastructure and develop comprehensive fund raising strategy.	EPWP should adopt the project; Link project to other initiative;	* Prompt payment needed; * Promote community participation in project planning.	
	Replicability	Replicate but use integrated and env. Round table approach.	Too early to assess. Project performance. Should monitor and document lessons.		Replication not recommended. Project ideally suited to machine intensive methods.	Recommended	Replication strongly recommended.	Replicability should be subject to having good maintenance plan and training.	Need for poverty alleviation, beautification needs for 2010 all favor replication.	Replicability recommended but review training	Replicability recommended subject to provision of funding and infrastructure	Expand project and replicate lessons learnt	Yes; Free state has several wetlands that needs rehabilitation.	EPWP credited through this project. Replication recommended but as more labour-intensive